



# Department of Planning and Development

## Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

November 26, 2024

### 1431 Washington – Addition and renovations

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| <b>REQUEST</b>           | Certificate of Appropriateness for              |
| <b>APPLICANT</b>         | John and Kimberly Stoll                         |
| <b>FILE NO.</b>          | PHDC2024-0011                                   |
| <b>PARCEL NO.</b>        | 70-15-01-201-020                                |
| <b>ZONING</b>            | R-E – Single family residential                 |
| <b>HISTORIC DISTRICT</b> | Stoney Creek                                    |
| <b>STAFF</b>             | Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting |

#### *In this Report:*

|                        |   |
|------------------------|---|
| Request                | 1 |
| Historical Information | 2 |
| Review Considerations  | 2 |
| Summary                | 3 |
| Potential Motion       | 3 |

#### **Request**

This is an application for a three-phased renovation and addition. The property contains a house constructed c. 1870 and a carriage house/garage constructed at an unknown date. According to the 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* the property was determined as non-contributing to the Stoney Creek Historic District due to the number of alterations to the house.

The subject property is located on the west side of Washington Road just south of Mill Race Road. The property is in the northern section of the Stoney Creek Historic District., all of the surrounding properties are considered non-contributing. The property has many trees and bushes and is surrounded by newer houses. The Commission approved the construction of an in-ground pool at the property in 2020. The applicant is currently proposing the following:

- Phase 1: replace windows in part of the house, replace doors on the north elevation, replace siding on the east and west elevations.
- Phase 2: construct an addition to the second floor and replace the roof, replace more siding and replace more windows.
- Phase 3: Replace south side addition with a new addition and renovate the terrace at the rear of the house.

Historical Information

The subject property is located in the Stoney Creek Historic District. The 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* describes the district as containing the unincorporated village of Stony Creek and Van Hoosen Farm. The northern boundary generally follows Stony Creek and extends northward along Washington Road including Cornerstone, Mallon Court and Mill Race Roads. The district is almost wholly residential in character, with houses dating from the 1830s to the 1990s. The Stony Creek settlement was established in 1823 and developed in the 1830s. The district has thirty-seven contributing resources, seventy-one non-contributing resources, and one that requires more research to determine its status. Some of the most significant properties in the district include the Van Hoosen Farm; the Greek revival house at 1046 East Tienken Road; the Stoney Creek School; and the Sign of the Black and White Cow.

This parcel on Washington Road sits well north of the portion of the district containing the village, school, and Van Hoosen Farm. Although this house was built during the period of significance (c. 1870) the alterations to the original house have rendered it non-contributing to the district. This northern part of the district is surrounded by subdivisions and newer houses. The non-contributing houses in this portion of the district are generally one- to two-stories tall, have gable roofs, attached garages and are clad in brick with asphalt shingle roofs. The houses are generally on large lots and are extensively landscaped.

## Review Considerations

---

The proposed project consists of re-cladding the house's exterior, replacing windows and doors, replacing the roof, and constructing two new canopies over two doors, and two separate additions. The work will be done in three phases, phases 2 and 3 may be completed at the same time.

Phase 1: Replace the existing vinyl clapboard siding on portions of all four sides of the house with James Hardie Lap Siding with a 5" exposure and cedar mill texture. James Hardie Trim Boards will be used at the windows, doors, and corner boards where there is lap siding. Replace existing windows (materials unknown) with new Pella Impervia Fiberglass windows on the west portion of the south elevation, on the west elevation, and the west portion of the north elevation. The proposed windows will be casement and have faux muntins. On the north elevation it is proposed to replace two existing doors within the existing openings with new Dutch doors. The material of the new doors was not specified. It is proposed to construct an arched canopy over the eastern door. A new shed roof is proposed over the west door. A future chimney is shown on the west elevation.

Phase 2: The kitchen is proposed to be renovated which will include installing a pair of French doors on the first floor of the north elevation. The kitchen windows are proposed to be replaced with the Pella Impervia Fiberglass windows. An addition to the second floor will expand northward creating a new gable on the north elevation above the kitchen. The center section of the house, including the new second floor addition is proposed to be re-clad in James Hardie Shingle Straight Edge siding. The entire roof, including the addition is proposed to be replaced with GAF Timberline HDZ dimensional asphalt shingles in the color "weathered wood."

Phase 3: It is proposed to demolish an existing 1-story addition with a rectangular footprint that extends from the south side of the house and replace it with a larger 1-story addition with a T-shaped footprint. The terrace next to the existing and proposed addition will be redone for the new configuration. The new addition is proposed to have a flat roof and clad in James Hardie Artisan Panel, V-groove vertical siding with a 7" exposure. The addition will have casement windows without muntins and transoms above. Sets of folding glass doors are proposed to lead out to the terrace.

The applicant has indicated that the following materials will be used for the project:

1. Phase 1: James Hardie Lap Siding and Trim; Pella Impervia Fiberglass Windows, dutch doors (unknown materials).
2. Phase 2: James Hardie Shingle Straight Edge siding; Pella Impervia Fiberglass windows; French doors (unknown materials); GAF Timberline HDZ dimensional asphalt shingles, “weathered wood.”
3. Phase 3: James Hardie Artisan Panel, V-groove vertical siding with a 7” exposure; door materials unknown, terrace materials unknown.

## Summary

---

1. The property is in the north end of the Stoney Creek Historic District. The property has a non-contributing house constructed c. 1870 and a carriage house/garage constructed at an unknown date. This part of the district has newer houses and was recommended for removal in the 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey*.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows, siding, doors, and roofing. Two new door canopies are proposed. A second story addition is proposed. An existing 1-story addition is proposed to be replaced by a larger 1-story addition. The work will take place over 3 phases.
3. Staff offers the following comments on the proposed project. The property is non-contributing which allows the Commission to review the project in relationship to the district as a whole instead of the effect to just this house. The project includes replacing non-historic siding, windows, doors, and roofing. The proposed second story addition, removing a 1-story addition and replacing it with a new, larger 1-story addition as proposed is compatible with the district and will not destroy any historic materials or features. The proposal meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
4. It is unknown if the applicant has submitted the proposed plans to the City’s Building Department for a formal review. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

## Potential Motions

---

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

**MOTION**, in the matter of File No. PHDC2024-0011, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the 3-phase project that will replace siding, windows, doors, and roofing; construct a second floor addition; demolish an existing addition; and construct a new 1-story addition as proposed at 1431 Washington Road in the Stoney Creek Historic District, Parcel Identification Number 70-15-01-201-020, with the following Findings and Conditions:

- 1) The property at 1431 Washington **is/is not** a contributing property to the Stoney Creek Historic District;
- 2) The proposed work, including the additions **are/are not** compatible in massing, size, scale and materials with this part of the district;

- 3) The proposed 3-phase renovation and addition project **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard numbers 9 and 10 as follows:

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*