



Department of Planning and Development

Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

August 4, 2025

1841 Crooks Road – Barn Modifications	
REQUEST	Certificate of Appropriateness for barn roof, siding, and windows
APPLICANT	Grace Properties – Lijo Antony
FILE NO.	PHDC #2025-005
PARCEL NO.	15-20-428-003
ZONING	R-1 – One family residential
HISTORIC DISTRICT	1841 Crooks Road
STAFF	Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

In this Report:

Request	1
Historical Information	1
Review Considerations	2
Summary	3
Potential Motion	3

Request

This is an application requesting to replace 6 aluminum windows with vinyl windows in the historic barn on the property. The applicant has replaced the asphalt shingle roof with a new 3-dimensional asphalt shingle roof and repaired and repainted the wood siding. These 2 items normally would be approvable at the staff level; however, they are included in this application, and the work is complete. Note that the applicant provided photos appear to show a patio being constructed at the north end of the barn that is not part of this application.

Historical Information

1841 Crooks Road, which is an individual historic district, was designated by the City of Rochester Hills in 1978. The property was originally part of the 230-acre A.C. Parker farm which also contained other buildings to the south near the stream. The 1908 Oakland County Atlas shows the barn on 52 acres of property owned by E. Berry. The 1938 Rural Property Inventory shows the property belonging to E. J. Beattie, of Grosse Pointe Park. Per the inventory the property was being used for agricultural purposes. Twenty-four acres of the property were “class A agricultural crop land.” From the 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts* survey, “Relatively few farm buildings other than farmhouses survive to represent the agricultural

landscape that once constituted nearly the whole of Avon Township. Therefore, most farm buildings that retain the greater part of their historic appearance are considered significant. Most common are barns: a total of twenty-five buildings historically used as barns are extant in the survey area. This is likely the total or very close to the total for Rochester Hills.”

In 2017 the Commission issued a Notice to Proceed for demolition of the house on the property, and in 2020 the Commission approved the construction of the new building on the property.

Review Considerations

The applicant is requesting approval to replace 6 aluminum frame windows with 6 vinyl slider windows. The request does not include 3 double-hung windows in the 3 rear dormers. Per the owner of the property the existing windows are “non-repairable aluminum windows with broken or no glass.” The windows proposed for replacement are:

North elevation – 1 window in the gambrel end – the existing window appears to be a wood or aluminum single sash window with no division. Unknown if operable or a casement. **A close-up photo of the existing window is needed.**

Rear (east) elevation – 1 or 2 windows (owner lists 1 window in photo label, but is likely 2 windows if 6 windows in total are being replaced) at main floor, existing are boarded over – the configurations and operations are unknown, one opening appears to be tall, the other wide. **Photos from the interior are needed showing the existing windows.**

South elevation (3 windows) – 1 window in gambrel end – the existing window appears to be a wood or aluminum single sash window with no division. Unknown if operable or a casement. 2 windows at the main floor, one opening is boarded over – the configuration and operation are unknown. The other opening appears to be two windows stacked on top of each other with both windows having two panes. The operation is unknown. **Close-up photos of all 3 windows is needed to show the existing windows.**

The owner provided a close-up photo of only 1 window, which shows an aluminum slider window. This window does not show up in the overall photos so it may be an opening that is currently boarded over.

The owner proposes to install Window World 4000 Series Double-Hung or Double-Sliding vinyl replacement windows that are “similar looking vinyl windows.” It is unclear whether every opening will receive the double-sliding window or whether the openings in the gambrel ends will have a single pane fixed window. It is also unclear exactly what will be placed in the opening with the stacked windows.

Note that in the applicant provided photos it appears that a patio is being constructed at the north end of the barn. This was not included in the application.

Summary

1. The property is an individually designated historic district and contains a historic barn and a new building approved by the Commission in 2020.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a new roof; repair and paint the wood siding; and replace 6 aluminum windows that are missing glass and have deteriorated frames with vinyl windows with a “similar appearance.”
3. Materials proposed for the project include 3-dimensional asphalt shingles, product information not provided; and vinyl windows.
4. Staff Comments: The siding repair and roof replacement as completed meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and would have ordinarily been approved at the staff level. The window replacement may meet The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard number 6 **provided the owner brings to the meeting** the following: 1) Close up photos of all 6 windows proposed for replacement; and 2) the window order form so that it can be determined the exact size and configuration of all 6 replacement windows.
5. It is unknown if the applicant has submitted the proposed plans to the City’s Building Department for a formal review. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

Potential Motion

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

MOTION, in the matter of File No. PHDC 2025-005, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 6 aluminum windows, repair and painting of siding, and replacement of the asphalt shingle roof on the historic barn at 1841 Crooks Road, Parcel Identification Number 15-20-428-003, with the following Findings and Conditions:

- 1) The existing aluminum windows are not original to the building and are not character defining features, the siding has been repaired to match the existing, and the asphalt shingle roof replaces an existing asphalt shingle roof. The work as proposed **is/is not** appropriate for the historic barn on the property; and
- 2) The proposed window replacement is/is not in keeping the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation provided the following conditions are met to the Commission’s satisfaction:
 1. The owner provides close-up photos of all 6 windows proposed for replacement, from the interior if the windows are currently boarded over; and
 2. The owner provides the window order form showing the sizes and configurations of the proposed replacement windows

- 3) The proposed siding repair, and roof replacement **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard number 6 as follows:
 6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*