



Rochester Hills
Minutes
Historic Districts Commission

1000 Rochester Hills Dr.
Rochester Hills, MI
48309
(248) 656-4600
Home Page:
www.rochesterhills.org

Chairperson Brian R. Dunphy

*Members: Steven Branstner, Dr. Jay Eastman, Nicole Franey, Micheal Kilpatrick,
Dr. Richard Stamps, Jason Thompson, Nicholas Winters, Murray Woolf*

Thursday, February 10, 2011

7:00 PM

1000 Rochester Hills Drive

CALL TO ORDER

In the absence of the Chairperson, and there being no current Vice-Chairperson, the meeting was opened by Secretary Thompson at 7:04 p.m. Chairperson Dunphy arrived at 7:05 p.m. and took over chairing the meeting.

ROLL CALL

Present 7 - Richard Stamps, Micheal Kilpatrick, Brian Dunphy, Jason Thompson, Steven Branstner, Dr. Jay Eastman and Nicholas Winters

Absent 2 - Nicole Franey and Murray Woolf

Also Present: Derek Delacourt, Deputy Director
Sandi DiSipio, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

2011-0052 November 11, 2010 Regular Meeting Minutes

A motion was made by Stamps, seconded by Kilpatrick, that this matter be Approved as Presented. The motion carried by the following vote.

Aye 7 - Stamps, Kilpatrick, Dunphy, Thompson, Branstner, Eastman and Winters

Absent 2 - Franey and Woolf

COMMUNICATIONS

No announcements or communications were brought forward.

PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public came forward to speak on non-agenda items.

NEW BUSINESS

2011-0054 Yates Cider Mill Siding Project - Discussion

Mr. Delacourt explained that Mr. Titus is the owner of the Yates Cider Mill and he approached the City several weeks ago with the potential to discuss a siding project for the Mill. The siding is in a state of disrepair. The owner presented viable options for repair and replacement regarding the siding. It was staff's suggestion that the applicant come forward the first time as a discussion item to gain input and feedback from the HDC as to their feelings regarding the condition of the siding, ideas as to how to move forward with repair or replacement of that siding and whether his ideas are appropriate.

Mr. Mike Titus came forward and expressed his thanks for the opportunity to appear before the Board. A couple years ago he was granted approval for a roof project - a photograph was displayed for review. The next area of deterioration on the Mill is the siding. Mr. Titus explained he has done a lot of research as to what the options are, and showed photographs of the condition of the siding. There is a point where you can repair, and there's a point where the fibers and the structure of the wood itself have deteriorated to a point where no work can be done to it. Much of the west facing wall is in really rough shape. The siding has been patched and repaired over the last 50 years. Mr. Titus explained the structure of the Mill behind the siding is starting to deteriorate because water is permeating, especially along the porch roofline and the face of the Mill. Part of the problem is that there is a bulge on the west side, so the eave is no longer overhanging the siding. Therefore when it rains, it runs down the Mill face. All the doors and windows catch and hold water. There are a lot of cracks in the siding where the water is soaking in, resulting in many leaks. The Mill was insulated with sawdust, which is now rotting because of the moisture. One of the main beams across the porch area is starting to decay. Mr. Titus stated he really needs to do something. The first option would be to re-side with wood siding, but it is not available as thick as the existing siding anymore. He feels because the siding is thinner, the durability would not be as good as the original siding. He has looked at other man-made materials and the fiber cement material caught his eye. It has a really good simulated wood-grain finish with a dutchlap profile.

Mr. Branstner asked if anything has been done to stabilize the bulging. Mr. Titus replied steel rods were inserted in the 1940's. There is a c-channel with tie-rods running all the way under the porch connecting to cement pads in the ground at the back of the Mill. The porch is also a bolster for the wall.

Chairperson Dunphy indicated that photographs of the actual damage to the siding would be helpful to frame the discussion because the Secretary of Interior Standards are pretty clear that the priority is to repair if at all possible and then replace. A visual reference if necessary in order to make an informed decision.

Mr. Titus explained several close-up photographs of the siding damage. He explained the nail lines and studs along the siding. All across the front of the Mill, it is rotting around each nail hole. There are portions of siding that are just falling away because there is nothing holding it. Along the lower edge, some of the siding just fell off and has been replaced with cement board just to get by. There was literally nothing left to repair.

Mr. Kilpatrick asked the applicant if he's used some siding from the back of the

building to patch on the west side. Mr. Titus explained there was a one-foot by one-foot patch completed on the west side that looks a little newer even though it's in bad shape. Mr. Kilpatrick commented the applicant said he has investigated wood siding, but feels it's not as durable. Mr. Titus said he called a couple different wood siding mills that would actually make the siding if asked. The current siding is about an inch thick, and the new siding would be only about 1/2 inch thick. And where they mill the dutchlap concave feature in the siding, it's only about 1/4 inch thick. Mr. Kilpatrick asked if the width of the fiber cement siding is the same as the wood siding. Mr. Titus indicated yes and circulated a sample of the siding for review. Mr. Kilpatrick commented that the existing wood siding has a unique texture to it giving it an historical context, and asked the applicant if there's any possibility of getting the same wood siding. Mr. Titus explained that the original siding was smooth and the proposed cement siding has a wood grain finish. He further commented that he has a huge interest in preserving and keeping the Mill as it looks, but he has to maintain it.

Dr. Stamps thanked the applicant for coming forward for discussion, and asked if the nails are round or square. Mr. Titus believes the nails underneath the overlap are probably square, but the nails on the outside are round. This is probably the original siding, having been in place for over 100 years. Dr. Stamps is happy the applicant is trying to preserve the structure, noting that the guidelines say to repair if it can be done, and to replace if you must. Dr. Stamps feels that it almost looks like the applicant needs to replace. It would be nice if the owner could save a small sample of the original siding someplace on the structure for safekeeping. Dr. Stamps commented he likes the texture of proposed siding with its knots.

Mr. Winters asked how the cost and durability differ between the 1/2 inch wood siding and the fiber cement siding. Mr. Titus explained the wood siding is about three times the cost of the cement siding and that he would have to do more structurally to fasten this siding because it's so thin; a backer would have to be installed underneath the siding to strengthen it. Mr. Winters commented there is a fifty-year warranty on the cement siding. Mr. Titus indicated he can purchase the siding with the navaho red color baked on - the same color as the Mill. If it's not an identical color match, Mr. Titus will purchase the siding with only primer on it and paint it himself.

Mr. Branstner asked if the applicant is only replacing the one side of the structure or the entire structure. Mr. Titus has not made this decision - the west side is in the worst condition, the south side is almost as bad and the north side looks pretty good. Eventually all the siding will need to be replaced.

Mr. Kilpatrick asked if the lettering and windows will be replaced. Mr. Titus indicated it is his intent to keep all the lettering and other features. He said the window sills hold water, but are possibly repairable. He will need to have someone take a close look at the windows. They are single hung windows and very drafty. All the window panes were replaced in the early 1980's. Mr. Titus would like to something to make the windows more energy efficient. Mr. Kilpatrick commented he does not have major objections to the siding, but would like to see plans for the features, windows and doors if they are to be replaced, and feels it would make more sense to replace all the siding at once

so that it ages the same. Mr. Titus added that if the windows are replaced, they would be exactly the same as currently exists.

Mr. Thompson has a concern about replacing the wood material with an artificial material in that it might change the character. The Board has generally asked that when a material is replaced, it be replaced with a like material. Even though the same type of wood siding can't be found, Mr. Thompson's preference is for wood simply because that's what is there now. That is part of the character of the Mill. If the applicant proceeds with the project it would also make more sense to try to replace the siding all at once for continuity. It is clear that something needs to be done.

Dr. Eastman indicated he is very interested in seeing the applicant preserve the structure in the best way possible. Because of the structural problems with the Mill, an exception can be made to the "replace is not as good as repair" tenet that the Board goes by. If the siding is replaced with more modern building materials, we can look forward to another 100 or 150 years of that structure being there. The Board should also take that into consideration.

Chairperson Dunphy thanked the applicant for coming to discuss the project tonight and stated the Board looks forward to seeing him again when the full application is filed.

ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Election of Officers

Chairperson - Chairperson Dunphy opened the floor for nominations for the position of Chairperson. Dr. Stamps asked if the current Chairperson wished to continue to serve. Mr. Dunphy stated he would be happy to continue to serve. Dr. Stamps nominated Mr. Dunphy, and that nomination was seconded by Dr. Eastman. No other nominations were made and the Chair closed the floor for nominations. Mr. Dunphy was unanimously elected to the office of Chairperson.

Vice-Chairperson - Chairperson Dunphy opened the floor for nominations for the position of Vice-Chairperson. Mr. Dunphy nominated Mr. Thompson, and that nomination was seconded by Mr. Kilpatrick. No other nominations were made and the Chair closed the floor for nominations. Mr. Thompson was unanimously elected to the office of Vice-Chairperson.

Secretary - Chairperson Dunphy opened the floor for nominations for the position of Secretary. Dr. Eastman nominated Dr. Stamps, and that nomination was seconded by Mr. Winters. No other nominations were made and the Chair closed the floor for nominations. Dr. Stamps was unanimously elected to the office of Secretary.

2011 Earl Borden Award

Chairperson Dunphy stated the Commissioners had received an updated list of the past awardees and the criteria used to present the award. Nominations

should be done in January or February, and selection should occur in February or March. The award is usually presented during Preservation Week in May. The Commission is not obligated to give any awards if they don't feel anyone is worthy of mention in either category. Chairperson Dunphy asked if any member is ready to make a nomination tonight or if it should be held off until the March meeting.

Mr. Thompson suggested Nathaniel Brock for the restoration of the barn he moved to the Winkler Mill property, the Oakland County Planning and Economic Development for their help in the Mayor's Advisory Report for the two historic districts, and he would consider the Road Commission for Oakland County for the railings on the Tienken Road bridge.

Mr. Kilpatrick suggested John Dziurman for his lengthy service to the HDC and the Study Committee. He would be an ideal candidate for leadership for what he has done in his role with respect to this Commission.

Dr. Stamps asked if the projects have to be within City limits, and was thinking of the Rochester Elevator. Chairperson Dunphy thinks it would be tough justifying something that was not within the city limits. Mr. Delacourt added that the Rochester Elevator was a community project spearheaded by the Avon Rochester Historical Society and commented that perhaps a leadership award to the society itself might be more appropriate.

Dr. Stamps suggested the members think about the suggested nominees and be prepared to select the recipient(s) at the next meeting.

Mr. Delacourt encouraged all the Commissioners to take a ride and check out the Brock Barn. It's presence on the old mill property and road is fantastic with a style that is very appropriate for the district. Mr. Delacourt also spoke up for the Oakland County Planning Department who put in hundreds of hours of free time to generate the advisory report.

MOTION by Thompson, seconded by Stamps, to nominate the following five candidates for the 2011 Earl Borden Award - The Brock's for an historic preservation award, and the Oakland County Planning and Economic Development, the Road Commission for Oakland County, John Dziurman and the Rochester Avon Historical Society, all for preservation leadership awards.
Ayes: All Nays: None **MOTION CARRIED.**

Voting to select the recipient(s) will take place at the next meeting.

Mr. Thompson inquired about what is happening with the demolition by neglect notification on the 1841 Crooks Road property. Mr. Delacourt explained he can't comment on this as it has been discussed in closed session. Staff has continued to send him letters listing what items need to be accomplished in order to mothball the premises by a date specific. Mr. Dunn has started some of the work - he patched the holes in the roof and started boarding the windows, but the timeframe has passed again. Staff is attempting to contact Mr. Dunn to see what kind of timeframe he would suggest he be given in order to finish these items.

Also, no one has come forward so far to try and preserve the structure at 1585 S. Rochester Rd.

Mr. Delacourt thanked Messrs. Dziurman and Miller and Ms. Cozzolino, members of the Historic Districts Commission who were either not re-elected or chose not to serve another term, for their service, expertise and the time they spent on the Board.

NEXT MEETING DATE

The Chair reminded the Commissioners the next Regular Meeting is scheduled for March 10, 2011.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further business to come before the Commission, and upon Motion by Kilpatrick, seconded by Stamps, the Chair adjourned the Regular Meeting at 8:23 p.m.

Brian Dunphy, Chairperson
Historic Districts Commission
City of Rochester Hills

Sandi DiSipio, Recording Secretary