



Department of Planning and Development
 Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

December 4, 2017

1939 Washington – Garage Roof modification	
REQUEST	Certificate of Appropriateness for modification of the garage roof
APPLICANT	Kathy White
FILE NO.	HDC # 17-047
PARCEL NO.	15-01-227-033
ZONING	R-E – Single family residential
HISTORIC DISTRICT	Winkler Mill Pond
STAFF	Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

In this Report:

Request.....1
 Historical Information.....2
 Review Considerations.....2
 Summary3
 Potential Motion.....3

Request

This is an application to reconfigure the garage roof and dormer to the attached garage on the property. The property contains a house and attached garage constructed in 1995. The house and attached garage are non-contributing to the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. This application is for alterations to the garage roof, dormers, and doors.

The subject property is located on the northwest side of Washington Road, on the Winkler Mill Pond, near the north end of the district. The property has many trees and bushes, and is surrounded by newer houses. The house and garage are minimally visible from the street. The existing house and garage create an L-shaped footprint, the house is a one-and-a-half story tall and clad in light colored brick. The EIFS-clad garage is one-story tall with three gable-front dormers facing the driveway. Three paneled overhead garage doors with false arched tops face the driveway. The backside of the garage has three gable-front dormers.

The applicant is proposing to raise the garage roof to create a shallower gable roof and convert the driveway facing dormers into a single shed-roof dormer with three windows and shutters. The new dormer will be clad in EIFS to resemble stucco. The first floor of the garage will be clad in brick, and will have the three garage

doors converted to carriage style doors with windows at the top. Above the doors a shed roof canopy supported by brackets is proposed to extend out over the doors. On the back side the main roof will be raised and the dormers will remain as is, but the windows in the dormers will be replaced. The new roof surfaces will be clad in dimensional asphalt shingles to match the existing. No work is proposed to the existing house.

Historical Information

The subject property is located in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. The 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* describes the district as generally surrounding Winkler Mill Pond from the north edge of the Stoney Creek Historic District along both Winkler Mill Road and Washington Road. The district is almost wholly residential in character, with houses dating from the 1830s to the 1990s. A few of the houses retain agricultural outbuildings. The foundation of Winkler Mill is visible and two of the mill dams are functioning. The district has sloping terrain and is heavily treed.

The district was developed around the Winkler Mill (a gristmill that burned in 1985) and a wool carding mill owned by Levi Cole who also owned the majority of the property in the nineteenth century. In the 1920s the first suburban and summer homes appeared in the area. Most of the residential development around the mill pond took place after World War II, particularly beginning in the 1970s. The district has sixteen contributing resources and forty-three non-contributing resources, and two that require more research to determine their status. Some of the most significant properties in the district include the Greek Revival Levi Cole house; the house at 1740 Washington Road; the Colonial Revival Von Isser House built c. 1918; the mill house on Winkler Mill Road; the mill dams and the mill pond.

This parcel on Washington Road sits on the pond. This part of the district is surrounded by subdivisions and newer houses. The non-contributing houses in this portion of the district are generally one- to two-stories tall, have gable roofs, attached garages and are clad in brick with asphalt shingle roofs. The houses are generally on large lots and are extensively landscaped.

Review Considerations

The proposed project involves the attached garage, no work will be done to the house. The existing gable roof of the garage is proposed to be raised and made a shallower pitch to create more headroom in the upper floor of the garage. On the driveway side of the garage the existing three gable-front dormers will be removed and a new shed roof wall dormer with three windows will be constructed. The dormer will be faced with exterior insulated finish system (EIFS) to resemble stucco. The three garage doors will be replaced with carriage style doors with windows across the top. The existing faux arches above the doors and trim will be removed. The first floor will be clad in light brick that matches the house and the small brick base that currently exists on the garage walls. A shed roof canopy supported by brackets is proposed to extend out above the garage doors. On the back wall of the garage the roofline will change but the existing three dormers will remain in place. New windows matching the existing will be installed in the same locations.

The applicant has indicated that the following materials will be used for the project:

1. Brick and EIFS that matches the existing; wood shutters, dimensional asphalt shingles that match the existing.
2. Window and door materials are unknown.
3. Colors will match the existing house and garage.

Summary

1. The property is in the north end of the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. The property sits on the Winkler Mill Pond has a non-contributing house and attached garage constructed in 1995.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the attached garage which include re-cladding the walls in brick, replacing the doors, adding a canopy, raising the roof and installing a new shed roof dormer with windows and shutters.
3. Staff offers the following comments on the proposed project. This portion of the district is primarily newer houses and is heavily landscaped. The house and attached garage are non-contributing properties and the garage modifications including cladding the walls in brick, replacing the doors, adding a shed roof canopy supported by brackets, and modifying the garage roof and construction of the shed roof dormer facing the driveway with new windows and shutters as proposed is compatible with the district and will not destroy any historic materials or features. The proposal meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
4. The applicant has submitted the proposed plans to the City's Building Department for a formal review. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

Potential Motions

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

MOTION, in the matter of File No. HDC 17-047, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the garage modifications at 1939 Washington Road in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District, Parcel Identification Number 15-01-227-033, with the following Findings and Conditions:

- 1) The proposed project which is comprised of modifications to the existing attached garage is in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District and **is/is not** compatible in massing, size, scale and materials with this part of the district;
- 2) The proposed garage modifications including cladding the walls in brick, replacing the doors, adding a shed roof canopy supported by brackets, and modifying the garage roof and construction of the shed roof dormer facing the driveway with new windows and shutters as proposed **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard number 9 as follows:

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*