

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Pilchak Cohen & Tice, P.C.	Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti Sherbrook	Jackson Lewis LLP	Cummings, McClorey, Davis & Acho, PLC	Howard Shifman PC
ADDRESS	Auburn Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Livonia, MI (Branch in Sterling Heights)	Birmingham, MI
Years in Business	9 years	41 years	51 yrs/2 yrs in State	44 yrs	13 years
Years providing labor & employment	9 years	over 20 years		Over 40 yrs	33 years
Historical Narrative	Represents mgmt exclusively specializing in defense of labor and employment matters	Karen Berkery assoc in labor & employment dept, now sr principal; involved in cases that changed employmt law in Michigan.	One of largest law firms in country dedicated exclusively to representing mgmt on wkplace issues; 42 offices; 600 attys; public & private, non-profit; Devise optimal solutions that minimize costs and maximize results; assist clients in achieving business goals. Detroit office opened in Feb 2008; now 9 attys. Focus is preventative labor relations. Public sector group defends ind, collective & class action lawsuits.	Acho - began career at Ford Motor rep both mgmt & labor including unions - provides unique insight & ability. Anticipate issues & problems, effective solutions; handled thousands of labor related matters, every conceivable type, appellate cases making the law, day-to-day guidance, preventive counseling, MESC, MERC, NLRB, has represented 600 govt entities in State, incl 80 of Mich 274 cities & 57 of its 83 counties	Since 1976 all facets of labor relations & employmt law in public sector - wk w/ numerous public employers & public employee unions in Mich. - uniquely qualified to provide the highest quality of legal services which meets the needs of the City in the labor relations and employment area. St & Fed Cts and admin agencies
Firm's Philosophy relative to public sector labor negotiations		Believe in negotiating the best possible contract for our clients. Securing favorable collective bargaining agreements for municipalities important w/ dwindling tax revenues and employmt costs continue to rise based on higher benefits	Public sector unique set of laws, regs, reqs & practices; exp lg & sm cities, etc., civil service laws, labor relations, mgmt training on HR topics, represent clients before arbitrators, mediators, NLRB, state labor boards, govt agencies, State & Fed courts, advise to employers on a daily basis	Very complex area of law; critical City develop policies & procedures that protect employees & safeguard financial well-being of City; essence of relations is fairness; sensitivity to people & needs & necessity of protecting city's finances & liability, formulate advice to accomplish goals; clear and helpful advice at a reasonable cost; use attys less due to education & training provided to HR & City administration	Stability in labor relations counsel is important for all communities. If City is satisfied w/ its labor relations counsel, suggest communities maintain the status quo. If decision to move in another direct, firm would appreciate opportunity to assist or supplement the representation.
Number of current clients w/ similar services/capacity		Currently represents Macomb County in similar capacity, except labor negotiations & arbitrations. Represented City of Warren in employmt matters & litigation. Private sector clients including health care clients. Provide to all clients general human resource advice and represent most clients in labor and employment litigation defense.	Over 13,000 clients nationwide providing labor & employment counseling. Detroit office has capacity to handle all City matters; advantage to transition to 41 other offices. Central region offices: Minneapolis, Chicago, Omaha, Cincinnati, Cleveland & Pittsburgh	Many clients; number of cities, counties, townships, schools & private employers; from large cities to small cities and incl some of the largest employers in America. Nothing RH would face that firm has not already handled successfully	Unique perspective firm brings based upon backgrounds & diverse client base. Firm provides excellent service & gets results that communities not only needed today, but required

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Pilchak Cohen & Tice, P.C.	Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti Sherbrook	Jackson Lewis LLP	Cummings, McClorey, Davis & Acho, PLC	Howard Shifman PC
ADDRESS	Auburn Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Livonia, MI (Branch in Sterling Heights)	Birmingham, MI
Client References	Court Administrator 46th District Court Court Administrator 47th District Court Court Administrator 51st District Court Chief Judge 45th District Court Chief Judge 50th District Court Trustee, Shelby Township	NexCare Health Systems Macomb County Ciena Healthcare Management, Inc. Sharon Hollins City of Warren	Hazel Park Public Schools TheCrown Group Fendt Builders Supply Wayne County Pontiac General Hospital	Dearborn Heights, Livingston County, Redford Township, Kalkaska County, Oakland Community College, School- craft College, Henry Ford Community College, Kalkaska County Road Commission, Kalkaska County Sheriff's Dept, Wayne County Community College, SMART, Monroe County Comm Mental Health Authority	Berkely, Ferndale, Brighton Fire Auth, Lapeer, Lincoln Park, Madison Heights, Oak Park, Gaylord, River Rouge, Royal Oak, Southgate, Melvindale, Warren, White Lake, Bingham Farms, West Bloomfield
Total personnel for firm:					
Professional:	6 attorneys	109 attorneys	605 attys Detroit 9 attys	35 Professionals	3
Non-Professional:		98 non-attorneys	410 support staff Detroit 4 support staff	39 Non-Professionals	5
Experience and Qualifications of Lead Attorney and other personnel to be assigned to RH	Dan Cohen - primary contact Rhonda Armstrong . Cohen primarily responsible for labor and employment counsel; all 6 attys available to assist the City w/ employment matters. Forefront of industry; national practice; Congressional briefings, taught employmt law to other lawyers; presentation at ABA; authored contributions to legal publications; editor of Gen Counsel's Exe Summary of Employmt Law in 50 States; prides its on obtaining dismissal of complex cases as early as possible	Karen Berkery, lead atty, Sr Prin Atty representing employers in State & Fed Ct, arbitration & admin agencies as EEOC, MDCR, DOL, NLRB & MERC for 20 yrs; civil rights claims; labor relations matters. Kimberly Pendrick, Assoc Prin, 10 yrs, exp in labor & employmt litigation, wage & hour compl, ULP defense & labor arbitrations. Brett Miller & Teri Dennings-4 yrs employmt litigation & union grievance arbitrations. Lori Adamcheski, associate, labor law including Act 312 Arbitrations May consults with other firm members in general municipal law matters	Tom Barlow-37 yrs of exp representing pub & private sector mgmt all aspects of employmt & labor law incld. Nego & admin of collective bargaining agrmts, litigation of employmt cases, defense of unfair labor practice charges, cont admin, grievance arbitraiton, civil rights before St & Fed agencies, Act 312 arbitration, 40 yrs experience M. Jenkins 27 yrs labor & employmt law- litigation, preventative counseling to mgmt, NLRB ULP charges, investigation wkplce fatalities, improper conduct Rubin-18 yrs exp civil & employmt litigator Daskas-14 yrs exp civil & employmt litigation and practices all aspects of employmt law & complex litigation	Ronald Acho-lead atty, Sr partner 1976 labor & employmt law, complex litigation & class actions, bus litigation wk disability Eileen Husband-led atty, partner-heads labor & employmt law practice group, pub sector clients, former SMART, Lt Caesar Ethan Vinson-parnter-labor & employmt law, coll bargaining, contract nego, labor arbitrations, civil rights, muni defense & ins defense; 25 yrs trail experience Coll bargaining in local municipalities Thomas Laginess-associate-labor & empl law and litigation, ins defense & public corporation law. 24 yrs labor negotiations in public & private sector	Howard Shifman- 33 yrs-all facets labor relations & employment law in public sector. Past rep of unions. State & Fed Cts and administrative agencies. Robert Nyovich, Of counsel, Partner Hardy, Lewis & Page, 27 yrs, mgmt rep labor law in public sector Timothy McConaghy, Of counsel, Partner Hardy, Lewis & Page, 25 yrs, mgmt rep labor and employmt law, private and public sector

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Pilchak Cohen & Tice, P.C.	Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti Sherbrook	Jackson Lewis LLP	Cummings, McClorey, Davis & Acho, PLC	Howard Shifman PC
ADDRESS	Auburn Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Livonia, MI (Branch in Sterling Heights)	Birmingham, MI
Understanding of services; special qualifications and experience		Renowned full-service law firm w/ 6 offices, over 1000 attys, recognized leader in employmt law, healthcare, govt & industry defense 40 yrs, responsive to clients, top notch legal services at competitive rates, quals and exp to handle any matter that may arise for RH	Extensive exp labor & employmt services to cities, counties & other public sector. Rarely issue they have not encountered; can draw on atty's specialized knowledge & exp to find best solution or strategy; 600 attys across nation; provide clients vast array of materials, legal alerts, news-letters & updates on law at fed & state level; hosts local programs & seminars & virtual webinars on labor & employmt topics	Services to HR & other incl labor & employ law compliance, labor nego, labor contract admin, Pub Act 312 arbitration & grievance arbitration, unfair labor practice charges, civil rights & equal employmt opportunity compliance & employee benefits admin. Wk with HR to nego union contracts, contract admin, grievance investigation & adjudication, binding arbitration	Has represented either employer or employee unions. Over 33 yrs rep 150 jurisdictions, 1600 grievance arbitrations, negotiated over 400 collective bargaining agreements & numerous interest arbitration cases, presented extensive training, grievances, contract analysis, dev cost strategy & tactics, understanding various areas as health ins, pension law, labor disputes successfully resolved. Exp representing unions; now represents employers.
Summary of municipal experience and qualifications:					
Labor and Employment Law Compliance	Advice & counsel w/ respect to discrimination, harassment, retaliation, FMLA, ADA, Wage hour, collective bargaining, employee benefits and related claims. Employmt & Labor Law compliance; defense in State & Fed Ct & Adm hrgs MERC, MDCR, EEOC, DOL, NLRB	Macomb County & Warren w/ employmt law compliance issues & handling litigation defense from answering questions on HR topics to handling specific employees when a potential for litigation arises.	Principal of preventive counseling; rep employers in admin & judicial proceedings OSHA assistance, before arbitrators, mediators, NLRC, St labor bds, govt agencies & St & Fed Courts, help employers create policies in compl w/ laws, while promoting positive empl relations	Provide advice & counsel, prevention in the workplace and strategies to avoid risks, use of experience litigators with continuity of representation	Basic requirement in each of our communities. Each attorney provides that service and has many years of experience on those areas.
Labor Negotiations	Labor negotiations both at the table as lead negotiators & as members of employer bargaining teams; draft labor agreements, policies & procedures manuals, ind employment agreements & other employment & labor related docs	Extensive experience in labor negotiations in private sector, none for municipal client	Barlow & Jenkins extensive exp in union negotiations, labor contract interpretation, compliance & grievance investigations and arbitrations	Facilitate a cooperative partnership bet client and various unions; out of the box approaches; joint problem solving, prior municipal negotiating experience	Lead Atty has extensive experience of the firm in this area.
Labor Contract Administration	Assisted labor relations & HR w/ contract interpretation& admin in both private & Public environments	Exp in muni labor & contract admin, incld advising & conducting Loudermill hrgs & advising on mandatory & permissive subjectives of collective bargaining; questions for interpretations of agreemts & responding to union issues	Barlow extensive labor contract admin exp, as does Jenkins. Admin numerous labor contracts working w/ mgmt to ensure favorable contract interpretation up to & including grievance arbitration	Objectives incl collective bargaining strategy dev, chief spokesperson, mediation representation, interest based bargaining, contract interpretation, grievance arbitration, strike & related legal matters, public relations issues	33 years of experience in contract administration as well as negotiation experience of lead atty.
Public Act 312 Arbitration	Arbitrated dozens of grievances under private & public sector labor agreements	Adamcheski spent several years participating in Public Act 312 Arbitrations for municipal clients	Help client to avoid as complex & expensive; exp handling 312 arbitration matters will leverage exp of 600 attys-over dozen have interest arbitration exp.	Save clients substantial fees & avoid costly awards by negotiating resolutions	Firm is presently handling Act 312 arbitrations in Police and Fire in Lincoln Park, Mad Hgts & Wht Lk Twp, Fire in Royal Oak and Dispatch in West Bloomfield Twp.

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Pilchak Cohen & Tice, P.C.	Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti Sherbrook	Jackson Lewis LLP	Cummings, McClorey, Davis & Acho, PLC	Howard Shifman PC
ADDRESS	Auburn Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Livonia, MI (Branch in Sterling Heights)	Birmingham, MI
Grievance Arbitration		Labor & employmt attys frequent involermt in union grievance arbitrations - over 50 in past 3 years	Attys in Det office have extensive exp w/ grievance arbitration, handling cases involving a long list of unions from AFSCME to Teamsters	Vigorously defend municipalities in individual & group grievance arbitrations; committed to assiting clients during internal processing of grievances; promote cooperative labor mgmt relations while conserving economic resources through facilitative mediation	Lead atty has handled almost 2000 arbitration cases in his career
Unfair Labor Practice Charges		Represent several private clients in unfair labor charges before NLRB. Had not had opportunity to represent client in unfair labor charges hrg before a MERC panel	Wk'd w/ unionized or partially unionized employers across country to defend against filing frivolous or politically motivate unfair labor practice charges.	Specialized knowledge & skill makes them successful at MERC	Each atty has handled many unfair labor practice charges. Key is to avoid an unfair labor practice, where possible. Labor relation strategies avoid unfair labor practices & result in contractual agreement that benefits community
Civil Rights & Equal Employment Opportunity Compliance		Regularly response to reqs for info on equal opportunity compl, numerous seminars are provides, quarterly newsitr w/ updates	Hundreds EEOC - grievances, hrgs & appeals on discrimination, wage & hour, classification, discipline, AWOL & disability; MI Dept of Civil Rights.	Representation at Equal Employment & Opportunity Comm & MDCR gives them ability to respond rapidly to client needs.	All attys handled regularly. Avoid by placement of policies & strategies & assessing risk before taking actions-proper planning before taking the employment action
Employee Benefits Administration		Consulting relative to healthcare, pension liability & ERISA issues; litigation issues	All aspects of employee benefits law, incl counseling; pension, profit-sharing, stock bonus plans, deferred comp plans, health, welfare & fringe benefit programs, liabilities under collectively bargained benefit arrangements, retiree welfare arrangements, liability claims.	Handled many employee benefits matters & has a significant amount of expertise in this area	Advice regarding healthcare & ins benefits & pension plans; do not provide advise on structure of pension plans or admin of self-funded plans, etc.
Subcontracted Services		None	None	No	Yes- 312 arbitration exhibits; pension experts, healthcare experts, financial witnesses, benefit plan structures
Methods of Communication		Keep client informed, direct phone lines, email, correspondence, status reports, change in law	Highest standards of responsiveness, return calls within 24 hrs, smart phones, PDAs, email updates, internal mtgs.	Key to successful partnership-on-going communications and discussions to better assist the City. No charge for travel time, phone calls, emails	Responsiveness is key to success-get back quickly-generally by phone; face-to-face mtgs, electronically, monthly status reports.

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Pilchak Cohen & Tice, P.C.	Kitch Drutchas Wagner Valitutti Sherbrook	Jackson Lewis LLP	Cummings, McClorey, Davis & Acho, PLC	Howard Shifman PC
ADDRESS	Auburn Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Livonia, MI (Branch in Sterling Heights)	Birmingham, MI
Policy regarding errors or omissions		Prevent errors through diligent preparation and review; make corrections as soon as we can.	Malpractice Liability Coverage	Non compliance with the law issues will be made to conform with the law	No such policy exists in this firm
Grievance(s) filed		None	None of attys in Detroit office	No atty w/ the firm has been the subject of any discipline in anything they ever did with CMDA	No
Attorneys debarred in firm		No	None of attys	No	No
All attorneys members of State Bar of Michigan		No. 3 attys in Chicago office are only admitted in Illinois and one in Toledo is only admitted in Ohio	All attys in Detroit Office in Det office admitted to State Bar of Michigan	All attys that practice law in State of Mich are members of the State Bar of Mich	Yes
Attys admitted to State Bar of Michigan		Karen Berkery-lead atty - 1985 Pendrick - 1999 Dennings - 2005 Miller - 2005 Adamcheski - 2006	Barlow - 1972 Majority during 1990's All between 1972 and 2004	Acho - 1974 Husband - 1985 Vinson - 1976 Laginess - 1982 Cummings - 1964	Yes
All legal staff in good standing w/ the State Bar of Michigan		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Contract required		Retainer Agreement customized to needs of client	No contract is required		No
Billing Procedures	Capped billing referenced in cost proposal	Billed monthly	Monthly. City will be charged for reimbursables	Monthly invoices; net 30 days	Monthly billing
Litigation		Information provided	Information provided	Information provided	Information provided

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Wangrud HR LLC	Dykema Gossett PLLC	Keller Thoma	Steven H. Schwartz & Associates PLC	Bodman LLP
ADDRESS	Farmington Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Years in Business	3 yrs in Michigan	83 years	77 years	13 years	82 years
Years providing labor & employment	30 yrs licensed attorney	83 years	77 years	21 years	50 years
Historical Narrative	20 yrs in public sector (education) and 10 yrs in private industry. Exp nego labor agmts with groups incl custodial, maintenance, secretarial & clerical; then moved to teacher contracts & bldg principals; Unions incl AFSCME, Teamsters, IUOE, Carpenters, UAW, Mich Fed of Teachers, Mich Educational Assn. Advice & guidance, recommendations for policies and labor contract parameters.	One of largest employmt law practices in Mich. Exp w/ MERC, fact-finding, 312 Arbitration, drafting employmt policies, counseling client on employmt matters, expertise in nego of public sector collective bargaining contracts, large & small HR & Legal dept partners for over 80 yrs, rep'd govt and others, litigation, OSHA, civil rights, FLSA, FMLA, USERRA, HIPPA, MIOSHA, MERC, etc.	Firm restricts its practice to the representation of employers. All facets of labor relations & employmt law. Multi-state practice in wide variety of industries. Public Sector since Public Employmt Relations Act in 1965 represented numerous municipalities, villages, twps, counties, school dists, colleges & special purpose authorities across the State of Michigan	Former Dykema Sr Assoc and Asst City Mgr/HR Dir for Birmingham - 10 labor agreements w/ AFSCME, Teamsters, POAM, COAM & IAFF. 3 Act 312 arbitrations. Responsible for defense of grievance, discrimination complaints, salary & benefit admin & gen personnel matters 75% time representing municipalities in collective bargaining.	Labor & employmt law is one of firm's primary areas of practice. One of Mich largest workplace law groups - 20 active members. Public and Private Sector; many local govts & govt related entities.
Firm's Philosophy relative to public sector labor negotiations	In negotiations there should be no surprises at the table. The day after the last contract was settled starts the negotiations of the next contract. Believe in regular periodic mtgs w/ union officials to discuss issues. These issues become the basis of the proposals for the next contracts. Financials discussed; monies & budget should be transparent.	Fair, but firm. Recognize economic and political pressures. Best result is ratified contracts. Public sector negotiations tend to take too long & every effort must be made to expedite a prompt resolution	Assisting the employer in identification & achievement of objectives which serve long-range HR goals. Individual matters are assessed within this framework. Provide employer lawful alternatives available in each fact situation w/ an assessment of relative merits of each alternative. Utilizes a "how to" rather than "cannot do" approach.	High level of service, provide practical candid advice in collective bargaining, litigation & other labor relations matters regarding strength of client's legal position. Honest assessment of options. Candid assessment about City finances. In all contract, objective reach resolution quickly, while preserving community's mgmt rights. Develop financial strategies before formal negotiations	Labor negotiatons: employer needs to develop a strategy, like a business plan, to comply w/ law & assuage emotion. Strategy & goals of employers used to formulate bargaining proposals. W/ public sfety bargaining strategy anticipates initiation of Act 312 proceedings. Labor Counsel must be experienced & well-prepared to guide the employer in dev of bargaining plan & strategy & capable of carrying to bargaining table.
Number of current clients w/ similar services/capacity	Up to two clients at any one time	30 public sector clients	58 municipal clients in addition to school districts and private sector employers. Attys provide comprehensive labor and employment law counsel, advice w/ respect to specific issues & representation before all administrative agencies and in St and Fed Courts	10 muncpal clients Genesee County Grosse Pointe District Library Lake Erie Transportation Commission City of Lathrup Village City of Northville City of Romulus City of Trenton City of Westland City of Woodhaven City of Wyandotte	Hundreds of different clients. Services provided to these clients include those services described under each of the components Negotiations, Advice and Counsel, Labor Contract Administration and Employment Policies and Agreements

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Wangrud HR LLC	Dykema Gossett PLLC	Keller Thoma	Steven H. Schwartz & Associates PLC	Bodman LLP
ADDRESS	Farmington Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Client References	Cooper Standard Automotive Chippewa Valley Schools Venture Sales & Engineering Berry Moorman PC	City of Dearborn Washtenaw Community College City of Rochester City of Ann Arbor Michigan Municipal League	City of Birmingham City of Farmington Hills City of Southfield City of Novi Commerce Township	City of Woodhaven Genesee County City of Wyandotte City of Trenton Lake Erie Transit ommission Grosse Pointe District Library	City of Lapeer City of Alpena Marquette Township Charter Township of Harrison Inalfa Roof Systems, Inc., - AH Crittenton Hospital Medical Center Faurecia, - Fraser
Total personnel for firm:					
Professional:	1	454	20	2	142
Non-Professional:	0	260	8	3	110
Experience and Qualifications of Lead Attorney and other personnel to be assigned to RH	Debra Wangrud-HR professional 20 yrs Last 11 Chippewa Valley School - Asst Superintendent for HR-responsible all aspects of employmt & labor for school district. Lead negotiator for all contracts, preparing mediation & fact finding, contract admin, guidance to administrators & supervisory personnel on labor & employmt issues, responsible for grievances & researched & presented arbitrations, hiring, admin of insurance benefits, bidding insurances, decisions on self-funding. Education includes Bachelor's Degree, Masters Degree in Guidance & Counseling & Law Degree w/ emphasis in labor & employment law	John Entenman-80 collective bargaining contracts, Dearborn negotiations - 9 unions, 312 matters, public and private sector - representing employers and union related matters. Joined firm 1973. NLRB, MERC, collective bargaining & arbitrations, both grievance and interest. Robert Duty-employmt litigation, nego executive contracts, employmt consulting mergers/acquisitions, contract nego w/ unions, employmt liab ins & gen labor & employmt advice & services K.J. Miller - broad commercial & tort litigation in Fed & St courts, arbitration before Amer Arbitraiton Assn & private mediators. Contract disputes, consumers financial services, negligence, fraud, and ins claims at trial & appellate levels, defense of employers in wrongful termination, contract, wage & hour	Dennis DuBay-37 years. Principal in firm specializing in labor relations law and employmt related litigation for pub & priv employers. Collective bargaining, mediation, fact-finding, contract admin, grievance processing & arbitration, Act 312 arbitration, litigation, civil serv, civil rights, wage-hour, pension, employee benefit matters. Thomas Fleury-35 yrs-Principal in firm. Litigation St & Fed Cts & admin agencies-civil rights, disabled, wrongful discharge, wk comp, counseling employers. Gary King-29 years. Principal in firm school law, collective bargaining nego, contract admin, grievance arbitration, personnel pol dev, employmt litigation Richard Fanning-43 years. Firm Principal Labor & employmt law, collective bargaining, contract admin, grievance processing, arbitration, unfair labor practice litigation	Steven Schwartz-outstanding track record in winning grievance arbitrations; rep municipalities in Act 312 arbitrations, contract nego & hrgs at MERC, Mich Dept Civil Rights, Equal Employment Opp Comm, MESG, NLRB & civil litigation in Fed/St Cts. John Shipper-2005 graduate of WSU-master degree in labor relations; law clerk of EEOC & Helveston & Helveston, a labor relations firm & 4 yr in personnel for Development Dimensions Int. prior to practicing law. Firm has extensive expertise & practical experience in public sector labor law through prior representation of municipal and other public sector clients.	Steven Fishman-40 yrs labor/employmt law trial atty for NLRB & lead atty for ig Chicago firm, in-hs labor counsel for a Fortune 500 business, founder of Fishman Group. D Scharg-27 yrs labor, construction labor, employmt discrim & employee relations, coll barg, cont arbit, 312, wrongful dischrg M Ayoub-17 yrs labor employmt law, exclusvie to mgmt St/Fed Ct, EEOC, MDCR, NLRB, MDLEG, Wage/Hr, Litigation Exp C Mazzoli-15 yrs -reps mgmt all areas labor/employmt law-law compl/minimize litigation, empl relations/2 yrs at Lear A Graves-5 yrs-counsel employers on labor,employmt & employee relations

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Wangrud HR LLC	Dykema Gossett PLLC	Keller Thoma	Steven H. Schwartz & Associates PLC	Bodman LLP
ADDRESS	Farmington Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Understanding of services; special qualifications and experience	Bargaining agreement w/o strike including concessionary contracts both private & public sector; will attend mtgs - prior exp w/ Board of Education mtgs - recommendations on labor negotiations and legal matters in closed sessions	Chief spokesperson & lead negotiations of all labor agreements. Advise on day-to-day basis, grievance matters & other labor issues, contract interpretation, direction & guidance, research, investigating, unfair labor practices, St & Fed claims Equal Emplmnt Opportunity Comm & MDCR, mtgs, info & training to mgmt staff, etc.	Firm long record of successful exp in representing municipalities in labor & employmt law matters of demos firm's full understanding and ability to provide all necessary services. Firm has successfully represented public employers in litigation before admin tribunals & St & Fed Cts.	One of leading mgmt side, municipal labor relations firms in State. Performed all of services requested for 21 yrs w/ bulk of practice concentrated in the public sector	Ranks w/ leading firms rep employers in labor & employmt matters. Unique bus plan for contract nego, sessions in contract admin & grievance arbitration, full range of HR legal support. Provide advice and counsel, labor negotiations, labor contract administration, employment policies and agreements
Summary of municipal experience and qualifications:					
Labor and Employment Law Compliance	20 yrs public sector & 10 yrs private sector lead atty current on labor & employmt laws. Part-time professor at Oakland University teaching law class.	Significant experience in all areas of employment law, including wage & hour, employment discrimination, freedom of speech and constitutional issues and non-union arbitration	Audits for labor & employmt law compl & guidance for policies & procedures. Guidance on all St & Fed laws regulating labor & employmt matters. Current updates are provided on firm's website	Continually counsel and update clients on all areas of labor and employment law	
Labor Negotiations	20 yrs collective bargaining under PERA & 10 yrs in private sector. Negotiated contracts, used mediation, fact finding	Collective bargaining contract negotiations for public and private sector; Dearborn 9 unions	Nego thousands collective bargaining agmts on behalf of public employers - contract analysis, strategy & tactics & costing procedures, dealing w/ labor disputes, training in collective bargaining for local, St & Fed agencies	Three roles in different communities: Lead negotiator; advisor & dev strategy & proposal, but not sit at bargaining table; Both roles, but only come to bargaining table in mediation or at a criminal juncture	Strategy development, Act 312 Arbitration proceedings. Well prepared & experienced labor counsel to guide employer.
Labor Contract Administration	Recommendations & guidance to Bd of Education, Superintendents, admin regarding interpretation of collective bargaining agreement. Conduct mtgs to review language changes after ratification	Labor contract interpretation, direction and guidance; providing research and advice.	Advice & counsel questions day-to-day. Interpretations of collective bargaining agreement provisions or a particular provision in specific circumstances are reviewed, alternative approaches that are available to the employer discussed	Routinely counsel clients on contract interpretation & grievance avoidance. Schwartz served in this role as Personnel Director for Birmingham	Employer guidance on labor contract admin issues as matter of principle, can be won at arbitration, or best resolved through settlement. Labor counsel familiar w/ issues & employer's objectives
Public Act 312 Arbitration	Experience w/ non binding fact finding (which is akin to 312 arbitration except non binding).	Experience w/ over 20 Act 312 matters. Lead Atty is currently retained by MML to advise it & the Michigan Legislature as to matters regarding Act 312	Specialized in Act 312 arbitration since 1969 - hundreds. Firm members have authored published materials w/ respect to Act 312 arbitration.	One of leading firms handling Act 312 arbitration. Have received significant economic concessions. Represented Lathrup Vill, Woodhaven, Northville, Wyandotte, Sylvan Lk, Hunt Woods, Trenton, BI Hills & Romulus and others	Bargaining strategy that anticipates the initiation of Act 312 proceedings. Thorough presentation, well-supported by evidence, persuasive argument gives employer the best opportunity for a positive result

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Wangrud HR LLC	Dykema Gossett PLLC	Keller Thoma	Steven H. Schwartz & Associates PLC	Bodman LLP
ADDRESS	Farmington Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Grievance Arbitration	Grievance arbitration for 30 yrs. Given instruction & guidance for all steps of grievance procedures, preparation of written materials & witnesses, presenting employer's case at arbitration for past 20 yrs	Labor attys have successfully handled hundreds of public sector grievance arbitrations and are very familiar w/ various arbitrators	Counsel public employers w/ respect to investigation, analysis & appropriate disposition of contract grievances; represent employers in numerous grievance arbitration matters.	Won approx 80% to 90% of grievance arbitrations handled. Schwartz has been an arbitrator on the American Arbitration Assn Labor Arbitration panel for 10 yrs.	Preparation of employment policies and agreement to keep pace w/ employment conditions, as dictated by employer objectives. Basic knowledge of applicable employment law is essential to creating & updating appropriate & effective policies in the workplace - requires adequate experience in drafting various aspect of terms & conditions of employment & familiarity w/ alternatives which work. Handling of arbitrations, preparation and trial of unfair labor practice charges & defense of civil rights charges before enforcement agencies to muni clients.
Unfair Labor Practice Charges	Number of Unfair Labor Practice charges. Responding to union charges, filed charges on behalf of employer.	Labor attys have successfully handled dozens of public sector unfair labor practice charges and are very familiar w/ members of MESC & the Administrative Law Judges	Exp w/ complete range of matters which may arise before MERC. Have successfully represented public employers including unfair labor practice charges, alleged interference, alleged discrimination, alleged refusals to bargain	Successfully handled dozens of unfair labor practice charges before MERC & NLRB.	
Civil Rights & Equal Employment Opportunity Compliance	Responded to 8 to 10 charges over past 30 yrs. Philosophy is to be pro-active & guard against situation; consistency w/ decision making and good documentation	Extensive experience incl employmt discrimination & harassment claims, partner w/ public clients to minimize claims by dev of anti-harassment pol & reporting procedures. Wk w/ HR, training for employees & mgrs. MDCR & EEOC exp	Many yrs defense of both discrimination lawsuits & charges before MDCR & Equal Employmt Opportunity Comm. Investigations of allegations of discrimination and harassment to assure compl. w/ St & Fed civil rights laws; prevent litigation	Handled over 200 EEOC/Mich Dept Civil Rights charges of discrimination - about 98% dismissed in favor of firm's clients. Routinely give day to day advice on Fed & St laws, as FMLA, disability, employmt discrimination, Wage & Hr comp	
Employee Benefits Administration	20 yrs benefit administration (11 yrs in public sector) Admin of all public benefits, selection of provider, decision regarding fully insured or self-insured, nego w/ vendors, write RFP's for ins. benefits and wk w/ unions on new providers & negotiated benefit levels	Full service employee benefit grp - retirement plans, benefits grp designs, exe comp programs, welfare & fringe benefit plans, IRS & Dept of Labor compl audits on benefit plans & wk w/ client to maintain tax-preferential treatment for plans, Tax-related Fed & St laws	Several attys specialize in employee benefit matters, incl retirement systems, pension plan matters, health ins plans, health ins issues, workers comp and disability pay matters	Normally refer complex employee benefits matter to either Siegal, Greenfield, Hayes & Gross or David Rosenberger Law Group. (will bill City directly)	Specialists in employee benefits dedicated to dealing w/ health care, defined benefit & contributions based pension and other benefit issues
Subcontracted Services	None	None, except possibly expert witness testimony at Act 312 proceedings	None	Amy Sullivan to conduct wage & benefit surveys (\$65/hr)	None
Methods of Communication	Based on client needs, timing & importance, issues communicated in person, phone, email, electronic docs, fax or US mail	Responsiveness - on call 24 hrs a day. Lead Atty + 2 other attys supported by nearly 40 labor & employmt attys in firm. Email, courier, IP phones, Extranet	At option of client, in person, telephone, email, facsimile or regular mail	High level of client service; return all calls within 1-2 hrs & virtually all calls within 24 hrs. Most projects completed within a week	Regular communication w/ clients - US mail, electronic mail, fax, telephone, cell phones, PDAs - 24 hr access to firm's telecommunication systems

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Wangrud HR LLC	Dykema Gossett PLLC	Keller Thoma	Steven H. Schwartz & Associates PLC	Bodman LLP
ADDRESS	Farmington Hills, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Policy regarding errors or omissions	Policy to be very accurate. Error would be out of ordinary in practice. If issue would determine remedy	Not applicable	Takes all steps to avoid errors or omissions in wk product. If one occurs, immediate corrections would be made	Covered by firm's malpractice insurance and general liability insurance	Claims reported to Firm's prof responsibility committee & General Counsel for handling such matters
Grievance(s) filed	No	No members of proposed team. Over past 10 years no firm attorney was subject to any such actions	Yes - one in 77 years	No	No
Attorneys debarred in firm	No	No	No	No	No
All attorneys members of State Bar of Michigan	Yes	200 attys licensed in Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes, except A. Schostak in Business Practice Group - not assigned to RH
Attys admitted to State Bar of Michigan	Debra Wangrud - 1979	Entenman - 1973 Duty - 1979 Miller - 2000	DuBay - 1972 Fleury - 1974 King - 1981 Fanning - 1996	Schwartz - 1988 Schipper - 2005	Steven Fishman 1972 Donald Scharg 1978 Maureen Rouse-Ayoub 1992 Christopher Mazzoli 1994 Aaron Graves 2004
All legal staff in good standing w/ the State Bar of Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes, except A. Schostak in Business Practice Group - not assigned to RH
Contract required	No	Standard Engagement Letter	No	Basic retention letter	Special fee & project fee arrangements
Billing Procedures	Monthly billings. Services itemized with billing based on tenths of hour	Various combinations of fee arrangemts presented	Hrly billing, Monthly Stmt hrly fees & reimbursables.	Fees billed monthly; time recorded in 1/4 hr increments; travel time defined	Monthly billing; net 30 days
Litigation	Information provided	Information provided	Information provided	Information provided	Information provided

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Garan Luow Miller, PC	Clark Hill	Sullivan Ward Asher & Patton PC	Kotz Sangster Wysocki & Berg PC	Miller Canfield
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI
Years in Business	61 years	119 years	58 years	31 years	157 years
Years providing labor & employment		102 years		Over 25 years	44 years representing public sector
Historical Narrative	Offices throughout state; hundreds of municipal clients w/ wide variety of civil defense needs, extensively involved municipal litigation defense. 7 attys strictly devoted to local muni law & practice. Attys with diverse bkgnds & experience well suited to address unique & complex legal issues. Full-service law firm w/ unique expertise in local muni law and practice.	Offices in Michigan. Labor & employment group+municipal+education practice. 35 labor & employmt attys rep mgmt. Considered premier mgmt labor & employmt group. Wide range of expertise and experience to provide practical low-cost solutions to municipal clients' labor issues. Other major practice areas.	History of comprehensive, trial, comm, employmt and labor work spans two generations of practice, both employee & employer assn, pub & priv employee fringe benefit funds, nego contracts, interpreted contracts, all types of labor hrs from grievance procedures to full hrs in Fed Ct of Appeals. Exp in defense of employers all aspects of employmt litigation ie, discrimination, harassment, FMLA, ADA claims	Attys extensive exp all aspect of labor & employmt law & client counseling. Teams assigned to handle client matters on case by case & issue by issue basis. Team approach gives unique breadth of viewpts & exp to best meet client needs. Fed & St Cts, admin claims NLRB, MERC, MDCR, Dept of Labor Wage & Hr Div & MESC representation. Employment practice & admin reviews, audits & assignment training to help clients avoid issues & statutory violations.	Longest established, statewide law firm w/ extensive history of providing legal service to private/public sector clients. 7 Michigan offices. Top labor and employment practice group in Michigan. Since PERA in 1965, has represented public employers in all aspects of labor relations. Represent cities, counties, twps, ect before MERC in grievance arbitraiton, contract nego, litigation & adm hrs. Wk w/ employmt law has not been subject to challenge.
Firm's Philosophy relative to public sector labor negotiations	W/ each client, objective is to match atty's experience and expertise w/ legal matters involved. Do this because law has become so complex & every-changing that concentration & specialization is essential to provide excellent legal services in a cost effective & timely fashion. When a client engages firm to provide legal services, that client is engaging the collective expertise of all our attys.	Aggressively represent clients when dealing w/ unions, thorough preparation results in achievement of client's objectives. Strive to remain professional in all interactions w/ unions & employees which reduces time to nego & admin contracts. Goal is cost-effective deployment of veteran legal talent specializing in complex & fluid area of law. Strive to deliver optimal results through cost-effective & intelligent mgmt of litigation/non-litigation	All aspects of employmt law: counseling compensation & fringe benefits, hiring/ firing methods and policies, employee evaluation and discipline, worker's compensation, unemploymt ins matters, comprehensive services regarding appropiate private employee policies, draft employment contracts & severance agreements. Trial exp both State & Fed cts, served as arbitrators, mediators & admin law judges St & Fed Admin agencies. Negotiate collective bargaining agreements	Deal w/ employees & labor unions in manner that fully reflect policies & goals of employer. In any matter meet privately w/ employer to discuss issues, opts, risks so employer may select position. Aggressive advocacy & attn to detail, practical experience & thorough analysis & research are tools to every task. Clients receive favorable results, delivered expeditiously & in cost effective manner	Close working relationship w/ leadership to servce needs and practices. Approach to labor negotiations is to take all steps necessary to achieve City's goals while preserving good labor relations, or improve and enhance current labor relationship. We do not do our job effectively if we damage the fabric of your labor relations.
Number of current clients w/ similar services/capacity	Client list provided with approx 75 cities, counties, townships, villages. Client list also includes many prominent Fortune 500 companies, privately held and publically traded corporations & related entities	Hundreds of private sector; 16 govt entities and many school districts and college. Services 4 main categories: traditional labor law, litigation, employmt counseling & training and employmt benefits. Cities: Grosse Pte Shores, Lansing, Portland, Grand Rapids, Wyoming, Plainwell, Otsego, South Haven, St Joseph. Counties: Oakland, Wayne, Livingston, Ingham, Genesee & Lapeer.	Representative client list provided Private and Public Sector Public: Centerline, Batle Creek, Berkley, Clawson, Dearborn, Inkster, Lincoln Park, Marine City, Marysville, Monroe, New Baltimore, Pontiac, Waterford Twp, Wyandotte	Currently represent 30 clients in 179 active matters in a number of labor & employment areas including federal and state litigation, mgmt training, admin proceedings, manage & proactive counseling	Currently represent: Detroit, Detroit Public Schools, Ypsilanti Pub Library, SEMCOG, Capital Regional Airport Authority, Benton Harbor, Detroit Regional Convention Authority, Milan, Kalamazoo Twp, Kalamazoo, Lansing.

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Garan Lucow Miller, PC	Clark Hill	Sullivan Ward Asher & Patton PC	Kotz Sangster Wysocki & Berg PC	Miller Canfield
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI
Understanding of services; special qualifications and experience	High quality & effective representation before Michigan & Federal Courts & administrative agencies. Provide employers timely & effective advice regarding managing employees -- from senior executives to hourly workers.	Has reviewed and understands the summary of specifications contained in RFP, scope of services, professional approach expected by the City, the payment terms, mandatory requirements & selection criteria. Special qualifications and experience are provided.	Preeminent law firm to provide legal expertise regarding issues that arise concerning City's employees. Unique individual practice group structure - provides its clients w/ representation & attention of a boutique of law firm as well as the breadth of exp & depth or resources only the largest firms can provide.	Serves clients on a responsible partner basis. Major practice areas include labor & employmt law, construction law, mergers & acquisitions, corporate law, banking, real estate, estate planning & healthcare. Services of municipal entities, cts, schools, corps & financial institutions in collective bargaining, bargaining agmt enforcement, arbitration, Act 312 arbitration, employmt and civil rights litigation, tort litigation, FMLA & vet's rights compliance, disability accommodation, personnel and disciplinary issues	For labor relation & employmt legal serv - full range of legal services related to muni labor law, labor contract nego & litigation- provide cost effective & high qual legal counsel; expert at navigating political, financial & legal factors; problem solvers; tough stance but maintain employmt & public relationships; Spot legal problems before they arise to keep costs down.
Summary of municipal experience and qualifications:					
Labor and Employment Law Compliance	Help client minimize employment risks; updating personnel policies & procedures, drafting handbooks; downsizing efforts; termination	Advise clients labor & employmt matters to avoid legal problems: daily basis, union avoidance training, anti-harassmt training, employment audits for compl w/ Fed & MI employment laws, free monthly webinars emerging laws, E-alerts w/ new legislative, admin, case law	Has represented Centerline in all areas. Extensive experience representing public & private sector employments in all aspects of labor relations incl collective bargaining, practice before NLRB, representation elections, grievances and arbitration. Attys served as arbitrators, mediators & admin law judges both St and Fed admin agencies. Negotiated & enforced hundred of collective bargaining agreements. Represented clients in every type of labor hrg from informal grievance procedures to full hearings in Fed Ct of Appeals	Employer side employment and traditional labor law	Represent a number of municipalities & govt entitied; extensive expertise MERC practice; well-versed in Act 312, FLSA, ERISA, FMLA, ADA, Title VII, ELCRA & other civil rights issues, compliance w/ all employmt statutes & regulations
Labor Negotiations	Collective bargaining Contract negotiations	Bargained hundreds pub sector collective bargaining agreements (and private). Dev, implement strategies, mediation, fact finding, 312 arbitration. Chief negotiator, avoid strikes, nego contracts to meet client's objectives/wkpl harmony		For private/public sector clients negotiate and/or draft individual employment contracts.	Routinely handle negotiation for public/private sector clients, nationally & locally to fit client's needs-as chief spokesman bargaining team members or as a round the clock resource
Labor Contract Administration	Advise municipalities regarding issues raised in collective bargaining agreements in a manner that ensures fair terms for the municipality	Advise admin collective bargaining agreements. Objective insure clients' rights are enforced while avoiding any antagonism. Help clients interpret & comply w/ collective bargaining agmt to avoid unnecessary, costly & time consuming grievances		Contract interpretation/administration	Attys are experts in providing advice on contract interpretation, resolution of disputes, nego and drafting of memorandum of understanding and responding to requests for information
Public Act 312 Arbitration		Several attys w/ 312 arbitration & fact finding experience; achieved savings in healthcare & employee related costs. Combine private sector exp into a comprehensive case; realistic contracts		Michigan Act 312 (police and fire-fighter interest arbitration) Representation at MDCR/EEOC, MESC	312 proceedings involving firefighters & public safety officers - AFSCME/POLC/POAM/COAM

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Garan Lucow Miller, PC	Clark Hill	Sullivan Ward Asher & Patton PC	Kotz Sangster Wysocki & Berg PC	Miller Canfield
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI
Grievance Arbitration		Hundreds of labor arbitrations, help formulate responses to union grievances, convinced union no merit before arbitration, help select arbitrators, representation during hrg, draft briefs, appealed, addressed issues of contract interpretation.		Contract grievance administration and arbitration.	Public sect representation before MERC in grievance arbitration, contract nego, litigation & admin hrgs. Wk on subject to challenge. Experts in all facets of employmt law, incld Fed Wage/Hr, FMLA, ADA, ELCRA, PWDCRA, Title VII, HIPAA & ERISA. Exclusively represents mgmt
Unfair Labor Practice Charges	Employment Discrimination Workers Compensation	Representation MERC, NLRB, other agencies, dev strategy to defend charge, position stmt, rep at hrg, success in negotiation with MERC, NLRB & unions Exp handling union organizing campaigns - pro-active approach		Advice in areas of discrimination and disparate treatment, harassment & hostile environment, FMLA/ADA compliance and accommodation	Represent employers NLRB on range of issues incld unfair labor practices. Same services under MERC
Civil Rights & Equal Employment Opportunity Compliance	Federal and State Statutes including civil rights and equal employment opportunity, whistle blower protection act, Elliott Larsen civil rights act, veterans preference act, ADA	Policies to avoid as many employmt-related pitfalls as possible; practical solutions to wkpl problems; guidance to avoidance		Federal and State Court proceedings, EEOC and MDCR involving matters of negligent hiring & supervision, discrimination and harassment, FMLA, ADA, enforcement of non-compete agmts and breach of contract claims	Firm Attys are erperts in all facets of employmt law, incld Fed Wage/Hr, FMLA, ADA, ELCRA, PWDCRA, Title VII, HIPAA & ERISA. Exclusively represents mgmt
Employee Benefits Administration	All areas of law including coordination of benefits disputes and ERISA litigation.	Counsel on benefit matters ERISA, IRS compliance, exe compensation, benefit plans, deferred compensation, fringe benefit plans, welfare plans, HRAs, health plans. Complete line of employee benefit services	Turn key firm relative to employee benefit admin: Trustee mtgs, gen admin, ord, wk comp, IRS, resolutions, legal opinions, advice FOIA, open mtgs, tax advice, RFP & nego, coordination legal reqs, representation in all litigation matters	Wage and fringe benefits employee counseling	ERISA. Defense of employers in pension & benefit claims. Work closely w/ firm's tax department. Cafeteria plans, deferred comp, exe comp & contracts, pensions & retirement plans, summary plan descriptions
Subcontracted Services	None	May hire experts as needed ie., psychologist, mitigation expert, forensic economist	Not anticipated	None	None
Methods of Communication	Guarantee a rep of firm available in-person or by any other method of communication on any labor or employmt matter that may arise	Crucial component of representation, phone & email message, reports, webinars, newsltrs, prefer team approach	Strive to be in constant contact; return all phone calls day rec'd, written comm, monthly mtgs, cell phones	Readily available through all methods of communication - telephone, fax, email and cell phone weekdays, nights and weekends	Available 24/7. In-person mtgs, email, telephone, cell phone & other mobile communication technology.

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSALS TABULATION

NAME	Garan Lucow Miller, PC	Clark Hill	Sullivan Ward Asher & Patton PC	Kotz Sangster Wysocki & Berg PC	Miller Canfield
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI	Southfield, MI	Detroit, MI	Detroit, MI
Policy regarding errors or omissions	Professional Liability Coverage	Legal malpractice policy	Perform on professional level; comply w/ all laws, regs, ord & reqs of govt	General Liability/ Workers Compensation Insurance	Resolved to satisfaction of client
Grievance(s) filed	No	No	No	No	None at this time
Attorneys debarred in firm	None	No	None	No	No
All attorneys members of State Bar of Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	All attys assigned to RH - Yes
Attys admitted to State Bar of Michigan	Jordan - 1994	Thomas Brady 1980 John Gierak 1976 Jeffrey Steele 1994 Anne-Marie Welch 2006 Edward Hammond 1987 Gauthier 2002	Anthony Asher 1966 Michael Asher 1986 Jacqueline Kelly 1988 Cynthia Billings 1996 David Selwocki 1994, Matthew Henzi 1997 Douglas Lash 2006	Matthew Derby 1987 John Below 1993 Heather Ptasznik 2001 Donna Heiser 1994	John Willens 1980 C Trebilcock 2000 M Crockett 2000 C Oxender 2000 L Given 1971
All legal staff in good standing w/ the State Bar of Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes		Yes
Contract required	No	Standard Retention letter	Various	Yes	Yes
Billing Procedures	Monthly. Legal services plus reimbursables	Monthly for fees & disbursement	Monthly, net 30 days	Monthly billing statements; net 30 days	Monthly - time track by 1/10th hour
Litigation	Information provided	Information provided	Information provided	Information Provided	Information Provided

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSAL TABULATION

NAME	Floyd E. Allen & Associates, PC	Butzel Long	Johnson Rosati	Kemp Klein
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Years in Business	23 years	155 years	16 years	38 years
Years providing labor & employment		44 years	16 years	35 years representing RH
Historical Narrative	Roots in public/private sector labor & employmt defense work. Negotiation, collective bargaining agmts, rep mgmt interest in arbitrations & other labor proceedings. Successful grievance & arbitration record. St & Fed Cts and admin agencies incl NLRB, MERC, MESC & EEOC. Attorneys specialize in employmt litigation, discrimination claims, FLSA, Whistle Blower, OSHA & WARN lawsuits. Proactive-avoid liability & litigation. HR policies & procedures for compliance	One of Country's largest law firms. Publ & Priv sector employers - collective bargaining, Act 312 proceedings, fact-find, mediation, union rep campaigns & elections, unfair labor practices cases, strikes incl injunctions in St/Fed Cts & arbitrations, counsel clients FLSA, FMLA, civil rights, constitutional rights, Veterans Preference Act, USERRA, litigation success all types employmt actions to Fed Ct of Appeals, US Supreme Ct., Counseling & training, managing risk	Began in 1993 with 11 exp, like-minded attys; today 19 attys. Municipal clients labor nego, grievance arbitrations, Act 312 arbitrations, fact findings, MERC hrgs, civil jury trials & other labor-related subjs & disputes. Cornerstone of practice has been representing Michigan municipalities. Sensitive to needs of such clients, particularly in difficult economic times. Unique insight into labor & employmt issues faced by municipal clients.	1975 Beer, Boltz & Bennia labor & employmt firm rep private/public including Avon Twp. Merged w/ Kemp Flein & Endelman in 1978 forming Kemp Klein Firm. Merger provided Kemp Klein w/ legal capabilities in labor and employment law. Kemp Klein continues to represent public & private employers including RH and OPC
Firm's Philosophy relative to public sector labor negotiations	Collect financial/operating data including wage, cost & performance data of similarly situated casinos; conduct an analysis of grievance arbitration activity, collect data from labor mgmt activity, identify issues w/ mgmt bargaining team, est goals & priorities for nego, opening position, draft proposal & responses, defend against any grievances/unfair labor practices, draft the final agreement	Wk w/ municipal clients to prepare & present bargaining proposals that reflect econ relativity. Goal to reach agreement on a new labor contract in a non antagonistic atmosphere if can be done within City's financial & other goals.	Thorough analysis of current collective bargaining agreements & policies to assist City in presenting most cost-effective services, while striving to maintain reasonable wages & benefits for employees. Firm views itself as resource & primary spokesperson for City's negotiating team. Relies on accuracy of info, persuasiveness of positions it espouses & its willingness to listen	Collective bargaining - interest-based approach; develop relationship & mutual credibility w/ unions. Job of labor negotiator is to obtain best deal possible for client considering all circumstances. War w/ unions too time consuming & expensive. Current economics of pub employers, negotiator's job provide facts & convince unions that economic problems are real and will not be a contract w/o concessions
Number of current clients w/ similar services/capacity	100% of firm's clients are currently provided the services RH seeks. Rep and advise municipalities, bds & committees, officials full range of muni law areas, incid contracts, labor relations & employmt, ord drafting, elections, prop taxation, tax increment financing, eminent domain, litigation & regulation, incl land use & enf matters. General counsel to municipalities, drafting by-laws, developent applications, hearings	Oakland Cty, Bloomfield Twp, BI Hills, Oscoda Twp, Ypsilanti Twp, Washtenaw Cty, UM, Mich Tech UN, Schoolcraft Coll, Henry Ford Comm Coll, UD Mercy, Oakland Comm Coll, OU, Monroe Cty Comm Coll, Eastern MI Un, Washtenaw Cty Comm College - expertise in all aspects of public sector labor relations. Also list of private sector clients provided.	Labor Counsel: Harper Woods, Richmond Twp, Oakland Cty Comm Mental Health Auth, Clark Const Co, Jackson Transit Auth, Cent Wayne Cty Sanitation Auth, MMRMA. Muni Atty: Harper Woods, Orchard Lake, Taylor, Green Oak Twp, Highland Twp, Orion Twp, Richmond Twp. Gen Counsel to municipal associations. Prof Relationship Labor Matters: Ingham, Linvingston and Shiawassee Counties, City of Warren; Prior Rochester Hills representation	Kemp Klein provides labor and employment services to dozens of clients. Tom Boyer is chief negotiator for six collective bargaining agreements

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSAL TABULATION

NAME	Floyd E. Allen & Associates, PC	Butzel Long	Johnson Rosati	Kemp Klein
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Client References	Detroit Medical Center	County of Oakland	Township of Richmond	City of Rochester Hills
	Cobo Conference & Exhibition Center	Bloomfield Twp	City of Harper Woods	Older Persons' Commission
	Detroit Transportation Company	Bloomfield Hills	Oakland Cty Comm Mental Health Auth	Turri's Italian Foods
	County of Wayne	McDonald's Corporation	Jackson Transit Authority	Jani-King International
	Wayne County Community College Dist.	Oscoda Township	Central Wayne Cty Sanitation Authority	West Bloomfield Parks & Rec Authority
	Greektown Casino	A&P/Farmer Jack	Highland Township	Ralph Wilson Agency
	Detroit Public Schools	Rite Aid Corporation	County of Monroe	Rierner Floors
	School District of City of Pontiac		City of Keego Harbor	Spalding DeDecker
	Ecorse Public Schools		City of Riverview	United Paint & Chemical Corporation
	Southfield Public Schools		Waterford Township	Servicar of Michigan
	Wayne Regional Educational Services Agency		MMRMA	
Total personnel for firm:				
Professional:	10	211	19	38
Non-Professional:	3	143	15	43
Experience and Qualifications of Lead Attorney and other personnel to be assigned to RH	Floyd Allen-25 yrs-emplmt relations adm bus & govt, Dir Labor Rel & Wage Amin Det, ind Rel Mgr Ford, DMC reduced fees S Ayer-partner-pub/priv employers-grievance arbitrations, unfair pract, ct proceedings, emplmt/labor laws, contracts	Malcolm Brown-30 yrs-public/private sector. Oakland County (25 yrs)-nego OCSD, 312 arbitration, unfair labor, health care, retiree health & mods, dischr & discipline, contract nego, strategies, etc. Bl Twp (15 yrs) nego contract, Act 312	Patrick Aseityne-36 yrs, MI asst atty gen, labor, emply, muni law, coll bargaining, grievances, unfair labor prac, MERC elect, fact findings, arbitrations, nego, 312 arbitrations, St/Fed Cts, MDCR, MERC	Thomas Boyer-34 yrs RH, will perform wk, not transfer to Jr staff, shareholder, labor law, emplmt relations & civil rights, union rep, coll bargaining, unemplmt comp, wage claims, personel policies & manuals, wrongful dischr, disciplinary actions, pub/private sector, mgmt training seminars
	G Mesritz-of counsel-30 yrs, Fed St Cts admin agencies, civil rights, discrim, ADA	Schwartz, Patterson, Stanley-assist Brown exp labor & emply matters-muni exp	L Amtsbuechler-25 yrs, OC asst pros atty, employment litigation	Mark Filipp-27 yrs shareholder, emplmt cases & wrongful dischr, discrim, harassmt, retaliatory, defamation, whistleblower,
	NLRA, Fair Labor Standards Act	John Hancock-reps Ypsilanti Twp &	S Randall Field-29 yrs emplmt litigation defense PD, discrim, harassmt, wrongful dischr, constitutional viol, Wkplace	NMDCR, EEOC, Employment Agreements
	K Bobo, Sr Assoc-20 yrs-ins defense, mgmt side emplmt law, criminal law, former asst pros atty, public safety emplmt	Washtenaw County-labor, emplmt & benefit issues	Daniel Klemptner-4 yrs asst city atty Flint	Ronald Nixon-12 yrs, Business & Emplmt disputes, appellate pract & litigation
	C Harris-of counsel-gen litigation fed & St cts-12 yrs, Lead Counsel Det Bd of Ed.	Schreier, McGuire, Jane & Other employees Benefits & retiree healthcare issues relating to public sector. Benefit Plans	Defend employment lawsuit, retaliation, discrim, hostile wkpl, wrongful termination, personnel policies, investigation,	Gloria Chon-1 yr- helps business owners plan, nego & manage corp matters & execute transacitons
	E Moore-Sr Assoc, defense litigation PI, emplmt, labor nego, discrim, harassment, St Ct & admin tribunals, EEOC, MDCR, HUD and others	Retiree Healthcare obligations & other benefit issues	MDCR, EEOC, US Dept of Justice	

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSAL TABULATION

NAME	Floyd E. Allen & Associates, PC	Butzel Long	Johnson Rosati	Kemp Klein
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Understanding of services; special qualifications and experience	2009 Super Lawyers Emplmt & Labor, Former Dir Lab Rel & Wge Admin-Det, Mgr Industrial Relations-Ford Motor Co, Gen Counsel to DMC, Asst Prosecutor for Oak Cty Pros Office, Lead counsel over multi-million dollar CIP, Lead counsel school bds for Det, Ecorse & Wayne Reg, Mediator for Wayne County Mediation Services, over 60 yrs combined exp to pub & private sector clients	Can provide all requested services in prof efficient & cost effective manner. Specializes in all areas including labor & emplmt law. Labor atty services incld Act 312 arbitraiton, contract admin, & handling any grievances incl arbitration, non-union organizing drive, MERC petition, unfair labor practices. Emplmt Law Matters: Vets Pref, civil rights, constitutional rights, FMLA, FLSA, employee benefits, retiree healthcare, other issues.	Obtain labor/emplmt services from one qualified source; Firm's skill-set particularly adept focusing on labor/emplmt needs & those specific to govt setting. Devotion to advising & defend muni. Exposure to all branches, levels, divisions of local govts across state; carefully analyze outcomes not previously considered; broad understanding muni relationships; cost-effective approach; cutting-edge of advancing proactive model. Training at no charge to clients.	Boyer will provide services: labor & related emplmt advice & assistance, nego & draft collective bargaining agmts, grievance admin, litigation unfair labor chrsgs, Fed/St statutes, compl reviews, updates legislation, labor-mgmt committees, alternative dispute resolution, assist HR conducting mtgs or lead discussions w/ mgmt, etc, contract admin, attend mtgs CC, Mayor, dept dir & others confer legal advice on labor and emplmt matters. Guarantee 24 hr response
Summary of municipal experience and qualifications:				
Labor and Employment Law Compliance	FLSA exp, HIPPA, COBRA & ERISA reqs exp, FMLA cases, MIOSH defense, personnel policies, school lobbying for new legislation, Nego contr for sheriff depts, investigations harassmt, defense tort liab, nego labor agmts, representation Act 312, mediation & fact finding	Extensive exp advised municipalities & others concerning their rights under labor contracts, employee rights under the Constitution, Vet Preference Act, civil rights laws, Fair Labor Standards Act & FMLA & others	Deal w/ real-life concerns of muni on daily basis, exposed to essentially every area of labor & emplmt litigation; capable of instituting a myriad of measures to limit liability, lectured, published articles & updates concerning relevant topic	Ext exp St/Fed labor & emplmt law compliance incl MERA, Mich Elliott Larsen Civil Rights Act, Mich Persons Disabilities, Mich Payment Wages, Fringe Benefit Act, Fed Fair Labor Stand, Fed Civil Rights Act, Fed ADA, Fed Age Discrim, FMLA, Fed HIPPA
Labor Negotiations	Seasoned negotiators, different techniques, varying approaches to contract negotiation as appropriate in given situations. Practical advise typical to situation, dev reasonable & effective negotiating positions	Nego labor contract pub & priv. Currently negotiating 7 labor contract in Oak Cty and labor contract nego for BI Hills. Nego for Ypsilanti Twp for Fire Union. (Brown and Hancock)	Labor Disputes & Nego: Warren, Harper Woods, Oak Cty Comm Mental Health Auth, Wayne Cty. Arbitration & Nego: AFSCME, POLC, FOP, POAM, IAFF, OPEIU, Teamsters 129, Steelworkers & others	Engaged in negotiations including collective bargaining w/ labor unions hundreds of time for many employers especially RH
Labor Contract Administration	Drafting, reviewing & negotiating contracts for broad spectrum of clients in variety of contexts. Routinely prepare contracts & advise client on the protocols for their use; assist in reviewing contracts presented to clients.	Regularly interpret labor contracts & advise clients concerning same & handle labor arbitrations on regular & routine basis	Contract Administration services to all their municipal clients listed through written (formal) and verbal opinions on number of topics	Engaged in labor contract administration continuously over 30 years
Public Act 312 Arbitration	Exp rep, consulting & reporting to Mayor of Det, Det Pol Chief, Det City Council & Corp Counsel Det on emplmt litigation, muni liability, extensive Act 312 exp in rep Detroit Police	Brown completed extensive 312 arbitration for Oakland Cty. 312 awards w/ regard to BI Twp & BI Hills within last 18 mos.	Recently completed four PA 312 arbitrations through decision & currently in process of trying a fifth. Prepared for others, which were resolved prior to hearing	Fully engaged in all aspects of preparation for Act 312 Arbitrations for RH. None of these Act 312 cases were actually arbitrated. Negotiated settlements were reached prior to hearings

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSAL TABULATION

NAME	Floyd E. Allen & Associates, PC	Butzel Long	Johnson Rosati	Kemp Klein
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Grievance Arbitration	Routinely represent clients involved in all types of litigation, ie, emplymt matters, discrim, education issues, comm leases, real est, Dept Labor, Wage & Hr, MESC, MCRC, EEOC, EPA, OFCCP	Regularly handle grievance & arbitrations in both the public & private sectors. Brown currently handling 3 arbitrations for Oakland County	Since early 1980's represented many muni clients regarding issues involving dischr, various levels of discipline & contract interpretation at grievance arbitrations under auspices of AAA, FMCSor an ad hoc designation	Litigated on behalf of RH at every grievance arbitration since 1975. Conducted grievance arbitrations for several other clients.
Unfair Labor Practice Charges	Regularly defends employers in arbitration proceedings involving all aspects of labor & employment matters	Unfair labor practice charges in both pub/priv sectors. Brown & Schwartz handled 10 unfair labor practice matters for Oakland County, Brown for Bl Twp.	Since early 1980's firm lawyers represented countless municipal clients before the MERC regarding issues pursuant Sectionn 10 of PERA	Handled unfair labor practice charges before MERC and NLRB
Civil Rights & Equal Employment Opportunity Compliance	Defense numerous Admin agencies- MERC, NLRB, MESC, MCRD & EEOC, for discrim, unfair labor practice, unemployment appeals, complaints, EEO charges & Worker's Compensation	Exp handling affirmative action plans, civil rights charges & other civil rights compliance issues. Regularly advise pub & priv sector clients on these issues.	Traditional labor consulting; govt defense chrgs & accusations of this type, perform int compl investigations, publications & seminars, reviewed, revised, prepared, provided & advised upon implementation of internal policies & procedures	Advised many clients as to civil rights & equal opportunity compl, avoidance of admin claims & lawsuits; handled scores of MDCR and EEOC charges and discrimination lawsuits
Employee Benefits Administration		Issued extensive memoranda analyzing healthcare obligation of Ironwood & Bl Hills. Similar memo prepared for Genesee Cty. Regularly advises muni clients & priv sector clients on benefit issues. 7 lawyers to practice employee benefit law on a full-time basis.	Extensive exp drafting, revising, amending, interpreting & enforcing Ordinance of municipalites in Mich, which govern adm of public employee benefits; knowledge in navigating due process hrg framewk; maintaining efficient schematic of public retiree system per ord, coll barg agmts	Significant experience regarding medical, life, disability and live insurance benefits as well as retirement plans and paid time off
Subcontracted Services	None	William Rye-Act 312 exhibits \$120/hr Amy Sullivan wage surveys \$60/hr	No subcontract directly through firm. Advise City obtain separate counsel on Municipal Bond matters and services related to revising & administering Employee Health-Benefit plans	None
Methods of Communication	Email, fax, mtgs, telephone conference, etc. - 24 hr response through email	Telephone generally used, email, verbal, by memorandum or formal opinion letters.	Consistely accessible to clients, emails, phone calls, written correspondence, status reports, Smart-Phones. Satisfy RH 24 hour response requirement	Employ all methods of communication including face-to-face mtgs, telephone, fax and computerized messaging

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT ATTORNEY SERVICES

PROPOSAL TABULATION

NAME	Floyd E. Allen & Associates, PC	Butzel Long	Johnson Rosati	Kemp Klein
ADDRESS	Detroit, MI	Bloomfield Hills, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Policy regarding errors or omissions	Professional Liability Insurance	Errors or omissions would be discussed with the City	Insurance declaration	Try to avoid errors or omissions, but should they occur, prepared to immediately correct them & compensate RH if pertinent
Grievance(s) filed	No	Malcolm Brown - No	No	Many years ago 2 filed against their lawyers, both dismissed immediately after being filed
Attorneys debarred in firm	No	No	No	No
All attorneys members of State Bar of Michigan	Yes	Yes - all in Michigan	Yes	Yes
Attys admitted to State Bar of Michigan	Allen 1980; Ayer 1998, Mesritz 1977, Bobo 1985, Harris 1995, Moore 1998, Johnson 2001, Campbell 2003, Hunter 2007, Floyd 2008	Brown 1972, Schwartz 1984 Patterson 1986, Stanley 1998 Hancock 1973, Schreier 1987 McGuire 1997, Jane, 2006 Randle 2008	Patrick Asetyne 1973 Laura Amtsbuechler 1984 Randall Field 1980 Daniel Klemptner 2005	Thomas Boyer 1975 Mark Filipp 1982 Ronald Nixon 1997 Gloria Chon 2008
All legal staff in good standing w/ the State Bar of Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Contract required	Standard Letter of Engagement	Customized retention ltr; standardized terms and conditions	No	No
Billing Procedures	Usually monthly billings; net 30 days	Monthly for atty hrs & expenses	Monthly basis. Hours in increments of 1/10/hr. No minimum charge	Detailed invoice monthly; net 30 days Services and out-of-pocket expenses
Litigation	Information provided	Information provided	Information provided	Information Provided