



Department of Planning and Development

Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

May 4, 2021

1481 Dutton – Window Sash Replacement	
REQUEST	Certificate of Appropriateness to replace double-hung sash in 16 windows with new wood sash
APPLICANT	Brian Meier
FILE NO.	HDC # 21-011
PARCEL NO.	70-15-04-204-004
ZONING	R-E – Single family residential
HISTORIC DISTRICT	William Fox House, 1481 Dutton
STAFF	Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

In this Report:

Request 1

Historical Information..... 2

Review Considerations..... 2

Summary 2

Potential Motion..... 2

Request

This is an application for the replacement of the double-hung window sash with new thermopane sash that are wood with a Fibrex covering. The property contains a house constructed c. 1884, a garage and a privy, both constructed at an unknown date. According to the 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* the house is known as the William Fox House.

The subject property is located on the south side of Dutton Road just west of Livernois on the city’s north border. It is a non-contiguous single property district. The applicant is proposing to replace all of the window sash in the house with new wood thermopane window sash with composite exterior cladding. All interior and exterior window trim will remain in place. The applicant states that the existing window sash are not original, warped, cracked, and not thermally effective. Existing wood storm windows will remain in place. Aluminum storm windows will be removed.

Historical Information

The 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* does not provide any historic information on the house and property other than noting that it is the William Fox House constructed about 1884 and fits within the architecture context for the city.

Review Considerations

The proposal is to replace the one-over-one wood sash in all 16 windows of the house. According to the owner the existing windows are cracked, warped, broken, and do not open due to many layers of paint. He states that the windows are not original to the house and rattle due to the proximity of Dutton Road. No exterior or interior trim will be removed. The new sash will be one-over-one wood thermopane windows with a composite exterior cladding. The wood storm windows at the first floor will be retained. The aluminum storm windows will be removed.

The applicant has indicated that the following materials will be used for the project:

1. Anderson Woodwright wood sash with composite exterior cladding.

Summary

1. The property is a single resource non-contiguous district, the William Fox House, constructed about 1884 and is significant for its architecture.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the one-over-one sash in all 16 windows of the house with new one-over-one wood thermopane sash with a composite exterior cladding (Anderson 400 Series Woodwright). The interior and exterior window trim will remain in place. The new sash will have the same configuration as the existing sash.
3. Staff offers the following comments on the proposed window replacement. The owner states that the windows are not original to the house which based on the photographs provided appears to be accurate. The photos provided show older wood sash with broken glass and some cracked wood. If the Commission concurs that the windows are not original, are deteriorated beyond repair, and the new sash match the existing, the proposal meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
4. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

Potential Motions

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

MOTION, in the matter of File No. HDC 21-011, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the window sash in 16 windows with thermopane wood windows with composite exterior cladding as proposed at 1481 Dutton Road, the William Fox House, Parcel Identification Number **70-15-04-204-004**, with the following Findings and Conditions:

- 1) The existing windows **are/are not** deteriorated beyond repair and **are/are not** original to the house;
- 2) The proposed new window sash **do/do not** match the window sash being replaced;
- 3) The proposed window sash replacement **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard number 6 as follows:

6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*