



Planning and Economic Development

Sara Roediger, AICP, Director

From: Kristen Kapelanski, AICP
Date: 11/13/2019
Re: **Redwood at Rochester Hills (City File 18-022)**
PUD Concept Plan - Planning Review #6

The applicant is proposing an attached housing unit development comprised of 121 residential units on a 29.95-acre site located near the southeast corner of Avon and Dequindre. The project was reviewed for conformance with the City of Rochester Hills Zoning Ordinance. The comments below and in other review letters are minor in nature and can be incorporated into a final site plan submittal for review by staff after review by the Planning Commission.

1. **Background:** This item was considered at the October 15, 2019 Planning Commission meeting. At that meeting, the Planning Commission postponed consideration due to a number of outstanding concerns which are detailed below. This review has been updated to incorporate the proposed plan changes in response to those concerns.
 - The applicant has provided the requested color renderings and landscape plan.
 - The plan has been updated to remove the three basins near the proposed units in exchange for mechanical treatment of the stormwater in some parts of the site. This has allowed for the addition of two units, bringing the total number of units to 121.
 - The elevations have been updated to incorporate additional stone and masonry material, as requested.
2. **PUD Requirements** (*Section 138-7.100-108*). The PUD option is intended to permit flexibility in development that is substantially in accordance with the goals and objectives of the City's Master Land Use Plan at the discretion of the City Council. The PUD development shall be laid out so that the various land uses and building bulk will relate to each other and to adjoining existing and planned uses in such a way that they will be compatible, with no material adverse impact of one use on another. The PUD option seeks to:
 - Encourage innovation to provide variety in design layout
 - Achieve economy and efficiency in the use of land, natural resources, energy and the provision of public services and utilities
 - Encourage the creation of useful open spaces
 - Provide appropriate housing, employment, service and shopping opportunities

The PUD option can permit:

- Nonresidential uses of residentially zoned areas
- Residential uses of nonresidential zoned areas
- Densities or lot sizes that are different from the applicable district(s)
- The mixing of land uses that would otherwise not be permitted; provided that other objectives are met and the resulting development will promote the public health, safety and welfare

Review Process

The PUD review process consists of a two step process as follows:

- a. **Step One: Concept Plan.** The PUD concept plan is intended to show the location of site improvements, buildings, utilities, and landscaping with a level of detail sufficient to convey the overall layout and impact of the development. The PUD concept plan is not intended to demonstrate compliance with all ordinance requirements, but rather is intended to establish the overall layout of the development, including the maximum number of units which may be developed. This step requires a Planning Commission public hearing and recommendation to City Council followed by review by the City Council.

- b. **Step Two: Site Plan/PUD Agreement.** The second step in the process is to develop full site plans based on the approved PUD concept plan and to submit the PUD Agreement. At this time, the plans are reviewed for compliance with all City ordinance requirements, the same as any site plan. This step requires a Planning Commission recommendation to City Council followed by review by the City Council.

Qualification Criteria

Section 138-7.102 sets forth the criteria that a PUD must meet. Each of the criterion are listed below in italics, followed by staff comments on the proposed PUD's compliance with each.

- a. The PUD option shall not be used for the sole purpose of avoiding applicable requirements of this ordinance. The proposed activity, building or use not normally permitted shall result in an improvement to the public health, safety, and welfare in the area affected. *The development of smaller rental units provides some diversity in housing stock for the community, which traditionally has been developed with larger subdivision and site condominium lots. Additionally, single story rental units with attached garages allow for a greater diversity of housing options for residents looking to rent but still looking for single-family features, like an attached garage.*
- b. The PUD option shall not be utilized in situations where the same land use objectives can be accomplished by the application of conventional zoning provisions or standards. *There are potentially several variances under conventional zoning that may be required including overall density. Through the use of the PUD, the City has the ability to be flexible with regulations in return for development that is above and beyond conventional development.*
- c. The PUD option may be used only when the proposed land use will not materially add service and facility loads beyond those contemplated in the master land use plan. The applicant must demonstrate to the satisfaction of the City that the added loads will be accommodated or mitigated by the applicant as part of the PUD. *The Master Plan calls for residential units at 3 units per acre for the property. The proposed residential units are greater than the planned density at 3.97 units per acre, but the Department of Public Services and public safety departments have not expressed a concern regarding impacts to the road system and City utilities. The Engineering Department will conduct a full review of public utility and service needs during step two site plan review.*
- d. The PUD shall meet as many of the following objectives as may be deemed appropriate by the City: The PUD is not required to comply with all of the items listed in this criterion; it is up to the judgment of the Planning Commission and City Council to determine if the proposed development provides adequate benefit that would not otherwise be realized. In this instance, it may be the development of a desired land use to provide diversity in housing options in the City.
1. To preserve, dedicate or set aside open space or natural features due to their exceptional characteristics or their environmental or ecological significance in order to provide a permanent transition or buffer between land uses, or to require open space or other desirable features of a site beyond what is otherwise required in this ordinance. *The site falls under the tree conservation ordinance and contains regulated wetlands and steep slopes. The plans indicate the majority of the regulated wetlands and steep slopes will be preserved. Additional information on wetland and mitigation is provided in the ASTI review dated September 5, 2019. Additional information on tree preservation and impacts is provided later in this review.*
 2. To guarantee the provision of a public improvement that would not otherwise be required to further the public health, safety or welfare, protect existing uses or potential future uses in the vicinity of the proposed development from the impact of a proposed use, or alleviate an existing or potential problem relating to public facilities. *A pathway has been provided along Dequindre Road, as required. Additionally, the applicant has expressed their intention to work with the City on the installation of a pressure reducing valve and the provision of an easement to accommodate the valve. See the engineering review letter dated September 5, 2019 for additional information.*
 3. To promote the goals and objectives of the Master Land Use Plan and other applicable long range plans such as the Master Thoroughfare Plan. *The proposed project promotes the following goals and objectives of the Master Land Use Plan and other applicable long range plans:*
 - (a) *Provide a diversity of housing types and sizes to meet the needs of people of different ages, incomes and lifestyles within the community.*
 - (b) *Encourage the mixture of residential types of residential uses that are compatible with the established character of the surrounding neighborhood.*

- (c) *Provide a safe, efficient non-motorized pathway system that provides links to various land uses throughout the City.*
4. To facilitate development consistent with the Regional Employment Center goals, objectives, and design standards in the City's Master Land Use Plan. *Not applicable.*
 5. To preserve and appropriately redevelop unique or historic sites. *Not applicable.*
 6. To permanently establish land use patterns that are compatible with or will protect existing or planned uses. *As previously noted, the development of single story rental units at the proposed density at this location is a logical use, providing diversity in housing stock for the community.*
 7. To provide alternative uses for parcels that can provide transition or buffers to residential areas and to encourage redevelopment of sites where an orderly transition or change of use is desirable. *The use of the PUD option to provide single story rental units allows for a type of housing that is lacking in the City. A plan that illustrates how the site could be developed under the current zoning district has been provided as a comparison.*
 8. To enhance the aesthetic appearance of the City through quality building design and site development. *While significant portions of the site do include front entry garages, the applicant has made an effort to incorporate side entry garages into portions of the site, particularly in those areas facing public rights-of-way.*

The Planning Commission and City Council should only be evaluating the major elements of the development such as density, layout, and building design with the understanding that the details will be reviewed during step 2 of the process, with the burden being on the applicant to maintain compliance with the overall layout and density approved with the PUD Concept Plan.

3. **PUD Concept Plan** (Section 138-7.105). The following items must be submitted as part of the PUD concept plan submittal:
 - a. Any deed restrictions or restrictive covenants associated with the property.
 - b. A written statement explaining in detail the applicant's full intentions under the PUD option including the type of dwelling units or uses contemplated and resulting population, floor area, parking and supporting documentation, including the intended schedule of development.
 - c. Written verification from the owner of the property that the applicant is authorized to pursue a PUD.
4. **Zoning and Land Use** (Section 138-4.300 and 138.7.103). The site is zoned R-3 One Family Residential District with the MR Mixed Residential Overlay. The applicant would need to develop under the MR Overlay, rezone the site to RM-1 Multiple Family Residential or develop the site with a PUD option. Refer to the table below for the zoning and existing and future land use designations for the proposed site and surrounding parcels.

	Zoning	Existing Land Use	Future Land Use*
Proposed Site	R-3 One Family Residential with MR Mixed Residential Overlay	Vacant single family home	Residential 3 with Mixed Residential Overlay
North	B-2 General Business with MR Mixed Residential Overlay & R-1 One Family Residential	Single Family Home and Bloomer Park	Residential 3 with Mixed Residential Overlay and Park
South	R-3 One Family Residential	Vacant	Landfill
East	B-3 Shopping Center Business with MR Mixed Residential Overlay & R-3 One Family Residential with MR Mixed Residential Overlay	Vacant	Residential 3 with Mixed Residential Overlay
West	R-3 One Family Residential	Vacant	Landfill

*Plan submitted under previous Master Plan for Land Use

5. **Site Design and Layout** (Section 138-5.100-101, Section 138-8.400-402 and 138-8.500-502). Refer to the table below as it relates to the area, setback, and building requirements of this project. For purposes of this review, the proposed plan was reviewed in accordance with the requirements of the MR Overlay as that is the most similar zoning district for what is being proposed.

Requirement	Proposed	Staff Comments
Parcel Area 10 acres	29.96 acres	In compliance
Density 3.45 units/acre	3.97 units/acre	Not in compliance – this standard can be modified as part of the PUD
Max. Height 2.5 stories/30 ft.	20 ft.	In compliance
Min. Perimeter Front Setback (Dequindre Rd.) 20 ft.	30 ft.	In compliance
Min. Perimeter Front Setback (Avon Rd.) 20 ft.	100 ft. +	In compliance
Min. Perimeter Side Setback 25 ft.	30 ft.	In compliance
Min. Perimeter Rear Setback 60 ft.	50 ft.	Not in compliance – this standard can be modified as part of the PUD
Min. Interior Front Setback 15 ft.	23 ft.	In compliance
Min. Interior Side Setback (each/total) 10 ft./20 ft.	10 ft./20 ft.	In compliance
Min. Interior Rear Setback 35 ft.	35 ft.	In compliance
Open Space 5% of gross area developed as active open space = 44,151 sq. ft.	66,750 sq. ft.	In compliance
Garages Min. 1 car garage/unit	2 car garage/unit	In compliance
Entrances/Porches Exterior entrance w/ min. 30 sq. ft. unenclosed front porch	Min. 22 sq. ft. porch	Not in compliance – this standards can be modified as part of the PUD
Design Features Min. 10% columns, cornices, pediments, articulated bases and/or fluted masonry on front facade	Min. 0%	Not in compliance – this standard can be modified as part of the PUD
Windows/doors Min. 25% of wall area facing a street Windows must be recessed or have trim detailing	Min. 28%	In compliance
Exterior Finishes Max. 33% wood or vinyl siding Max. 10% EIFS	Max. 78% (side elevations)	Not in compliance – this standard can be modified as part of the PUD
Min. Floor Area 1,250 sq. ft.	Min. 1,713 sq. ft.	In compliance

6. **Exterior Lighting (Section 138-10.200-204).** A photometric plan showing the location and intensity of exterior lighting must be provided as part of all future plan sets. Refer to the table below as it relates to the lighting requirements for this project.

Requirement	Proposed	Staff Comments
Shielding/Glare Lighting shall be fully shielded & directed downward at a 90° angle Fixtures shall incorporate full cutoff housings, louvers, glare shields, optics, reflectors or other measures to prevent off-site glare & minimize light pollution Only flat lenses are permitted on light fixtures; sag or protruding lenses are prohibited	Cut sheets provided	In compliance – porch lighting and landscape lighting only proposed
Max. Intensity (measured in footcandles fc.) 10 fc. anywhere on-site, 1 fc. at ROW, & 0.5 fc. at any other property line	Photometric data provided	In compliance
Lamps	Max. 60 watts	In compliance

Requirement	Proposed	Staff Comments
Max. wattage of 250 watts per fixture LED or low pressure sodium for low traffic areas, LED, high pressure sodium or metal halide for parking lots		
Max. Height 20 ft., 15 ft. when within 50 ft. of residential	Building mounted lighting only proposed	In compliance

7. **Parking, Loading and Access (138-11.100-308).** Refer to the table below as it relates to the parking and loading requirements of this project.

Requirement	Proposed	Staff Comments
Min. # Parking Spaces Multiple Family: 1.5 spaces per dwelling unit with 2 or fewer bedrooms + 0.2 visitor spaces per dwelling unit = 204	264 spaces	In compliance
Max. # Parking Spaces 200% of Min. = 408 spaces		
Min. Barrier Free Spaces 4 spaces + 3.33% of total parking for 201-300 spaces = 13 spaces	119 ADA spaces in unit garages 1 visitor ADA spaces	In compliance
Min. Parking Space Dimensions 9 ft. x 18 ft. (employee spaces) 10 ft. x 18 ft. (customer spaces) 24 ft. aisle	10 ft. x 18 ft.	In compliance
Min. Parking Setback 10 ft. on all sides	10 ft. +	In compliance
Loading Space No requirement; however, sites shall be designed such that trucks & delivery vehicles may be accommodated on the site		

- Pedestrian pathways and sidewalks have been included on the site. In some instances, sidewalks have not been included in all portions of the development due to natural features conflicts and ADA requirements.

8. **Natural Features.** In addition to the comments below, refer to the review letters from the Engineering and Forestry Departments and the City's Wetland Consultant that pertain to natural features protection.

- **Environmental Impact Statement (EIS)** (Section 138-2.204.G) An EIS meeting ordinance has been submitted for the project.
- **Natural Features Setback** (Section 138-9 Chapter 1). The site does contain regulated wetlands. See the ASTI letter dated September 5, 2019 for additional information.
- **Steep Slopes** (Section 138-9 Chapter 2). The site does contain regulated steep slopes. Refer to engineering review letter dated June 27, 2019 for additional comments.
- **Tree Removal** (Section 126 Natural Resources, Article III Tree Conservation). The site is subject to the city's tree conservation ordinance, and so any healthy tree greater than 6" in caliper that will be removed must be replaced with one tree credit. Trees that are dead or in poor condition need not be replaced. A tree preservation plan has been included indicating the removal of 45 regulated trees. The removal of any regulated tree requires the approval of a tree removal permit and associated tree replacement credits, in the form of additional plantings as regulated in the Tree Conservation Ordinance or a payment of \$216.75 per credit into the City's tree fund.
- **Wetlands** (Section 126 Natural Resources, Article IV Wetland and Watercourse Protection). The site does contain potentially regulated wetlands. Several impacts are proposed to the five wetlands identified on the site. See the ASTI letter dated September 5, 2019 for additional information.

9. **Dumpster Enclosure** (Section 138-10.311). Dumpsters are not presently indicated. Trash is collected by a private company at each unit.

10. **Equipment Screening** (Section 138-10.310.J). All heating, ventilation and air conditioning mechanical equipment located on the exterior of the building shall be screened from adjacent streets and properties.

11. **Landscaping** (Section 138-12.100-308). Refer to the table below as it relates to the landscape requirements for this project. This information is provided to aid the applicant in preparation of step two site plan submittal. **This information based on landscape sheets submitted as part of Planning Review #4.**

Requirement	Proposed	Staff Comments
Right of Way (Avon: 224 ft.) 1 deciduous per 35 ft. + 1 ornamental per 60 ft. = 6 deciduous + 4 ornamental	6 deciduous 4 ornamental	In compliance
Right of Way (Dequindre: 1,090 ft.) 1 deciduous per 35 ft. + 1 ornamental per 60 ft. = 31 deciduous + 18 ornamental	31 deciduous 19 ornamental	In compliance
Buffer C (West: 640 ft.) 20 ft. (or 8 ft. with wall) + 2 deciduous + 1.5 ornamental + 4 evergreen + 6 shrubs per 100 ft. = 20 ft. + 13 deciduous + 10 ornamental + 26 evergreen + 38 shrubs	20 ft. + 13 deciduous 10 ornamental 26 evergreen 38 shrubs	In compliance
Buffer C (South: 630 ft.) 20 ft. (or 8 ft. with wall) + 2 deciduous + 1.5 ornamental + 4 evergreen + 6 shrubs per 100 ft. = 20 ft. + 13 deciduous + 9 ornamental + 25 evergreen + 38 shrubs	20 ft. + 13 deciduous 10 ornamental 26 evergreen 38 shrubs	In compliance
Buffer B (North: 978 ft.) 10 ft. + 2 deciduous + 1.5 ornamental + 2 evergreen + 4 shrubs per 100 ft. = 10 ft. + 20 deciduous + 15 ornamental + 20 evergreen + 39 shrubs	10 ft. + 20 deciduous 16 ornamental 20 evergreen 40 shrubs	In compliance
Stormwater Basin A: 490 ft. 6 ft. width + 1.5 deciduous + 1 evergreen + 4 shrubs per 100 ft. = 6 ft. + 7 deciduous + 5 evergreen + 20 shrubs Basins shall be designed to avoid the need to perimeter fencing.	6 ft. + 8 deciduous 5 evergreen 20 shrubs	In compliance
Stormwater Basin B: 490 ft. 6 ft. width + 1.5 deciduous + 1 evergreen + 4 shrubs per 100 ft. = 6 ft. + 7 deciduous + 5 evergreen + 20 shrubs Basins shall be designed to avoid the need to perimeter fencing.	6 ft. + 8 deciduous 5 evergreen 20 shrubs	In compliance
Stormwater Basin D: 275 ft. 6 ft. width + 1.5 deciduous + 1 evergreen + 4 shrubs per 100 ft. = 6 ft. + 4 deciduous + 3 evergreen + 11 shrubs Basins shall be designed to avoid the need to perimeter fencing.	6 ft. + 4 deciduous 3 evergreen 11 shrubs	In compliance
Stormwater Basin E: 220 ft. 6 ft. width + 1.5 deciduous + 1 evergreen + 4 shrubs per 100 ft. = 6 ft. + 3 deciduous + 2 evergreen + 8 shrubs Basins shall be designed to avoid the need to perimeter fencing.	6 ft.+ 3 deciduous 2 evergreen 8 shrubs	In compliance

- A landscape planting schedule should be provided including the size of all proposed landscaping, along with a unit cost estimate and total landscaping cost summary, including irrigation costs, for landscape bond purposes.
- If required trees cannot fit or planted due to infrastructure conflicts, a payment in lieu of may be made to the City's tree fund at a rate of \$216.75 per tree. Existing healthy vegetation on the site may be used to satisfy the landscape requirements and must be identified on the plans.
- All landscape areas must be irrigated. This has been noted on the landscape plan. An irrigation plan must be submitted prior to staff approval of the final site plan. A note specifying that watering will only occur between the hours of 12am and 5am has been included on the plans.
- Site maintenance notes listed in Section 138-12.109 have been included on the plans.
- A note stating "Prior to the release of the performance bond, the City of Rochester Hills must inspect all landscape plantings." has been included on the plans.

12. **Architectural Design** (*Architectural Design Standards*). Building elevations have been submitted for several unit types. The majority of those emphasize the garage door as the majority of the front façade which is not the most desirable design option. The City's *Architectural Design Standards* emphasizes this point in *Section 3.2.2 Hierarchy of Massing* which states that "the location of the main body of the house and the human entrance should be easily distinguished. The car entry shall not be the most notable element of the building massing." The applicant has included some side-entry garages interior to the site and the units facing Dequindre will not include garages on the elevations facing Dequindre.
13. **Entranceway Landscaping and Signs.** (*Section 138-12.306 and Chapter 134*). A note has been included on the plans that states that all signs must meet the requirements of the City and be approved under separate permits issued by the Building Department.