



Rochester Hills

Minutes

Historic Districts Commission

1000 Rochester Hills Dr.
Rochester Hills, MI
48309
(248) 656-4600
Home Page:
www.rochesterhills.org

Chairperson Brian R. Dunphy, Vice Chairperson Jason Thompson
Members: Steven Branstner, Dr. Jay Eastman, Nicole Franey, Micheal Kilpatrick,
Dr. Richard Stamps, Nicholas Winters, Murray Woolf

Thursday, June 9, 2011

7:00 PM

1000 Rochester Hills Drive

CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Dunphy called the Regular Meeting to order at 7:05 p.m. in the City Hall Auditorium.

ROLL CALL

Present 5 - Richard Stamps, Micheal Kilpatrick, Brian Dunphy, Jason Thompson and Steven Branstner

Absent 4 - Nicole Franey, Murray Woolf, Dr. Jay Eastman and Nicholas Winters

Also Present: Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting
Sandi DiSipio, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

2011-0285 February 10, 2011 Regular Meeting Minutes

A motion was made by Thompson, seconded by Stamps, that this matter be Approved as Presented. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye 5 - Stamps, Kilpatrick, Dunphy, Thompson and Branstner

Absent 4 - Franey, Woolf, Eastman and Winters

2011-0286 March 10, 2011 Regular Meeting Minutes

A motion was made by Thompson, seconded by Stamps, that this matter be Approved as Presented. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye 5 - Stamps, Kilpatrick, Dunphy, Thompson and Branstner

Absent 4 - Franey, Woolf, Eastman and Winters

COMMUNICATIONS

No announcements or communications were brought forward.

PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the audience came forward with any comments on non-agenda items.

NEW BUSINESS

2011-0287 1775 Washington Road (HDC File #11-001)

Applicant: William J. Thomas
Sidwell: 15-01-227-022
District: Winkler Mill Pond
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness
- Garage Addition

Ms. Kidorf summarized the request. This is a non-contributing property in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District and sits between two other non-contributing properties. The request is for an addition to the garage that would be in front of the existing garage. Staff's recommendation is to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness as the proposed addition is on a non-contributing property, is compatible with the District as a whole and meets the Secretary of Interior Standards #9 and #10.

Chairperson Dunphy invited the applicants forward to explain the specifics of the proposal.

Mr. William Thomas, the architect and applicant, and Mr. Bill Kruse, the property owner came forward and explained the goal is to have a big enough garage to house the owner's very large pick-up truck. The garage will expand forward to accomplish that and use a portion of the old garage for a work-out room. The aesthetics of the structure will not be changed at all. The garage door will be wood and the appearance of the garage will be exactly the same as it is now; the green painted brick and painted siding will match the original garage.

Dr. Stamps thanked the applicant for his support of the district and commented the proposed work looks appropriate.

MOTION by Kilpatrick, seconded by Thompson, in the matter of HDC File 11-001, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of additions to the non-contributing resource located at 1775 Washington Road, Parcel Identification Number 15-01-227-022, with the following Findings and Conditions:

Findings:

1. The existing home with the construction of the garage additions will remain a non-contributing resource within the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District.
2. The plans for the additions appear to be compatible in mass, height, scale and design features with the other existing resources in the District.
3. The additions will not have a detrimental effect on the existing resources in the surrounding area or on the District itself.
4. The proposed design, texture and materials of the additions and rehabilitation are compatible with the existing structure and similar resources within the District.
5. The proposed additions and rehabilitation of the existing non-contributing resource are in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard for Rehabilitation and Guidelines Numbers 9 and 10 as follows:

9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Conditions:

1. The new construction shall be completed in accordance with the plans dated received by the City's Planning and Development Department May 18, 2011.

2. All materials, colors and design shall be in accordance with the plans dated received by the City's Planning and Development Department May 18, 2011. Notable materials are as follows:
 - a. Green painted brick to match existing
 - b. Wooden overhead garage doors
 - c. Painted siding to match the existing (material not specified, i.e., vinyl, aluminum, cementitious)
 - d. Log column support post to match existing

3. All work proposed for the subject site shall receive all appropriate Building Department permits prior to any work being performed.

4. No work is being requested or approved regarding other outbuildings or site features on the property at this time. Any work other than what is indicated on the plans dated received by the Planning and Development Department May 18, 2011 will require additional review and approval by the City's Historic Districts Commission.

A motion was made by Kilpatrick, seconded by Thompson, that this matter be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye 5 - Stamps, Kilpatrick, Dunphy, Thompson and Branstner

Absent 4 - Franey, Woolf, Eastman and Winters

2011-0117

1081 W. Auburn Road (HDC File #04-004)

Applicant: Robert C. Bruhn

Sidwell: 15-33-200-013

District: Non-Contiguous

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness

- Removal of Chimney, Fencing, and Hot Tub

Ms. Kidorf summarized the request. This is a single resource historic district near the southwest corner of Auburn and Livernois. It is a brick Greek Revival style house. The applicant is proposing to remove a large non-original brick chimney near the center of the roof that is causing structural damage to the property, remove a non-original hot tub off the rear deck and remove a non-original fence in the middle of the back yard. Staff's recommendation is to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness as the proposed work will not remove any historic features and meets the Secretary of Interior Standards #2.

Chairperson Dunphy reminded the members that what they are looking at in terms of decision-making tonight is whether the proposed alterations to the structure comply with the Secretary of Interior Standards. While the historical detail of the property is appreciated, the Commission needs to address the issue they are charged with by the ordinance - which is compliance with the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Mr. Bruhn, the applicant and property owner, came forward to explain his request. He recently purchased the home at auction. There is a large non-original unsupported brick chimney in the middle of the roof that is damaging the roof and actually pushing the brick away from the building. There are no footers or foundation for this chimney. He is proposing to remove the chimney. The tacked-together fence in the middle of the yard seems to be for dogs and is proposed to be removed. There is another appropriate fence covered in grapevines closer to the house that will remain.

Mr. Branstner asked if the roof will be repaired with shingles that match the existing roof. Mr. Bruhn replied yes, and explained there are a few bales of shingles in the garage as the roof was just replaced last year.

Mr. Kilpatrick asked when the chimney was built. Mr. Bruhn indicated he did not know, but the brick used is totally different than the brick of the house.

Ms. Kidorf stated that the chimney does show up in the 1992 newspaper article, but does not show up in the black and white photo in the historical information from the museum (photo date unknown). In the historic rendering from the atlas, it is clear that there were two identical decorative chimneys on the structure.

Mr. Bruhn indicated that in the future he would like to restore both chimneys to the way they were back in the 1880's.

MOTION by Branstner, seconded by Thompson, in the matter of HDC File 04-004, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the non-original chimney and repair of the roof, removal of the hot tub and repair of the deck, and the removal of the southern yard fence located at 1081 W. Auburn Road, Parcel Identification Number 15-33-200-013, with the following Finding:

Findings:

1. The work meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for

Rehabilitation, in particular standard Number 2, *“The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.”* Neither the chimney, hot tub nor fencing are distinctive materials or character defining features of the property.

A motion was made by Branstner, seconded by Thompson, that this matter be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye 5 - Stamps, Kilpatrick, Dunphy, Thompson and Branstner

Absent 4 - Franey, Woolf, Eastman and Winters

ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Kidorf commented that in the past, some requests were informally delegated to staff for administrative approval. However, State law requires that list to be in writing, so Ms. Kidorf has written a draft resolution delegating minor classes of work for staff approval. This should lighten the Commission's load. The Commission does not have to act on this resolution tonight. Members could review, edit, or add to it and consider it at a future meeting. It could be expanded to include things like removal of chimneys and hot tubs that are not original to the property. After a short discussion, it is the consensus of the Commission that members should review the document and it should be brought back to a future agenda for discussion and/or possible approval. It should also be forwarded to the Commissioners not in attendance tonight for their review. Any comments, changes, additions or deletions can be forwarded to the recording secretary.

Dr. Stamps commented he noticed that the historical stone house on Adams Road has a "sold" sign on it. A letter could be sent welcoming the new owners to the "historic district" neighborhood and offering the services of the HDC if needed. The recording secretary will try to ascertain who purchased the property and whether or not it is the same people who came in with a concept plan for that property. That developer was well aware that the home was historic.

Vice-Chair Thompson asked if there was anything new on the Dunn House - 1841 Crooks Rd. The recording secretary will check with the Building Department to see if there are any updates.

Chairperson Dunphy reported that the Rochester Avon Historical Society is establishing a website called Oakland Regional Historical Sites. The site

will be an on-line database of all the historic sites starting in the Rochester, Rochester Hills and Oakland Township areas. The City's of Ferndale and Farmington have expressed interest in putting their information on the website.

Dr. Stamps updated the Commission on the Frank Farm report - the property owners will be invited to attend the September Study Committee meeting in order to give their input on the recommendation for designation.

Vice-Chair Thompson updated the Commission on the Twist Drill report - the property owners will be invited to attend the October Study Committee meeting in order to give their input on the recommendation for designation.

NEXT MEETING DATE

The Chair reminded the Commissioners the next Regular Meeting is scheduled for July 14, 2011.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further business to come before the Commission, and upon Motion by Kilpatrick, seconded by Thompson, the Chair adjourned the Regular meeting at 7:45 p.m.

Brian Dunphy, Chairperson
Historic Districts Commission
City of Rochester Hills

Sandi DiSipio, Recording Secretary