



Department of Planning and Development
Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

March 30, 2020

960 E. Tienken, fencing	
REQUEST	Certificate of Appropriateness for moving an existing fence and adding new fencing
APPLICANT	Erik Fredriksen
FILE NO.	HDC # 20-007
PARCEL NO.	70-15-02-477-003
ZONING	R1
HISTORIC DISTRICT	Stoney Creek
STAFF	Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

In this Report:

Request	1
Historical Information	1
Review Considerations	2
Summary	2
Potential Motion	3

Request

This is an application to relocate an existing fence and add additional fencing to the side and rear yard areas of 960 E. Tienken Road. The subject property is commonly known as the Sign of the Black and White Cow and is located on the southeast corner of Tienken and Van Hoosen Roads within the Stoney Creek Historic District, near Van Hoosen Farm.

The corner property contains a house with wings that face both Tienken and Van Hoosen Roads and a garage that faces Van Hoosen Road. A stone retaining wall is located between the house and garage and there is a concrete driveway from Van Hoosen to the garage. There is an existing wood picket fence that runs from the southeast corner of the house and partially around the rear yard. There is a section of 72” tall fencing along the south property line that is not visible.

Historical Information

The subject property is located in the Stoney Creek Historic District. The 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* describes the district as containing the unincorporated village of Stony Creek and Van Hoosen Farm. The northern boundary generally follows Stony Creek and extends northward along Washington Road including Cornerstone, Mallon Court and Mill Race Roads. The district is almost wholly residential in

character, with houses dating from the 1830s to the 1990s. In Stony Creek village, the site of the proposed project, recent construction is interspersed with houses built in the nineteenth century. There is a variety of fencing and stone walls within the district.

The Stony Creek settlement was established in 1823 and developed in the 1830s. The district has thirty-seven contributing resources, seventy-one non-contributing resources, and one that requires more research to determine its status. Some of the most significant properties in the district include the Van Hoosen Farm; the Greek revival house at 1046 East Tienken Road; the Stony Creek School; and the Sign of the Black and White Cow – the subject of this application.

Review Considerations

The existing fencing on the property consists of a 42” tall wood picket fence and gate that runs east from the southeast corner of the house and turns the corner in the rear yard and connects to the northeast corner of the house. There is an existing 72” tall wood fence along the south property line. The applicant proposes to relocate the existing 42” tall picket fence (erected in 1995 per the applicant) to run from the southwest corner of the house, southward and then turn the corner to run eastward to intersect with the northwest corner of the garage. The gate will be relocated across the walkway. The fence will follow the slope of the yard and will drop down to the lower level at the retaining wall before continuing south.

The applicant proposes to use a new 72” tall wood fence to connect from the existing wood fence on the south lot line, running north along the east lot line to a point equal to the northeast corner of the house, and then running westward to the northeast corner of the house. The proposed fence will be one of two styles, Ideal 7201 which is a wood alternating board fence for the lower 60” and an open “railing” area in the top 12”. The second choice is Ideal 7202 which is a solid board fence for the lower 60” and a lattice in the top 12”. Both choices have square posts with decorative caps supporting the fence.

Summary

1. The property is a historic (contributing property) in the Stony Creek Historic District that contains a house and garage.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to relocate a picket fence erected after 1995 and add additional fencing in the side/rear yard. The proposed fence is a wood solid board or board on board fence with lattice at the top that is 6’ tall.
3. The 2009 document entitled “Stoney Creek/Winkler Mill Advisory Report & Map” prepared by a special city task force recommends using fences that are “more refined with the use of milled lumber and detailing” and not exceed 42” in height.
4. Staff offers the following comments on the application. Relocation of existing picket fence: although the fence will be even with the west face of the house, the fence will still be set back from the street which is appropriate for the district. It will slope with the grade and will drop down at the stone retaining wall. Proposed new fencing: the new fence will be the same height as an existing fence on the south lot line that is not visible from the street. I recommend the applicant be requested to use more of the re-used picket fence for the section of fence that runs from the northeast corner of the house to the east lot line as that section will be visible from Tienken Road. Using the 72” tall fence, in the Ideal 7201 type that the applicant has proposed, is compatible for the district as it is not a solid fence and is in the trees along the property line reducing visibility.

5. The applicant has not submitted the proposed plans to the City's Building Department for a formal review. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

Potential Motions

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

MOTION, in the matter of File No. HDC 20-007, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the moving of a fence and add additional fencing at 960 E. Tienken Road in the Stoney Creek Historic District, Parcel Identification Number **70-15-02-477-003**, with the following Findings and Conditions:

- 1) The property is **contributing/non-contributing** to the Stoney Creek Historic District.
- 2) The proposed new fence is **compatible/not compatible** with the character and landscaping in the district provided the following conditions are met:
 - a) The section of fence from the northeast corner of the house to the east property line (closest to Tienken Road) is 42" tall picket fence matching the existing picket fence;
 - b) The 72" tall fencing is the Ideal 7201 – the board on board with open area at the top
- 3) The proposed fence relocation and addition **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard numbers 9 and 10 as follows:

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*