



Department of Planning and Development
 Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

December 2, 2011

3861 S. Adams Road Rehabilitation	
REQUEST	Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of additions, replacing roofing, siding, windows and doors
APPLICANT	Michael J. Gordon, AIA, Moiseev/Gordon Associates, Inc.
FILE NO.	HDC # 05-004
PARCEL NO.	15-31-301-011
ZONING	R-4 with a FB-1 Flexible Business 1 overlay
HISTORIC DISTRICT	3861 S. Adams Road (Salmon Matthews House)
STAFF	Jim Breuckman, AICP, Manager of Planning, Planning & Economic Development Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

In this Report:

Request 1

Historical Information..... 2

Review Considerations 2

Summary 3

Potential Motion..... 3

Request

The subject site is located on the east side of South Auburn Road north of South Boulevard. Previously a PUD was approved for the property to construct the Lorna Stone Village, a mixed-use development that never took place. The property is now owned by a church. The lot is developed with an existing one-family Greek Revival stone upright and wing house constructed in 1824 and 1840. Additions to the house were constructed in the 1950s and in 1985. A detached garage was constructed in 1983. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Phase I of a larger project. Phase I consists of rehabilitating the stone house by removing the east (rear) and west (front) additions, removing the vinyl siding, replacing the windows and doors, cleaning and tuckpointing the stone exterior walls; installing new aluminum gutters and downspouts, repairing the garage and installing a new gravel parking lot behind the house. Future phases may include a glass connector to a new school building, paved parking lots, and a new church building at the rear of the property, although those plans have not been finalized. At this time the applicant primarily wants permission to remove the additions, secure the house for winter and work on the garage.

Historical Information

The subject site is a single-resource historic district. The stone house is an upright and wing in the Greek Revival style. It is the only stone Greek Revival style house in Rochester Hills. It is significant for its architecture. The original two-room wood frame structure was constructed in 1824 by Salmon Matthews. In 1840 the stone upright and wing section was constructed on the west end of the frame structure, possibly by Daniel Grey. The original frame structure is reported to still exist within part of the east addition although it was heavily altered in 1950 and during later additions. The front porch and addition that is east of the original 1824 structure are not contributing features to the house. It is not known if any of the 1824 house and original or older front porch structure remains within the new enclosures.

The original survey sheet states that the house was used as part of the Underground Railroad during the Civil War. The original survey sheet states that the windows are of hand blown glass. Although it is difficult to tell with the boards it appears that the windows in the stone house are still original.

The 1983 detached garage does not contribute to the property.

Review Considerations

For now the applicant would like permission to remove the additions, secure the building for winter and make the requested repairs to the garage. The applicant will have some information about the proposed window replacement at the meeting but will need to come back at a later meeting with more information on the condition, dimensions and possibility of repairing the windows; information on the proposed replacement doors and the condition of the second floor siding and the stone tuckpointing and cleaning; and more information on the proposed site work.

The applicant has submitted plans and elevations showing the removal of the front and rear one-story additions, including the location of the original 1824 house in the rear addition which has been heavily altered. The previous owner proposed removing this same section of the addition but was going to leave the trap door and cistern which were reportedly used to hide fugitives as part of the Underground Railroad. Care should be taken when dismantling this section of the rear addition to document and retain any historic materials that still exist. It is also not known if any older or original porch pieces exist within the front addition. Care should be taken when dismantling this section to document and save any found historic materials.

Also proposed is repair of the soffit and fascia (including the cornice returns) to match the existing, installation of new aluminum gutters and downspouts; removal of the vinyl siding to either repair any existing wood siding or installation of new replica wood siding; replacement of the windows; installation of replica doors and windows in newly exposed openings; repair or replication of the door and window sills and heads; replacement of all the windows; cleaning and tuckpointing of the stone; and capping of the chimneys.

The detached non-historic garage is proposed to have new aluminum gutters and downspouts; repair or replacement of the fascia boards which will be covered in aluminum and vented; installation of new vinyl siding over 1/2" OSB with new Azek trim board. The pedestrian and garage doors are proposed to be replaced and a new window is proposed for the south elevation. A new decorative vent is proposed for the west elevation. New light fixtures are proposed next to the garage doors and pedestrian door.

Site changes include the installation of a new deceleration lane in front of the house on Adams Road which will access a proposed asphalt driveway running along the north side of the house back to the garage. A temporary gravel drive and lot is proposed behind the house for twenty cars. A retention area is proposed on

the north side of the driveway. The site is presently heavily treed, including some older trees, and a dimensioned site plan showing the size of the drives and lot and what vegetation will be removed for the new site work has not been provided.

The applicant indicates the following materials will be used for the project:

1. The new deceleration lane and main driveway will be asphalt
2. The temporary parking lot and small drive will be gravel
3. The garage will have new aluminum gutters, downspouts, soffit and fascia, vinyl siding over OSB, Azek trim board, new paneled aluminum garage doors, and a new pedestrian door and window.
4. Note that the drawings indicate a new asphalt shingle roof on the house – that is the existing condition, not that a new roof will be installed.

Summary

1. The house is a single resource historic district. The house historic, but the additions proposed for removal are not contributing features. The 1824 section of the east addition has been heavily altered on the exterior. The garage is not historic.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following: 1) House - remove the additions, secure the house for winter by re-boarding the windows and door openings, remove the vinyl siding from the second floor walls, cap off the existing chimney, repair the soffit and fascia to match the existing, and install new aluminum gutters and downspouts; 2) Garage - install new siding, trim, soffit, fascia, windows and doors; and 3) Site - construct an asphalt deceleration lane, driveway, retention area and temporary gravel parking lot for twenty cars.
3. The applicant will return with additional information on the final house repairs to be completed in the spring, including treatment of the second floor siding after condition evaluation, replacing the windows and doors as well as tuckpointing and cleaning the stone. A site plan showing vegetation (existing and what is proposed for removal) and dimensions of the proposed deceleration lane, asphalt drive, retention area and gravel parking are needed.
4. The applicant has submitted his proposed plans to the City's Building Department for a formal review, conditioned on the decisions made by the Historic Districts Commission. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

Potential Motion

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

MOTION, in the matter of File No. HDC 05-004, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the front (west) and rear (east) additions, securing the house for winter, repair of the house soffit and fascia, capping the chimney, installation of gutters and downspouts, and on the garage installing new windows, doors, siding, trim, gutters and downspouts as proposed for the single-resource historic district located at 3861 South Adams Road, Parcel Identification Number 15-31-301-011, with the following Findings and Conditions:

Findings:

1. The property is a single resource historic district, however the front and rear additions and the garage are not contributing features to the district. The original 1824 house is contained within the east addition but has been heavily altered on the exterior.
2. The plans for the removal of the east and west additions of the house; securing the house for winter; repair of the soffit and fascia to match the existing; installation of gutters and downspouts; capping the chimney; and repairs to the garage **appear to /do not appear to** remove any character defining features to the house and the non-contributing garage.
3. The proposed additions and rehabilitation of the existing non-contributing resource **are/are not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard for Rehabilitation and Guidelines Numbers 2, 4, 5 and 6 as follows:
 - 2) *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
 - 4) *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*
 - 5) *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
 - 6) *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

* If denying – include reason for denial along with information about how to correct the application and how to reapply.

Conditions of Approval:

(Only necessary if approval is being granted)

1. During removal of the front (west) addition remnants or materials from an original or older front porch will be noted, photographed and saved if they exist.
2. During removal of the rear (east) addition, materials from the original 1824 house will be noted, photographed and saved if they exist.
3. Care will be taken to not damage or destroy historic materials on the house during the removal of the additions.
4. The repairs shall be completed in accordance with the plans dated received by the City's Planning & Development Department November 21, 2011 with the exception of the window and door replacement, second floor siding repair/replacement, and stone cleaning and tuckpointing on the house and site work including construction of the deceleration lane, asphalt driveway, retention area and gravel drive and parking lot.
5. All work proposed for the subject site shall receive all appropriate Building Department permits prior to any work being performed.

6. No work is being requested or approved regarding other outbuildings or site features on the property at this time. The proposed work to the house windows, doors, siding and stone; construction of the deceleration lane, asphalt driveway, retention area and gravel drive and parking lot; and any work other than what is indicated on the plans dated received by the Planning & Development Department November 21, 2011 will require additional review and approval by the City's Historic Districts Commission.