



# Department of Planning and Development

## Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

March 31, 2019

### 1590 Washington – Revised application – replacement house

<b>REQUEST</b>	Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of replacement house
<b>APPLICANT</b>	Prenk Gjokaj – Renaissance Building Services
<b>FILE NO.</b>	HDC # 17-026
<b>PARCEL NO.</b>	70-15-01-278-001
<b>ZONING</b>	R-E – Single family residential
<b>HISTORIC DISTRICT</b>	Winkler Mill Pond
<b>STAFF</b>	Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

#### In this Report:

Request	1
Historical Information	2
Review Considerations	2
Summary	3
Potential Motion	3

#### **Request**

The Commission initially reviewed this property in August 2017 and approved a major addition to this house which is non-contributing in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. Once construction started it was determined that portions of the house that were going to be retained had mold and other structural damage which the city required the contractor to remove and replace. Staff approved the additional demolition because it was: 1) a non-contributing property; 2) it was primarily interior demolition; and 3) the contractor stated that the final exterior appearance would match what the Commission approved in 2017.

Since that time the owner has determined they would like to change the exterior appearance from what the Commission originally approved. The previous house was totally demolished, and this application addresses the changed appearance of the replacement house.

The property previously contained a house and a separate garage converted to a house. The garage remains unchanged on the property. The 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* determined both structures as non-contributing to the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. The subject property is located on the southeast side of Washington Road on the very south edge of the district. There are four non-contributing Winkler Mill Pond HD properties between 1590 Washington and the contributing property at 1740 Washington. The property is in the southern section of the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District., within the part of the district

that was suggested for removal in the 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey*. The property has many trees and bushes, and is surrounded by newer houses. The previous house and garage are not visible from the street, but based on the 2004 Oakland County property images the previous house was a one-and-a-half story tall side-gable house clad in wide siding (material unknown). There is one-story tall brick-clad ell extending to the rear of the house. The separate garage building on the property is a one-and-a-half story tall gable roof structure with concrete block walls at the first floor and vertical siding on the second floor. A wood deck and sliding glass doors are located in the second-floor wall. The garage could have been a barn at one time, but no longer resembles one. No work is proposed to the garage in this application.

### Historical Information

The subject property is located in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. The 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey* describes the district as generally surrounding Winkler Mill Pond from the north edge of the Stoney Creek Historic District along both Winkler Mill Road and Washington Road. The district is almost wholly residential in character, with houses dating from the 1830s to the 1990s. A few of the houses retain agricultural outbuildings. The foundation of Winkler Mill is visible and two of the mill dams are functioning. The district has sloping terrain and is heavily treed.

The district was developed around the Winkler Mill (a gristmill that burned in 1985) and a wool carding mill owned by Levi Cole who also owned the majority of the property in the nineteenth century. In the 1920s the first suburban and summer homes appeared in the area. Most of the residential development around the mill pond took place after World War II, particularly beginning in the 1970s. The district has sixteen contributing resources and forty-three non-contributing resources, and two that require more research to determine their status. Some of the most significant properties in the district include the Greek Revival Levi Cole house; the house at 1740 Washington Road; the Colonial Revival Von Isser House built c. 1918; the mill house on Winkler Mill Road; the mill dams and the mill pond.

This parcel on Washington Road sits south of the portion of the district around the pond. This part of the district is surrounded by subdivisions and newer houses. The non-contributing houses in this portion of the district are generally one- to two-stories tall, have gable roofs, attached garages and are clad in brick with asphalt shingle roofs. The houses are generally on large lots and are extensively landscaped.

### Review Considerations

---

The proposed replacement house is similar to what the Commission originally approved. It has the same footprint and overall height/massing. The differences include a walkout basement level and grading on the west side of the house; changing the porch that originally wrapped around three sides to just a front porch; the addition of dormers; and a second floor in a section that was originally one-story tall.

The main block of the house is proposed to be two stories tall with a side gable roof clad in black asphalt shingles. It will have a stone foundation and white cement board clapboard siding. A cement board shingle pattern will cover a gable-front wall dormer that projects above the front entrance. A shed roof dormer with a standing seam metal roof projects from the roof to the left of the entrance gable. A hip roof front porch supported by Doric columns will have a standing seam metal roof. It runs across most of the front façade. It is proposed to have white aluminum clad casement windows at the first and second floors. To the left of the porch a one-story tall projecting bay with a standing seam metal roof and shingle clad base is proposed at the first floor.

The one-story garage attached to the left side of the house will have a two-car wide garage door that resembles a traditional carriage house door. A pedestrian door is located beside the garage door. Above the garage door there is a gable front wall door clad in shingle cement board siding.

The rear elevation continues the stone clad foundation and cement board clapboard siding above. The rear windows are single pane casement windows. The rear of the garage has a one-car and a two-car garage door, both in a traditional carriage house door style. A shingle clad gable front dormer projects about the garage door.

The right (west) elevation has a stone clad walk-out basement. A stepped brick ledge on the north side and boulder retaining wall on the south side line the new recessed yard area. A sliding glass door and two casement windows are in the basement level. The first and second floors are clad in cement board siding and there are casement windows. The left (east) elevation continues the stone clad foundation with cement board siding above and casement windows in the end of the garage and on visible portions of the second floor.

As per the original site plan the driveway is proposed to be extended to the front of the new garage and a small section behind the garage.

The applicant has indicated that the following materials will be used for the project:

1. Crushed stone driveway, brick stepped ledge, boulder retaining wall.
2. Stone veneer, cement board siding and shingle siding in white, white trim and porch columns. Black asphalt shingles used for the main roof, standing seam metal for porch and dormer roofs.
3. Aluminum clad windows, door materials are unknown.

## Summary

---

1. The property is in the south end of the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District. The property has a non-contributing house and garage constructed at an unknown date. This part of the district has newer houses and was recommended for removal in the 2002 *Rochester Hills Historic Districts Survey*.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a replacement house slightly different than the additions previously approved.
3. Staff offers the following comments on the proposed project. This portion of the district is primarily newer houses and is heavily landscaped. The construction of the replacement house, driveway extensions, and excavation with retaining walls for the walk-out basement as proposed is compatible with the district and will not destroy any historic materials or features. The proposal meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
4. The applicant has submitted the proposed plans to the City's Building Department for a formal review. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

## Potential Motions

---

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

**MOTION**, in the matter of File No. HDC 17-026, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the

construction of the replacement house at 1590 Washington Road in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District, Parcel Identification Number 70-15-01-278-001, with the following Findings and Conditions:

- 1) The proposed replacement house and driveway extension is in the Winkler Mill Pond Historic District and **is/is not** compatible in massing, size, scale and materials with this part of the district;
- 2) The proposed driveway expansion, retaining walls, and replacement house as proposed **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines, in particular standard numbers 9 and 10 as follows:

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*