

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CONSULTANT TO UPDATE THE CITY'S MASTER LAND USE PLAN

TABULATION

Name	McKenna	Carlisle Wortman Assoc	Johnson Hill Land Ethics	Vilican Leman
	ASTI	Tilton & Associates	J. Eppink Partners	
	Gloria W. Robinson			
Location	Northville, MI	Clarkston, MI	Ann Arbor, MI	Southfield, MI
Years in Business	26 years	16 years	15 years	50 years
Years Providing Planning Serv	26 years	16 years		50 years
Number of Similar Clients	200 clients	60 municipal clients		20 clients
References	Sterling Heights, Bay City Lincoln Park, Grosse Pte Kalamazoo, Toledo, Fenton, Lincoln Park +	Northville, Lake Angelus, Wolverine Lake, Holly, Independence, Springfield, Oxford, Orion, Brandon	Oakland Twp, Holland, Grand Haven, Kentwood, W Bloomfield Twp, Sumpter Twp.	Bloomfield Hills, Novi, Farmington Hills, Sturgis Gorveland Twp, Wyandotte, Bloomfield Twp.
Public Sector Clients	200 +	60		300
Number of Employees	34 employees	18 employees		6 employees + 2 part time
Total Planners	22 planners	12 planners		4 planners
AICP Certified	14 certified planners	6 certified planners		3 certified planners
Resources	Yes	Yes		Yes
Staff Profiles Provided	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Methods of Communication	Yes	Yes		Yes
Mgmt of Consultants	Subcontractor Agreement McKenna manages	Worked on other projects Managed by Carlisle		Project leaders weekly meetings
Timeline	18 months	21 months	18 months	18 months
Deliverables	Yes	Yes		Yes
Contract Required	Yes	Yes		Yes

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CONSULTANT TO UPDATE THE CITY'S MASTER LAND USE PLAN

TABULATION

Name	McKenna	Carlisle Wortman Assoc	Johnson Hill Land Ethics	Vilican Leman
	ASTI	Tilton & Associates	J. Eppink Partners	
	Gloria W. Robinson			
Litigation	2 both dismissed	None		Yes - Dismissed
Cost Proposal	\$150,000	\$149,725	\$144,410	\$146,605
	McK - \$61 - \$115 hourly	Carlisle - \$45 - \$125 hourly	Johnson/Eppink	\$65 - \$125 hourly
	ASTI - \$58 - \$95 hourly		\$50 - \$150 hourly	
	Robinson \$120 hourly			
	1734 hours	1615 hours	1404 hours	1602 hours
	Average Hourly \$82.47	Average Hourly \$86.83	Average Hourly \$84.34	Average Hourly \$82.10
	Net 30	Net 30		Monthly billing/Retainer?
			*No Questionnaire	3% yearly increase
Administrative Overhead	No	No		No

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CONSULTANT TO UPDATE THE CITY'S MASTER LAND USE PLAN

TABULATION

Name	Hamilton Anderson Wetland Coastal Resource Anderson Economic Group	Langworthy Strader DLZ Cheasapeaker Group	Birchler Arroyo Associates
Location	Detroit, MI	Royal Oak/Grand Rapids, MI	Lathrup Village, MI
Years in Business	10 years	9 years	15 years
Years Providing Planning Serv	9 years	9 years	15 years
Number of Similar Clients		5 80 communities	30+
References	Ypsilanti, St. Clair Shores, Centerline, Warren, Birmingham, Oakland Cty, Monroe, Grand Blanc	Northville, Romulus, Fenton, Dundee, Farmington, Monroe Grosse Ile Twp, Genoa Twp, Port Huron, Brighton Twp	Rochester, Shelby Twp, Woodhaven, Novi, White Lake, Bingham Farms, Grand Blanc Twp
Public Sector Clients		11	80 30+
Number of Employees	72 employees	21 employees	12 full time; 1 part time
Total Planners	3 planners	18 planners	9 planners
AICP Certified	2 certified planners	8 certified planners	6 certified planners
Resources	Yes	Yes	Yes
Staff Profiles Provided	Yes	Yes	Yes
Methods of Communication	Yes	No Answer	Yes
Mgmt of Consultants	Sign Agreements	Hamilton Anderson Project Manager	Will not use consultants
Timeline	12 months	12 months	20 months
Deliverables	Yes	Yes	Yes
Contract Required	Yes	Yes	Yes

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR CONSULTANT TO UPDATE THE CITY'S MASTER LAND USE PLAN

TABULATION

Name	Hamilton Anderson	Langworthy Strader	Birchler Arroyo Associates
	Wetland Coastal Resource	DLZ	
	Anderson Economic Group	Cheasapeaker Group	
Litigation	Settled/No cost to Hamilton	Yes - Dismissed	Expert Witness
Cost Proposal	\$147,708	\$141,671	\$136,831
	\$35 - \$150 hourly	\$70-\$113	\$40 - \$104 hourly
	1636 hours	1659 HOURS	1091 hours
	Average Hourly \$87.24	Average Hourly \$85.40	Average Hourly \$80
	Monthly billing	Net 30	Monthly billing
Administrative Overhead	No, factored into proposal	No	No