

**City of Rochester Hills  
Department of Planning**

**STAFF REPORT TO THE HISTORIC DISTRICTS COMMISSION**

July 9, 2009

<b>1520 Mill Race</b>	
<b>APPLICANT</b>	Larry C. Lizzet 1253 Stone Barn Road Milford, Michigan 48380
<b>LOCATION</b>	1520 Mill Race Road
<b>SIDWELL</b>	15-01-100-014
<b>FILE NO.</b>	HDC 09-001
<b>ZONING</b>	RE (Residential Estate)
<b>STAFF</b>	Derek L. Delacourt, Deputy Director
<b>REQUEST</b>	<b>Certificate of Appropriateness</b> 1. Demolition of portions of existing resource 2. Renovation of and addition to existing resource 3. Demolition of existing outbuilding (potential)
<b>HISTORIC DISTRICT</b>	Stoney Creek Historic District

**SUMMARY:**

The subject site is located on Mill Race, east of Washington Road, and South of Mead Road. The lot is developed with an existing single family home built in 1973 and one outbuilding. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of a portion of the original home, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation of the existing home and for the construction of additions to the existing home, including a second story and additions to the east, front and south sides of the home.

**HISTORICAL INFORMATION:**

The subject site is located within the boundaries of the Stoney Creek Historic District, but does not contain any contributing resources to the District. Copies of the survey sheets are attached.

**PERTINENT FACTS:**

The applicant has submitted plans depicting the portions of the home that will be demolished, as well as floor plans and elevations for the proposed new construction.

The submitted plans indicate that the applicant is requesting approval to demolish the existing garage, den, kitchen and sunroom located on the east side of the home.

The submitted plans and elevations indicate that the applicant is requesting approval to renovate the existing home on the property by constructing a second story; increasing the roof pitches; adding a sunroom on the east end; adding to the front on the south, adding an addition to the front entry increasing the foyer, and adding a stairway to the second floor.

The applicant indicates the following materials will be used on the exterior of the home as part of the renovation plan:

1. Red/orange brick
2. Natural stone (grey in color)
3. An architectural grade asphalt shingle (weatherwood)
4. Aluminum trim and vinyl siding in earth tones or neutral colors
5. Windows will be clad vinyl or aluminum casement units (sandwood)
6. Garage doors and entry doors will be painted embossed steel

**ANALYSIS:**

1. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of portions of the existing home, including the garage, den, kitchen and sunroom. The portions to be demolished are located on the east side of the existing home.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of additions to the existing home, including a second story; increased roof pitches; a sunroom; addition to the front of the garage on the south end; an addition to the front entry to increase the foyer, and to add a stairway to the new second floor. In addition to the additions, all the existing wood primed windows will be replaced with clad casement units.
3. The applicant has indicated that an existing outbuilding will be demolished upon the completion of the house remodel. As the date of this proposed demolition is not known at the present time, the Commission will have to decide if they wish to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness at this time. The alternative would be for the applicant to make a formal request for approval of the demolition of the outbuilding upon completion of the new construction.
4. The existing home is approximately 3,000 square feet in size, and the proposed additions will add 2,338 square feet of living space to the home; will add 562 square feet of storage, and will add 250 square feet of garage area.
5. The applicant has submitted his proposed plans to the City's Building Department for a formal review, conditioned on the decisions made by the Historic Districts Commission.

Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

### **Example Motions**

**Potential Motion (Removal of Additions)**: (Based on discussion by the Commission)

**MOTION**, in the matter of File No. HDC 09-001, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES** a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the removal (demolition) of portions of the home located at 1520 Mill Race, Parcel Identification Number 15-01-100-014, with the following Findings and Conditions:

**Findings:**

1. The existing 1973 home is a non-contributing resource located within the Stoney Creek Historic District.
2. The removal of the indicated portions of the existing resource **will/will not** have a negative impact on the character of the Stoney Creek Historic District.
3. The removal of the indicated portions of the existing resource (home) are applicable under the Secretary of the Interior's Standards #2 (i.e. "2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided") as the resource does not contribute to the Stoney Creek Historic District.

If denying – include reason for denial along with information about how to correct the application and how to reapply.

**Conditions: (Only necessary if approval is being granted)**

1. The demolition shall be completed in accordance with the plans dated received by the City's Planning & Development Department July 7, 2009.

2. Prior to removal of any portions of the existing non-contributing resource, the applicant will obtain all appropriate permits and approval of the proposed work plans from the City's Building Department.

**Potential Motion (New Construction/Additions):** (Based on Commission discussion)

**MOTION**, in the matter of File No. HDC 99-011, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of additions to the non-contributing resource located at 1520 Mill Race, Parcel Identification Number 15-01-100-014, with the following Findings and Conditions:

**Findings:**

1. The existing home with the construction of the new additions will remain a non-contributing resource within the Stoney Creek Historic District.
2. The plans for the additions appear **to be/do not appear to be** compatible in mass, height, scale and design features with the other existing resources in the District.
3. The additions **will not/will** have a detrimental effect on the existing resources in the surrounding area or on the District itself.
4. The proposed design, texture and materials of the additions and rehabilitation **are/are not** compatible with the existing structure and similar resources within the District.
5. The proposed additions and rehabilitation of the existing non-contributing resource **are/are not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard for Rehabilitation and Guidelines Numbers 9 and 10 as follows:
  9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
  10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

If denying – include reason for denial along with information about how to correct the application and how to reapply.

**Conditions: (Only necessary if approval is being granted)**

1. The new construction shall be completed in accordance with the plans dated received by the City's Planning & Development Department July 7, 2009.
2. All materials, colors and design shall be in accordance with the plans dated received by the City's Planning & Development Department July 7, 2009. Materials have been noted as follows:
  - A. Red/orange brick
  - B. Natural stone (grey in color)
  - C. An architectural grade asphalt shingle (weatherwood)
  - D. Aluminum trim and vinyl siding in earth tones or neutral colors
  - E. Windows will be clad vinyl or aluminum casement units (sandwood)
  - F. Garage and entry doors will be painted embossed steel
3. All work proposed for the subject site shall receive all appropriate Building Department permits prior to any work being performed.
4. No work is being requested or approved regarding other outbuildings or site features on the property at this time. Any work, other than what is indicated on the plans dated received by the Planning & Development Department July 7, 2009 will require additional review and approval by the City's Historic Districts Commission.

**Potential Motion (Removal of Outbuilding):** (Based on discussion by the Commission)

**MOTION**, in the matter of File No. HDC 09-001, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES** a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the removal (demolition) of a non-contributing outbuilding located at 1520 Mill Race, Parcel Identification Number 15-01-100-014, with the following Findings and Conditions:

**Findings:**

1. The existing outbuilding is a non-contributing resource located within the Stoney Creek Historic District.
2. The removal of the non-contributing resource **will/will not** have a negative impact on the character of the Stoney Creek Historic District.

3. The removal of the indicated portions of the existing resource (home) are applicable under the Secretary of the Interior's Standards #2 (i.e. "2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided") as the resource does not contribute to the Stoney Creek Historic District.
4. The removal (demolition) of the outbuilding will occur after the renovation and new construction is completed on the main building (house) located on the property.

If denying – include reason for denial along with information about how to correct the application and how to reapply.

**Conditions: (Only necessary if approval is being granted)**

1. Prior to removal of the existing non-contributing resource (outbuilding), the applicant will obtain all appropriate permits and approval of the proposed work plans from the City's Building Department.