| RFP-RH-20-020 Wetlands and Environmental | | | | |
|--|---|---|--|---|
| Consulting Services | | | | |
| | | | | |
| NAME | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Wightman & Associates, Inc. | Cardno, Inc. | ASTI Environmental |
| ADDRESS | 710 Avis Drive, Suite 100 | 2303 Pipestone Road | 8000 Kensington Ct. | 10448 Citation Drive Suite 100 |
| | Ann Arbor, MI 48108 | Benton Harbor, MI 49022 | Brighton, MI 48116 | Brighton, MI 48116 |
| Firm Established | 1914 | 1946 | 2011 | 1985 |
| Years providing similar services. Historical narrative | Founded as a civil engineering firm by four graduates of | Has been providing environmental services for 35 years. | Provides a wide range of infrastructure consulting, design | , Is a full-service environmental consulting firm with office |
| | the California Institute of Technology and has been based | | engineering and construction services over a broad | in Brighton, Grand Rapids, and Detroit. ASTI has |
| | in Pasadena, CA since 1966. Completed projects that | engineer and surveyor. In 1971 became Wightman. The | 6 6 | completed over 11,400 projects during the past 35 years, |
| | had global significance, such as a tsunami wave study for | | Multidisciplinary teams of professionals provide a full | primarily in Michigan. Their mission focuses exclusively |
| | the atomic Energy Commission to master planning and | employees, including twenty-one licensed engineers, six | range of ecological consulting and restoration services, | on environmental and ecological investigations, |
| | designing coastal protection measures for Egypt's Nile | licensed architects, six licensed surveyors, and twenty | with expertise in watershed planning, stream and | assessment, compliance, remediation and restoration. |
| | River Delta. In December 1991 became a publicly traded | | ecosystem restoration, mitigation design, wetland | ASTI's six directors lead groups of environmental |
| | enterprise. The company has grown substantially, | forms of public and private entities, including county, | services, endangered species consulting, designing natura | 0 |
| | expanding its markets, services, and clientele through | city, township, village, tribal governments, private | systems for storm water/wastewater, archaeology, and | ecological assessment, resource restoration and |
| | internal growth and international acquisitions. | developers and industrial and commercial clients. | green infrastructure, permitting and compliance, and GIS | |
| | internal growth and international acquisitions. | developers and industrial and confinercial chefts. | | |
| | | | analysis and database management. | redevelopment and remediation design. |
| Public Sector Clients | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Current Clients | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Clients served past 3 years | List provided | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Full Time Employees | 14,136 | 132 | 44 Michigan based | 38 |
| Part Time Employees | 4,464 | 7 part-time and 6 interns | 3 Michigan based | 4 |
| Employees capable of performing specific services requested in RFP | 200 Full-time in Michigan 25 Part-time in Michigan | 6 Environmental staff, 5 GIS Staff, 1 planner, 20 engineering staff, 3 survey staff. | List of full-time and part time specific services and quantity for each listed in response for both FT and PT. | 31 full-time and 4 part-time |
| Certifications of firm | Professional wetland scientist; Wetland professional in | As firm they do not hold any credentials and is not | Professional Engineer, Certified professional geologists, | Professional wetland scientist, DNR and USFWS |
| | training, Certified professional geologist, professional | maintaining any certifications. Employees within their | certified waste water treatment operators, Certified | endangered species permits, Commercial pesticide |
| | engineer, certified hazardous materials management, | company hold individual certifications and/or licenses. | hazardous materials managers, Certified underground | applicators license (MI), Registered professional |
| | asbestos inspector of Michigan, more listed in response. | company nord marvidual contineations and/or necessos. | storage tank qualified consultant. More listed in | engineer, EGLE Certified Storm water Operator, more |
| | usbestos hispector of Michigan, more fisted in response. | | response | listed in response |
| Additional Services | Environmental consulting, ecological services, material | Employs over 140 people in the environmental, | | Surveys and Assessments for Lead-based paint, asbestos, |
| Additional Services | testing services, environmental engineering, subsurface | engineering, surveying, architectural, GIS fields. Within | the areas of archaeology, archeogeophysics, | radon, and mold. Pre-demolition HAZMAT surveys and |
| | utility engineering. More listed in response. | these disciplines their staff is made up of people with a | geomorphology, history, architectural history, and historia | |
| | utility engineering. More listed in response. | wide variety of backgrounds/experience. | preservation. More listed in response. | listed in response. |
| | | wide variety of backgroundsexperience. | preservation. More insied in response. | listed in response. |
| COST PROPOSAL: | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) |
| Staff Categories: | Field Wetland Scientist \$68.00 | Principal \$210.00 | Field Technician \$45-60 | Director \$170 |
| | Field Geologist \$68.00 | Senior Licensed Staff \$175.00 | Senior Technician/Field Supervisor \$60-75 | Associate III \$125 |
| | Administrator \$68.00 | Licensed Staff III \$140.00 | Project Assistant/Coordinator \$60-85 | Associate II \$95 |
| | Scientist II \$85.00 | Licensed Staff II \$130.00 | Sr. Project Assistant/Coordinator \$70-85 | Associate I \$82 |
| | Lead Wetland Scientist \$92.00 | Professional Staff V \$140.00 | Computer/Production Specialist \$60-75 | Technician \$65 |
| | Field Engineer \$92.00 | Professional Staff IV \$125.00 | Technical Editor \$75-90 | GIS/CAD Technician \$82 |
| | GIS Specialist \$100.00 | Professional Staff II \$95.00 | GIS, CADD, or Drafting Consultant \$80-95 | Clerical Staff \$62 |
| | Scientist III \$110.00 | Licensed Staff I \$115.00 | Assistant Staff Consultant \$75-90 | |
| | Permitting Specialist \$117.00 | Administrative \$70.00 | Staff Consultant \$90-105 | |
| | Scientist IV \$130.00 | Licensed Staff I \$115.00 | Sr. Staff Consultant \$95-110 | |
| | Senior Engineer / Scientist \$160.00 | Technician IV \$90.00 | Project Consultant \$85-100 | |

| NAME | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Wightman & Associates, Inc. | Cardno, Inc. | ASTI Environmental |
|---|---|---|--|---|
| ADDRESS | 710 Avis Drive, Suite 100 | 2303 Pipestone Road | 8000 Kensington Ct. | 10448 Citation Drive Suite 100 |
| | Contract Manager \$175.00 | Technician I \$70.00 | Sr. Project Consultant \$90-105 | |
| | Expert Witness \$250.00 | Administrative \$70.00 | Sr. Consultant \$115-130 | |
| | | | | |
| Subcontracted Categories: | All Direct labor will be provided by Tetra Tech | Drilling, Laboratory Analytical Services and other services listed at Actual Costs. | Equipment list provided with pricing. | Not applicable |
| Additional Administrative Overhead for subcontracted services | 7.50% | 10.00% | 10.00% | 15.00% |
| Percentage of yearly increase to contract | | | | |
| | 2021 2.50% | 1.50% | 3-5% | 1.00% |
| | 2022 2.50% | 1.50% | 3-5% | 1.00% |
| | 2023 2.50% | 1.50% | 3-5% | 1.00% |
| | 2024 2.50% | 1.50% | 3-5% | 1.00% |
| Reimbursable Items | Please see full page of reimbursable items | Travel, Mileage Postage, Mileage, Black and White Prints All 10% | Copies, mileage, lodging, meals, administrative services and education/outreach program participation. | Overhead and common reimbursable are included in the rate listed above. ASTI's MDOT audited indirect cost rate is 238.92%, but overhead is included in rates above. |
| Exceptions | Vendor has list of exceptions in response. | Vendor has list of exceptions in response. | Vendor has list of exceptions in response. | None |
| Billing Procedures | Contracts are billed as time and materials, not to exceed without prior written authorization. Invoices will be provided electronically monthly with net 30 terms for payment. | Will prepare a monthly invoice that includes amount of monthly payment, itemization, number of hours spent on additional services, fees associated with these hours, balance of costs remaining. Payment will be net 30. | Monthly and on project closeout, the Project manager is provided a pre-bill for review from the Finance Department. The Project Manager reviews the pre-bills to ensure that all time listed is correctly assigned to the project, expenses are appropriately listed for the project, and clear billing instructions are provided by the finance department. | Monthly billing cycle procedures and pre-invoice report for each active client in the database. Account Manager reviews all charges to the project looking for posting errors and other possible over charges. |
| Attached financial statement | Attached. | No, 2019 is not available yet. 2018 available upon request. | Attached. | Yes |

| RFP-RH-20-020 Wetlands and Environmental | | | | |
|--|---|--|--|---|
| Consulting Services | | | | |
| | | | | |
| NAME | Environmental Resources Group, LLC | Niswander Environmental. LLC | SME | Environmental Consulting & Technology, Inc. (ECT) |
| ADDRESS | 28003 Center Oaks Ct. Suite 106 | 9436 Maltby Road | 13019 Pauline Drive | 2200 Commonwealth Boulevard, Suite 300 |
| | Wixom, MI 48393 | Brighton, MI 48116 | Shelby Twp., MI 48315 | Ann Arbor, MI 48105 |
| Firm Established | 2009 | 2004 | 1964 | 1988 |
| | | | | |
| Years providing similar services. Historical narrative | Was established in 2009 to provide professional services | Niswander has been providing comprehensive wetland | Since the late 1990s, SME has completed thousands of | Has been providing environmental and engineering |
| | to public and private sector clients. Has grown to a staff | and environmental services to a variety of clients since | environmental projects across a wide range of services. | services to the public and private sector clients. |
| | of 26. Provides Michigan based resources to complete | 2004. Offers environmental solutions for corporations, | SME provides Phase I and II ESAs (including vapor | |
| | work requirements for this scope of work. Are familiar | municipalities, corporations, government agencies, | intrusion assessments), baseline environmental | |
| | with local geology, ecosystems. and other natural features | 1 0 | remediation and exposure pathway mitigation, | |
| | resources. Has significant prior experience with | comprehensive services including site and engineering | construction soil management assessments, | |
| | conducting Phase I and Phase II Environmental site | plan reviews, site assessments, infrastructure and project | hydrogeological studies, wetland delineations, risk | |
| | assessments. | planning and grant acquisition, site design, construction | assessments, underground storage tank management, | |
| | | oversite and administration. Specialize in comprehensive | * | |
| | | wetland services. | management, indoor air quality assessments, and | |
| | | | industrial hygiene studies. | |
| Public Sector Clients | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Current Clients | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Clients served past 3 years | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| | 15 | 7 | 295 | 163 |
| Full Time Employees Part Time Employees | 15 | 4-5 | 295 | 35 |
| | | | | |
| Employees capable of performing specific services | List provided, will partner with Natural Community | 7 Full-time | 40 full-time positions listed. | Positions and titles provided. |
| requested in RFP | Services who has 8 full-time employees. | 4-5 Part-time | | |
| Certifications of firm | OSHA 40-hour HAZWOPER, Certified underground | Professional Wetland Scientist | Certified Groundwater Professional (CGWP), Certified | Licensed professional engineer, professional geologist, |
| | storage tank professional geologist, professional geologist | | Professional Geologist, Professional Geologist, Licensed | certified landscape designer, licensed landscape architect, |
| | certified waste treatment operator, certified lead | Certified Pesticide Applicator | Professional Geologist, Professional Geologist, Elcensed | asbestos inspector, board of professional geoscientist |
| | Inspector/Risk Assessor, more listed in response. | LEED AP | Manager, Professional Engineer, Professional Surveyor. | license, more certifications listed in response. |
| | inspector/Kisk Assessor, more listed in response. | More listed in response | Wanager, Frofessional Engineer, Frofessional Surveyor. | ncense, more certifications fisted in response. |
| Additional Services | Asbestos Surveys, Lead inspections, CADD services | Construction services, Woodland management, hydro | For more than 55 years, SME has provided engineering | Air quality, performance assurance and compliance, and |
| | Asocsios Surveys, Lead inspections, CADD services | geomorphic stream assessments & Natural channel design | | water resources. Services within these areas span the |
| | | services, Threatened and endangered species surveys, | Great Lakes region and beyond. Specializes in | power; mining; oil and gas; manufacturing and industry; |
| | | Fish habitat assessments and surveys, wetland mitigation | geotechnical, environmental, pavement, building and | land development; financial, professional, and |
| | | design, construction, and controlled burns. | construction materials, building enclosures and metals | government sectors. |
| | | design, construction, and controlled burns. | and coatings consulting and design services. | government sectors. |
| COST PROPOSAL: | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) |
| Staff Categories: | Principal \$161 | Principal \$185-200 | Senior Consultant \$195 | Senior Principal Scientist/Engineer \$250 |
| | Senior Project Manager \$150 | Senior Ecologist \$165-185 | Project Mgr./Sr. Licensed Surveyor \$160 | Principal Scientist/Eng; certified ind. Hygienist \$210 |
| | Senior Engineer/Geologist/Scientist \$144 | Ecologist \$90-115 | Sr. Project Eng./Geologist/Consultant \$160 | Senior Scientist/Engineer III \$195 |
| | Staff Engineer/Geologist/Scientist \$119 | Technician \$80-95 | Civil Designer/Licensed Surveyor \$135 | Senior Scientist/Engineer II \$185 |
| | Field Engineer/Geologist/Scientist/CADD \$97 | Seasonal Worker \$65-75 | Project Eng./Geologist/Consultant \$135 | Senior Scientist / Engineer I \$175 |
| | Senior Technician \$87 | | Sr. Staff Eng./Geologist/Specialist/surveyor \$120 | Senior Associate Scientist/Eng III \$140 |
| | Senior Administrative \$81 | | Staff Eng./Geologist/Specialist \$110 | Associate Scientist/Engineer I \$105 |
| | Environmental Technician \$65 | | Field Eng./Geologist/specialist/survey tech \$100 | Sr. Project Coordinator \$100 |
| | Administrative \$60 | | | Sr. Technician; GIS/CAD Operator/Tech \$95 |
| | | | | Sr. Project Coordinator \$100 |
| | | | | Project Coordinator \$90 |

| NAME | Environmental Resources Group, LLC | Niswander Environmental. LLC | SME | Environmental Consulting & Technology, Inc. (ECT) |
|---|--|--|--|---|
| ADDRESS | 28003 Center Oaks Ct. Suite 106 | 9436 Maltby Road | 13019 Pauline Drive | 2200 Commonwealth Boulevard, Suite 300 |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Subcontracted Categories: | List of subcontracted items in response | List of subcontracted positions in response. | Not applicable | Not applicable |
| Additional Administrative Overhead for subcontracted services | 15.00% | 10.00% | Not applicable | 15.00% |
| Percentage of yearly increase to contract | | | | |
| | 21 5.00% | 0.00% | 3.00% | 3.00% |
| | 22 5.00% | 0.00% | 3.00% | 3.00% |
| - | 23 5.00% | 0.00% | 3.00% | 3.00% |
| 202 | 24 5.00% | 0.00% | 3.00% | 3.00% |
| Reimbursable Items | Reimbursable items and all-inclusive list of other charges are in response. | List or reimbursable items is provided in response. | Vehicle mileage, out of town expenses, subcontracted expenses, direct expenses, hard copies, plotting. | Actual expense of transportation and subsistence of principals and employees, consultants' fees, subcontractors' fees, toll telephone calls, fax transmissions, etc. A 15% service charge will be applied to all reimbursable expenses |
| Exceptions | None | None | Exception to the signature page. | Vendor has list of exceptions in response. |
| Billing Procedures | Will invoice on a time and material basis. Personnel will be charged based on their function to the project. Field supplies and equipment will be charged on a usage basis. Subcontractor services will be charged at cost plus 15%. Payment terms are net 30. | Fee will be provided on a time and materials basis per project. Direct expenses will be billed at cost plus 15%. Will submit invoices at the completion of a task or monthly, whichever occurs first. | Billing terms are net 30. | Uses BST Enterprise management information system for project control. The system functions as a unit of a computerized accounting package, designed to interact and use all other information provided by the accounting system, such as time sheet entry, accounts payable, operating supplies, and subcontractor costs. Invoicing occurs on a monthly basis. |
| Attached financial statement | Yes | | No. 2019 statements will not be available until March. Will be available at the time. | Yes |

| RFP-RH-20-020 Wetlands and Environmental | | | |
|--|---|--|---|
| Consulting Services | | | |
| | | | |
| NAME | Golder Associates Inc. | Environmental Testing and Consulting, Inc. | GEI Consultants of Michigan, P.C. |
| ADDRESS | 27200 Haggerty Rd., Suite B-12 | 28900 W. Huron River Drive | 9282 General Drive, Suite 180 |
| | Farmington Hills, MI 48331 | Romulus, MI 48174 | Plymouth, MI 48170 |
| Firm Established | 1960 | 1989 | 1970 |
| Years providing similar services. Historical narrative | Is a global, employee-owned organization. Has 155 | Is a multidisciplinary environmental consulting firm who | Founded in 1970, is a mid-sized, internally-owned |
| 1 0 | offices worldwide, more than 7,500 employees help their | specializes in Phase I and II Environmental Site | consulting firm specializing in environmental, |
| | clients find sustainable solutions. They provide a wide | Assessments (ESAs), baseline Environmental | geotechnical, water resources engineering and planning |
| | range of independent consulting, design and construction | Assessments, Due care documentation, Wetlands | and ecological sciences. Services support all project |
| | services to their clients in their specialist areas of earth, | Delineation/Mitigation, Environmental Reviews, | activities from initial project feasibility assessment and |
| | environment and energy. Has skilled engineers, | Environmental Audits, Asbestos, Lead-Based Paint, Mold | 1 5 5 |
| | scientists, project managers, and other technical | Surveys, Risk Assessments, Clearances, Operation & | construction, testing, and final documentation. They have |
| | specialists who ae committed to helping them succeed by | Maintenance Plans, Training, hazard evaluations. | completed over 50,000 projects globally and are large |
| | embedding sustainable development principles and | Technical knowledge and regulatory experience allows | enough to take on projects of any size, yet small enough |
| | practices into their projects | them to provide solutions that focus on limiting | that will have experience professionals working and |
| | practices into their projects | environmental liabilities and minimizing financial | advising the City on projects. |
| | | <u> </u> | |
| Public Sector Clients | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Current Clients | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Clients served past 3 years | List provided. | List provided. | List provided. |
| Full Time Employees | 7,500 globally. 61 within Michigan | 65 | 902 |
| Part Time Employees | 0 | 20 | 77 |
| Employees capable of performing specific services requested in RFP | 54 full-time staff members in Michigan. | Five full-time employees and one sub-consultant. | Positions and titles provided for both full-time and part- time. |
| Certifications of firm | Professionals are properly licensed and certified in their | Economically disadvantaged women owned business, | Certified Asbestos Inspector, Certified construction |
| | areas of specialization and expertise. | woman business enterprise national certificate, General | manager, certified ecological restoration praction, |
| | | services administration, disadvantaged business empire, | Certified ecologist, certified floodplain manager, |
| | | HUD section 3 business concern. More provided in | certified nursing assistant, certified professional geologist, |
| | | response | certified wildlife biologist |
| Additional Services | Operates soils and concrete analysis laboratory at the | Asbestos & Hazardous Material Building inspections, | Provides wide array of additional services including but |
| | Lansing, Michigan office providing technical analysis of | O&M Plan Development, Project Design, Project | not limited to, grant preparation and management, |
| | soil properties and concrete characteristics. | management, Indoor Air quality assessment, biological | geotechnical services, and hydrology/hydrologic |
| | | containment assessments, environmental and safety | modeling. |
| | | compliance audits. Training for Asbestos, Lead, Mold, | |
| | | hazcom, respiratory protection. More listed in response. | |
| COST PROPOSAL: | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) | Cost proposal (Per Hour) |
| Staff Categories: | Senior Practice/Program Leader \$225 | CPG Hydrogeologist \$90 | Principal Wetland Scientist \$230 |
| | Practice/Program Leader \$209 | Wetlands Specialist/Surveys \$90 | Sr. Environmental Engineer \$161 |
| | Senior Consultant \$199 | Biologist Ecological Risk Assess \$85 | Sr. Ecologist \$145 |
| | Senior Engineer/Scientist \$162 | Senior QA/QC Environmental Mgr \$140 | Environmental Engineer/Scientist \$124 |
| | Sr. Project Engineer/Scientist \$139 | ArcGIS/CAD/ERSI \$75 | Staff Wetland Scientist \$88 |
| | Project Engineer/Scientist \$116 | Public Meeting \$110 | Staff Engineer \$88 |
| | Staff Engineer \$98 | Expert Witness \$120 | Staff Environmental Scientist \$77 |
| | Engineer/Scientist \$88 | Brownfields Consulting \$55 | Environmental Technician \$77 |
| | Senior Draftsperson \$103 | Asbestos Consulting \$55 | GIS Professional \$81 |
| | Staff Draftsperson \$90 | Lead-based Paint Project Manager \$55 | CADD Technician \$81 |
| | Draftsperson \$76 | Mold Consulting \$55 | Administrative Assistant \$68 |

| NAME | Golder Associates Inc. | Environmental Testing and Consulting, Inc. | GEI Consultants of Michigan, P.C. |
|---|--|---|---|
| ADDRESS | 27200 Haggerty Rd., Suite B-12 | 28900 W. Huron River Drive | 9282 General Drive, Suite 180 |
| | Senior Technician \$94 | Brownfield Project Manager \$270 | |
| | Technician \$67 | Lead-based paint consulting \$55 | |
| Subcontracted Categories: | | Please see list of subcontracted categories. | Can self perform services. Not anticipating the need for subcontractors. |
| Additional Administrative Overhead for subcontracted services | 15.00% | 25.00% | 5.00% |
| Percentage of yearly increase to contract | | | |
| 2021 | 3.00% | 0.00% | 2.50% |
| 2022 | 3.00% | 0.00% | 2.50% |
| 2023 | 3.00% | 3.00% | 2.50% |
| 2024 | 3.00% | 0.00% | 2.50% |
| Reimbursable Items | Direct costs, including materials, travel, subsidence, and subcontractor costs, will be invoiced at cost plus a minimum general and administrative fee of 15%. Services such as CAD/GIS computers is \$25 per hour. | Travel \$0.34/mile PID Monitor for PH II ESA and contamination field activities \$100/day or \$300/week Interphase Probe/measurer (free product) \$120/day | List of reimbursable items in response. |
| Exceptions | N/A | None | None. |
| Billing Procedures | Gave account numbers in this section. | Jobs will be billed according to the contact. Contract with a 30-day billing cycle will get the invoice and report sent over in the same email once the report is complete. | Services rendered will be invoiced within 30 days of the month end date according to the company accounting calendar. Invoices are due within 30 days of the date of invoicing. They prefer to email invoices directly to and accounts payable email box. |
| Attached financial statement | No. Privately help, employee owned and does not publicly release financial statements. | No, Accountant was not able to prepare. Profit& Loss and balance sheet attached. | Yes |