



Department of Planning and Development

Staff Report to the Historic Districts Commission

August 10, 2018

1812 S. Rochester Road – Fence change - continuation	
REQUEST	Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the fence on the east edge of the property
APPLICANT	Stanley Finsilver
FILE NO.	HDC # 18-014
PARCEL NO.	15-22-451-035
ZONING	O-1-with a FB-3 Flexible Business 3 overlay
HISTORIC DISTRICT	1812 S. Rochester Road
STAFF	Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting

In this Report:

Request 1

Historical Information 2

Review Considerations 2

Summary 4

Potential Motion 5

Request

The site is located on the west side of Rochester Road, north of Hamlin. The historic resource has been preserved, with a 1987 addition, and separate new office building from the late 1990s located to the rear of the historic resource. The applicant is leasing space in the building to a licensed day care center. As a licensed day care center, the applicant is required by state law to have an outdoor play area with a tall fence, therefore the applicant is proposing to replace the existing picket fence on the east edge of the south lawn with a 6’ tall vinyl privacy or picket fence.

The Commission approved the remainder of the application for the south fence line, new playground equipment, and north doors at the August 9, 2018 meeting.

The present fence on the east and south sides of the building was approved by the Commission in 2012 on the condition that white picket fencing be used on both sides.

Historical Information

The subject site is a single-resource historic district. The frame house was constructed ca. 1910 and is referred to as the Burch House, the names of the original owners. The house is an excellent example of the Neoclassical style. The addition on the west side of the original house was constructed in 1987.

The separate rear office building and 1987 addition do not contribute to the property.

Review Considerations

The applicant originally submitted three options for fencing – the Commission has approved the 6’ tall vinyl privacy fence for the south side of the property and asked for renderings for both the privacy and picket fence for the east side. The proposed fence will be in the same location as the existing white picket fence. The east side of the fence is at the façade of the historic building and there is landscaping in front of it.

Views of Existing:



Option 1 – applicant preferred – construct a 6’ tall white vinyl privacy fence on the east side.



Red line indicates height of previous picket fence

Option 2 – construct a 6’ tall white vinyl picket fence on the east side.



Summary

1. The site contains both contributing and non-contributing resources.
2. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of an existing fence on the east side of the south lawn with 6’ tall vinyl privacy or picket fence.
3. The white vinyl picket fence proposed in Option 2 will be similar in appearance to the existing picket fence, although taller, it is compatible with the historic portion of the building.
4. Staff comments – as long as fence option 2 is chosen all the proposed east side fence will meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The proposed picket fence is compatible with the existing property and will not destroy any character defining features.

5. The applicant has submitted the proposed plans to the City's Building Department for a formal review. Any work performed in connection with this project will be required to meet all zoning and building codes, rules and regulations.

Potential Motion

(Subject to adjustment based on Commission discussion)

MOTION, in the matter of File No. HDC 18-014 – south lawn east side fence, that the Historic Districts Commission **APPROVES/DENIES/POSTPONES** the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the fence as proposed for the single-resource historic district located at 1812 South Rochester Road, Parcel Identification Number 15-22-451-035, with the following Findings and Conditions:

Findings:

1. The replacement of the fence on the east side of the south lawn with a 6' tall **picket/privacy** fence **will not/will** impact or alter the contributing resource on the property.
2. The replacement of the fence on the east side of the south lawn with a 6' tall **picket/privacy** fence **appears to be/does not appear to be** compatible in mass, height, scale and design features with the existing resource in the District.
3. The replacement of the fence on the east side of the south lawn with a 6' tall **picket/privacy** fence **are/are not** compatible with the existing structure and within the District.
4. The replacement of the fence on the east side of the south lawn with a 6' tall **picket/privacy** fence **is/is not** in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard for Rehabilitation and Guidelines Numbers 9 and 10 as follows:
 - 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - 10) *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*