SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSALS TABULATION

| NAME | Natural Community Services | Sherman Nursery Farms | Davey Tree Expert Co. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDRESS | Southfield, MI | Columbus, MI | Auburn Hills, MI 48326 |
| Years in Business | 5 | 46 | 136 |
| Years providing tree planting services | 5 | 30 | 125 |
| Full Time Employees | 2 | 6 | 7900 |
| Part Time Employees | 2 | 2 | 1580 |
| Experience/Financial Capability of Company | Have executed large tree, wildflower, | Experience comes from past projects | Provided financial statements |
| to Carry Out Contract | other green infrastructure planting projects | as well as education. Been performing |  |
|  | including MI DNR, City Royal Oak, Twp of | projects of this type and many related |  |
|  | Independence, land conservancies, and | disciplines for 45 yrs. Scott Sherman |  |
|  | private landowners. | degree in Landscape Horticulture from |  |
|  |  | Michigan State University. Employees |  |
|  |  | have training years exp in Master Gardner |  |
|  |  | program, and related professions in landscape |  |
|  |  | industry. Financial capacity includes line |  |
|  |  | credit with bank, bonding capacity \$2million agg |  |
|  |  | and single \$1million. MDOT prequal \$1million |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Principals/Supervisory Background | John DeLisle - Principal Ecologist and Owner | Scott Sherman - President and Secretary, On-site | Josh Leo - Certified Arborist, Assoc Degree |
|  | John Deslippe - Certified Arborist | supervisor, BS MSU Landscape Horticulture. | in Landscape Horticulture from OCC |
|  | Steve Turner - Certified Arborist | Howard Sherman - Vice President, BS from | Matt Peasley 2015 DITS Graduate, 10 |
|  | Liz Sanford - Project Manager | Northern Michigan University, CDL | years experience, 2 years college |
|  |  | Pamela Sherman - Treasurer Office Manager | Bryan Williams 12 years Landscape Exp, |
|  |  | Richard Kinney - Master Gardener - 7 years exp | 2 years college |
|  |  | Walter Winle - 7 years landscape exp | Ramiro Cortez - Foremen 5 years, 25 years |
|  |  |  | landscape experience. |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Comparable Projects | Royal Oak Nature Society | MDOT Welcome Center | Marcus Management |
|  | Macomb County Dept of Roads | MDOT 1-94/1-69 Interchange | Kramer Triad Management Group |
|  | Lathrup Village Preserve Site Master Plan | Rochester Tree Planting | J.L. Gardell PLC. |
|  | Clinton Township | Various Commercial Landscape Projects | City Rochester |
|  | Macomb County Dept of Planning | City of Lapeer - Project Clay/Court Street | Township Orion |
|  |  | City of Birmingham Tree Plantings | City Troy |
|  |  |  |  |

SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSALS TABULATION

| NAME | Natural Community Services | Sherman Nursery Farms | Davey Tree Expert Co. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDRESS | Southfield, MI | Columbus, MI | Auburn Hills, MI 48326 |
| Experience with Municipal Govts | Township of Independence | Rochester Hills | City of Rochester |
|  | Macomb County | Lapeer | City of Rochester Hills |
|  | Oakland Schools | Port Huron | Oakland Township |
|  | City Royal Oak | State of Michigan | Orion Township |
|  | Lathrup Village | Rochester | City Troy |
|  | Oakland Township | St. Clair Shores | City of Pontiac |
|  | Orion Township | St. Clair |  |
|  | Fort Gratiot Twp | Richmond |  |
|  | West Bloomfield Twp | Grosse Pointe Woods |  |
|  |  | New Baltimore |  |
|  |  | Warren |  |
|  |  | Dearborn |  |
|  |  | Pleasant Ridge |  |
|  |  | Birmingham |  |
|  |  | Port Huron Twp |  |
|  |  | Lexington |  |
|  |  | Auburn Hills |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Equipment List | Bobcat, Auger, Mini-Excavator, Hand Tools | Freightliner dump stake truck, trailboss trailer | Aerial Lift Truck, Utility Truck, Chip Truck, |
|  | such as shovels and dibbles for potted stock | Gehl 6635 Skidsteer, Nursery Forks-hydraulic, | Chipper, Stump Grinder, Skid Steer Loader, |
|  | water tank. | Water tank - 300 gal, Various handtools, Tree | Log Truck |
|  |  | auger. |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Subcontractors | Arboricultural Services | T.R. Peiprzak | None |
|  | Native Lakescapes | Doviac Trucking |  |
|  | Trine Environmental | H20 Irrigation |  |
|  |  | KCA Services |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Philosophy Relative to Maintenance and | Focus on ecological planning, native | Believe every project requires maintenance | Many things differentiate Davey - |
| Customer Service | landscape design, client education on | and customer service on timely basis. Always | integrity, commitment, experience, |
|  | benefits sustainable landscapes on | review anticipated maintenance and include | capability and expertise. Values aren't |
|  | management of ecosystems, green | as part of proposal. When maintenance not | only thing make different. Employee |
|  | infrastructure and financial resources. | included in specifications, inquire about plans | owned company. Dedication to earning |
|  | Emphasizes to clients designed and | for maintenance. Maintenance provides quicker | accreditations and certifications. Commitment |
|  | planned tree planting, like all green | better establishment of nursery stock, which | to safe and product workplace, ability to |
|  | elements adds biodiversity and | is large beautification and financial investment. | serve public sectors, clients, federal, |


| NAME | Natural Community Services | Sherman Nursery Farms | Davey Tree Expert Co. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDRESS | Southfield, MI | Columbus, MI | Auburn Hills, MI 48326 |
|  | financial assets to land when established | Accommodating proper horticulture maintenance | state, local and drive for delivering |
|  | properly. | and open customer relationship can provide | exceptional client service. No shortcuts |
|  |  | proper establishment new landscape trees/ | to relationships. Clients have opportunity |
|  |  | plants for future. | to rate us. If not satisfied $100 \%$ will work |
|  |  |  | to fix any potential issues. |
|  |  |  |  |
| If planting delay, trees storage to maintain | Will only have material delivered if | Have 5 acre facility with irrigation, mulched area | Trees will be stored on site location |
| healthy condition | weather pattern of temperature, RH , and | to hold trees, and some indoor storage for | in Auburn Hills. Plants will be healed in |
|  | rain is conducive in period time phenologically | certain situations to ensure healthy plant | with mulch and watered with irrigation |
|  | optimal for installation. Trees will be | material. | system daily. Have onsite staff that |
|  | watered, mulched on site as needed |  | will check moisture levels on root balls |
|  | during planting period. |  | and adjust when needed. |
|  |  |  |  |
| Capabilities/knowledge relative to tree | All staff degreed ecological and environmental | Capability to plant up to 402 trees in one day | Able to draw off knowledge of 136 years |
| planting services | professionals. 2 equipment operators | under right conditions. Right conditions being | tree and landscape service. Having own |
|  | and certified arborists on staff, others | have equipment and manpower to plant several | nursery, able to gain access to large |
|  | are subcontractors. | trees, with locations of trees being planned close | variety plant materials in short period |
|  |  | proximity and easily accessible. Have successfully | time. With equipment have access to, can |
|  |  | planted up to 6" caliper w/equipment currently | plant all sizes of plant material. Will also |
|  |  | have on hand. | follow ANSI standards in regards to |
|  |  |  | transporting and planting. |
|  |  |  |  |
| Exceptions | Specify herein only native tree species typically | Following trees unavailable at this time: | None. |
|  | install, we source bioregional genetic material | Caprpiinus beulus Emerald Avenue |  |
|  | only. Will plan other species we research to find | Liquidambar s. Lane Roberts |  |
|  | as non-invasive. Couple of species on list on | Quercus m Urban Pinnacle |  |
|  | invasive species watch lists in Midwest. Will | Ulmus parvfolia Allee |  |
|  | plant exotic species as requested if shown to be | Carya Ovata |  |
|  | non-invasive. Vested in ongoing education |  |  |
|  | process to municipalities about ecophysiology |  |  |
|  | in arboriculture, how ecologically correct tree |  |  |
|  | planting practices impacts establishment costs, |  |  |
|  | tree canopy cover, residential values, |  |  |
|  | c-sequestrian and natural areas less impacted by |  |  |
|  | invasive species. |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR FALL AND SPRING PLANTING OF SELECTED STREET TREES RFP-RH-15-007 SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSALS TABULATION

| NAME | Natural Community Services |  | Sherman Nursery Farms |  | Davey Tree Expert Co. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDRESS | Southfield, MI |  |  | olumbus, MI | Auburn Hills, MI 48326 |  |
| COST PROPOSAL: |  |  |  | Pricing below reflects Supplemental Cost Proposal ubmitted |  |  |
| Abies concolor 6-7' | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 235.45 | \$ | 201.00 |
| Acer campestre | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 271.10 | \$ | 242.00 |
| Acer griseum | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 310.62 | \$ | 311.00 |
| Acer griseum x nikoense | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 312.14 | \$ | 311.00 |
| Acer miyabei State Street | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 252.33 | \$ | 242.00 |
| Acer rubrum Redpointe | \$ | 250.00 | \$ | \$ 278.50 | Not Available |  |
| Acer saccharum Green Mountain | \$ | 200.00 | \$ | \$ 279.86 | \$ | 238.00 |
| Acer saccharum Fall Fiesta or Majesty | \$ | 250.00 | \$ | \$ 251.31 | \$ | 238.00 |
| Acer x freemanii Autumn Blaze | \$ | 200.00 | \$ | \$ 252.67 | \$ | 238.00 |
| Acer x freemanii Celebration | \$ | 250.00 | \$ | \$ | \$ | 228.00 |
| Aesculus Autumn Splendor | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 286.66 | Not Available |  |
| Aesculus Baumanii | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 292.10 | Not Available |  |
| Aesculus Fort McNair | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 296.10 | \$ | 265.00 |
| Amelanchier Autumn Brilliance, Cumulus, Robin Hill, or Spring Flurry | \$ | 200.00 | \$ | \$ 258.10 | \$ | 242.00 |
| Carpinus betulus fastigiata or Frans Fontaine | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 311.30 | \$ | 251.00 |
| Carpinus betulus Emerald Avenue | No Bid |  |  | Not Available | Not Available |  |
| Carpinus caroliniana | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | \$ 311.72 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Carya ovata | \$ | 400.00 |  | Not Available | Not Available |  |
| Celtis Chicagoland, Magnifica, or Ultra | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | S 272.45 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Cercidiphyllum japonicum | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 279.86 | Not Available |  |
| Cercis canadensis | \$ | 300.00 | \$ | \$ 285.30 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Chionanthus retusus | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 289.34 | Not Available |  |
| Cornus Constellation | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | \$ 252.67 | Not Available |  |
| Cornus mas Golden Glory | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 319.29 | \$ | 226.00 |
| Fagus sylvatica (green-leaved) | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 346.49 | Not Available |  |
| Ginkgo biloba Autumn Gold or Halka | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 332.89 | Not Available |  |
| Ginkgo biloba Magyar or Golden Colonnade | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 332.89 | Not Available |  |
| Gleditsia triacanthos Skyline | \$ | 300.00 | \$ | \$ 258.10 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Gymnocladus dioicus (Espresso) | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | \$ 271.70 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Koelreuteria paniculata | No Bid |  | \$ | \$ 279.86 | Not Available |  |

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR FALL AND SPRING PLANTING OF SELECTED STREET TREES RFP-RH-15-007 SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSALS TABULATION

| NAME | Natural Community Services |  | Sherman Nursery Farms |  | Davey Tree Expert Co. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDRESS | Southfield, MI |  | Columbus, MI |  | Auburn Hills, MI 48326 |  |
| Liquidambar styraciflua Lane Roberts | No Bid |  | Not Available |  | Not Available |  |
| Liquidambar styraciflua Moraine | No Bid |  | \$ | 264.22 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Liriodendron tulipifera | \$ | 300.00 | \$ | 258.10 | \$ | 224.00 |
| Liriodendron tulipifera Emerald City | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 291.45 | Not Available |  |
| Maackia amurensis | No Bid |  | \$ | 332.89 | Not Available |  |
| Magnolia acuminata | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 284.28 | Not Available |  |
| Magnolia Daybreak | No Bid |  | \$ | 278.50 | Not Available |  |
| Magnolia Galaxy | No Bid |  | \$ | 305.69 | Not Available |  |
| Magnolia Moonglow | No Bid |  | \$ | 319.29 | Not Available |  |
| Malus Adirondack, Donald Wyman, or Harvest Gold | No Bid |  | \$ | 264.90 | \$ | 195.00 |
| Metasequoia glyptostroboides 2.5" | No Bid |  | \$ | 293.52 | \$ | 230.00 |
| Nyssa sylvatica | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 332.89 | \$ | 286.00 |
| Nyssa sylvatica Forum, Red Rage, or Tupelo Tower | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 323.37 | Not Available |  |
| Parrotia persica Vanessa | No Bid |  | \$ | 282.59 | Not Available |  |
| Picea abies 6-7' | No Bid |  | \$ | 218.56 | \$ | 195.00 |
| Picea glauca 6-7' | No Bid |  | \$ | 223.62 | \$ | 188.00 |
| Pinus strobus 6-7' | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 215.18 | \$ | 181.00 |
| Platanus Exclamation | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 271.70 | Not Available |  |
| Prunus sargentii or Pink Flair | No Bid |  | \$ | 279.86 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Prunus Kwanzan | No Bid |  | \$ | 264.90 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Prunus Okame | No Bid |  | \$ | 285.30 | Not Available |  |
| Prunus Royal Burgandy | No Bid |  | \$ | 264.90 | Not Available |  |
| Quercus alba x robur Crimson Spire | No Bid |  | \$ | 281.22 | Not Available |  |
| Quercus bicolor | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 260.82 | \$ | 238.00 |
| Quercus bicolor x robur Regal Prince | No Bid |  | \$ | 271.70 | \$ | 238.00 |
| Quercus ellipsoidalis | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 278.50 | \$ | 238.00 |
| Quercus macrocarpa | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 260.82 | \$ | 242.00 |
| Quercus macrocarpa Urban Pinnacle | \$ | 450.00 | Not Available |  | Not Available |  |
| Quercus macrocarpa x robur Heritage | No Bid |  | \$ | 264.90 | Not Available |  |
| Quercus muehlenbergii | \$ | 400.00 | \$ | 260.82 | \$ | 242.00 |
| Quercus rubra | \$ | 300.00 | \$ | 271.70 | \$ | 235.00 |

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR FALL AND SPRING PLANTING OF SELECTED STREET TREES RFP-RH-15-007 SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSALS TABULATION

| NAME | Natural Community Services |  | Sherman Nursery Farms |  | Davey Tree Expert Co. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ADDRESS | Southfield, MI |  | Columbus, MI |  | Auburn Hills, MI 48326 |  |
| Syringa pekinensis | No Bid |  | \$ | 267.62 | \$ | 237.00 |
| Syringa reticulate | No Bid |  | \$ | 260.82 | \$ | 237.00 |
| Taxodium distichum Shawnee Brave 2.5" | No Bid |  | \$ | 293.52 | \$ | 252.00 |
| Thuja occidentalis Emerald Green 6-7' | \$ | 175.00 | \$ | 144.89 | \$ | 167.00 |
| Thuja occidentalis Nigra 6-7' | \$ | 175.00 | \$ | 133.07 | \$ | 162.00 |
| Thuja occidentalis Techny 6-7' | \$ | 175.00 | \$ | 133.07 | Not Available |  |
| Tilia americana American Sentry | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 296.18 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Tilia americana Boulevard or Legend | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 326.09 | Not Available |  |
| Tilia americana Redmond | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 279.86 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Tilia americana x cordata Glenleven | No Bid |  | \$ | 323.37 | Not Available |  |
| Tilia cordata Greenspire or Corinthian | No Bid |  | \$ | 251.31 | \$ | 223.00 |
| Tilia cordata x mongolica Harvest Gold | No Bid |  | \$ | 285.30 | Not Available |  |
| Tilia tomentosa | No Bid |  | \$ | 258.10 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Ulmus Accolade | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 243.49 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Ulmus Emerald Sunshine | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 307.92 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Ulmus Frontier | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 271.61 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Ulmus Triumph | \$ | 350.00 | \$ | 243.49 | Not Available |  |
| Ulmus parvifolia Allee | No Bid |  | \$ | 279.86 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Ulmus parvifolia Bosque | No Bid |  | Not Available |  | Not Available |  |
| Zelkova serrata Green Vase | No Bid |  | \$ | 289.34 | \$ | 228.00 |
| Zelkova serrata Musashino | No Bid |  | \$ | 289.34 | \$ | 228.00 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Potential Nursery Sources: | Lodi farms, Ann Arbor |  | Botanico |  | Davey Nursery |  |
|  | Wood Warehouse, Indiana |  | Dave DeMoore Nursery Sales |  | Shemin Nursery |  |
|  | Trim Pines, Grand Blanc |  | Hale \& Hines Nursery Co |  |  |  |
|  | Possibility Place, IL or Wildtype Mason, MI |  | Klynn Nurseries |  |  |  |
|  | Species omitted are either potentially |  | Lake County Nursery |  |  |  |
|  | invasive exotics or unavailable. |  | Listerman \& Associates |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Ray Wiegands Nursery |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Sherman Nursery Farms |  |  |  |

