

|   |   |  |  |
|---|---|--|--|
| RFP-RH-15-035   |   |  |  |
| Human Resource Consulting Services  |   |  |  |
| <b>Vendor Name</b>  | <b>Management Advisory Group International</b>  | <b>Employees Only, Inc., LLC</b>   |  |
| Address   | 13580 Groupe Drive, Suite 200<br>Woodbridge, VA 22192   | 805 Oakwood Drive #100<br>Rochester, MI 48307  |  |
| Firm Established  | 2001  | 1996   |  |
| Years in Business   | 14  | 19   |  |
| Years company providing HR consulting services.   | As company for 14 years, three of partners have provided HR consulting services for nearly 30 years each.   | Team comprised HR experts who can take over full or partial mgmt HR needs.   |  |
| Clients currently served with services described.   | Currently 21 open HR projects of varying size and complexity. Have completed over 500 projects in 24 states.  | Currently service clients across multiple industries. Clients have employees in over 20 states and work with European companies doing business in US.  |  |
| Client References   | Provided  | Provided   |  |
| Employees:  |   | Did not provide  |  |
| Full-Time   | 8   |  |  |
| Part-Time   | 1   |  |  |
| Describe resources and experience capable of bringing to City. Include specialized resources. | Partners and consultants have extensive HR experience. MAG's focus on providing HR studies to municipalities and other public sector agencies. Have developed several software programs designed to enhance HR studies.   | Did not provide.   |  |
| Submit Staff Profiles   | Provided  | Provided   |  |
| Work Plan   | Project planning to include initial meetings with staff to discuss role and task each project, review areas, site visit, goal will be to ensure that team has full understanding City's issues and concerns. Will collect and review data include HR organizational structure, recruitment and selection activities, hiring procedures, staffing plan, etc. Prepare any modifications to work plan document and schedule based on initial evaluation. Ongoing status reports to discuss and explain recent activities and planned activities. Will conduct interviews and present findings. Interviews will be with senior staff, selected key personnel. Prepare initial set of findings that identifies SWOT. Will assess and evaluate HR key processes and procedures. Extensive interviews with HR to develop knowledge and understanding key issues. Meet with City major users. Evaluate HR selected functions based on interviews. Assess gaps identified via internal stakeholders. | Utilize experience to conduct general assessment of City's organizational HR structure, operations and staffing w/focus internal issues, service delivery objectives, understand existing organizational structure, technology and infrastructure needs. Spend significant time with interviews conducted with HR team members to pose interview questions, make information requests, identify overall evaluation of the department talent pool, employment structure, competitive salaries and budget, current flexibility in making changes and headcount levels for department. Minimally would meet with individuals who fulfill roles of Dir Human Resources, Division Director Benefits Administration and Chief of Administration. Purpose of interviews to communicate and document assessment of organizational structure in each dept, key issues facing dept, staffing dept and responsibilities, understand mgmt systems utilized to plan, monitor, adjust approaches, to |  |

| Vendor Name                                      | Management Advisory Group International  | Employees Only, Inc., LLC  |
|--|--|--|
|  | Draft development and prepare confirmation of findings. Develop recommendations. Provide implementation plan, final report and presentation. Meet with staff to discuss report and present to leadership and provide final report. | providing HR services to City, span of control analysis on managerial positions, various alternative approaches to organizing City.  |
| Methods of communication with client             | MAG communicates via phone, email Webex conferences, on site and in person. Pride selves on open communication.  | Service delivery model is single point of contact approach supported by entire team of benefit, HR and payroll professionals that have decades worth of compliance and strategic solution expertise.   |
| How are consultants managed within organization. | Managed every day through internal communications. Have project task lists developed for each project so every project is monitored closely. Any consultant can access project task list to know status of each project.           |  |
| Timeline for project.                            | Four month completion of project.  | 1+ years   |
| Deliverables to be provided.                     | Comprehensive report focusing on each aspect of HR performance and all deliverables identified in RFP.   | Would prepare assessment document reflects analysis of employees only project team in evaluating organizational structure, operations and management issues in City HR and Employee Administration area. Other include Organizational assessment, HR file audit, HR Audit - process and procedures, Compensation audit, benefits evaluation and benchmarking, risk management assessment, compliance assessment, performance management, develop recruiting and hiring strategy, ongoing talent mgmt |
| Contract required?                               | Yes. Provided sample agreement.  |  |
| Billing procedures.                              | Typically requests 20% for initiation, then progressive billings according to tasks as established.  |  |
| Involved in litigation past 5 years.             | No   |  |
| Cost Proposal.                                   |  |  |
| Not-to-Exceed Amount                             | \$ 49,500.00   | \$ 89,000.00   |
| Hourly Rates:                                    |  |  |
|  | Partner \$ 250.00  | Project Mgr \$ 89.00   |
|  | Senior Consultant \$ 175.00  | HR Mgr \$ 79.00  |
|  | Consultant \$ 135.00   | HR Specialist \$ 69.00   |
|  | Office Staff \$ 55.00  | Client Service \$ 69.00  |
|  |  | EO Leadership Team \$ 89.00  |
|  |  | Expenses Charged as pass thru  |
| Administrative overhead for subconsultants       | N/A  |  |
|  |  | *Did not submit utilizing City's proposal forms  |

|   |  |  |   |            |
|---|--|--|---|------------|
| RFP-RH-15-035   |  |  |   |            |
| Human Resource Consulting Services  |  |  |   |            |
| <b>Vendor Name</b>  | <b>Novak Consulting Group</b>  |  | <b>Gallagher Benefit Services</b>   |            |
| Address   | 1776 Mentor Ave<br>Cincinnati, OH 45212  |  | 100 Tri State International Center #240<br>Lincolnshire, IL 60069   |            |
| Firm Established  | 2001   |  | 1927  |            |
| Years in Business   | 14   |  | 88  |            |
| Years company providing HR consulting services.   | Nearly decade. Firm first Public Mgmt Partners sizeable client base of predominantly local government/non-profit. 2009 Julia Novak acquired Public Mgmt Partners and Founded Novak. Leaders in local government and nonprofit communities for high caliber advice developed through subject matter expertise and customized project approaches.  |  | Since 2003 when acquired HR Advantage with over 20 years experience.  |            |
| Clients currently served with services described.   | Several agencies. Listing provided.  |  | With over 160 HR consultants in North Central Region and more nationwide we serve hundreds of clients in areas of HR resource and compensation counseling.  |            |
| Client References   | Provided   |  | Provided  |            |
| Employees:  |  |  |   |            |
| Full-Time   | 8  |  | 160   | Nationwide |
| Part-Time   | 6  |  |   |            |
| Describe resources and experience capable of bringing to City. Include specialized resources. | Extensive working with local government. Focus on providing solutions that work within available resources and culture of organizations we assist. Most innovative solutions in world are valueless if cannot be implemented or will not be accepted by community. Pride selves on ability to listen analyze, work with clients to find not just random selection of best practices taken from manual, but real solutions that can be implemented. Strength ability to build on existing capabilities and resources to help organizations see things from different perspective. Do no operate with pre-packaged set of recommendations. Diligently work to avoid trying to fit clients into standard mold. Recognize will always be competing interests between level and cost of service. Staff substantial experience developing performance measures dept can use to track progress over time. Helped clients create benchmarks that establish baseline for performance and future objectives.   |  | Given extensive experience working with small and middle market organizations approach each project as unique. Aim to customize approach to specific needs of organization. Elieve proposal demonstrates commitment to the City with highest level of service to fit your budget needs. Consultants uniquely qualified as result of having worked as internal HR leaders, achieving advanced certification as HR professionals and frequently serving as thought leaders w/in HR profession. 160 HR professionals located in multiple offices throughout US provide clients with depth of knowledge that comes from collaboration and interaction amongst team and diverse client base. Access to experts in compliance, wellness, actuarial, and risk management.  |            |
| Submit Staff Profiles   |  |  | Provided  |            |
| Work Plan   | Best supported through comprehensive assessment approach that can quickly identify potential areas of improvement. Will allow project team to focus efforts on these areas and best leverage project resources for maximum organization and operational improvement for dept. Novak proposes to use "Six R" approach. Involves soliciting and collecting information on dept responsibilities, resources, requirements and results to identify possible organizational and operational revisions with associated roadmap to implement positive change (graph provided). Task 1: Begin engagement by meeting with City to review details and expectaions of this effort and finalize project schedule, discuss City's interest in study, strengths/weaknesses of current HR structure and operations, and other issues. Will provide City regular status updates. Anticipate several informal opportuntiiies to discuss various project and operating issues. Task 2: Assess Internal Customer Satisfaction solicit feedback from user HR services. COnduct individual interviews with key stakeholders, etc. |  | Begin by asking for available HR related documents/policies/forms. Once reviewed will schedule time onsite at City to speak with individuals who participate in HR function as well as members of mgmt team to review documentation and discuss functions and services of HR. Anticipate being on site up to 20 hours during course of audit. When doing interviews strive to understand current skills, abilities and workload of those who participate in HR function. Aim to understand way dept functions currently as well as needs and desire of individuals that perform tasks. Will seek to understand how HR function is perceived w/in organization and how well it is currently serving needs of employees and managers. Then review additional information received onsite and ask any followup questions or conduct telephone interviews with remaining individuals. Throughout, will review all areas we consider to be critical to functioning of HR including: general organization of dept and role of HR w/in organization, staffing, new hires, benefits and payroll, separations, performance mgmt, compliance. |            |

| Vendor Name                                      | Novak Consulting Group   | Gallagher Benefit Services   |
|--|--|--|
|  | <p>Task 3: Assess HR Dept by collecting detailed data and information regarding department operations. Significant project effort that serves as basis for all analytical components of project, including issue identification and recommendation development.</p> <p>Task 4: Conduct best practice and benchmarking research by evaluating performance of the organization as it compares to industry standards of performance. Task 5: Prepare project deliverables at this point project team will have conducted all information. Issues will be ranked in order of importance and commented and summarized.</p> <p>Includes Organizational Review, Policies and Procedures Review, Staffing Analysis. Final report to include roadmap introduced previously to provide additional detail on recommendations and support implementation efforts by Dept and City.</p> |  |
| Methods of communication with client             | Maintains regular contact with clients throughout each engagement and beyond. In addition to formal project update meetings, routinely communicate with clients in person, via phone or email to address questions or issues that arise during course of project.  | Onsite as well as via phone and email.   |
| How are consultants managed within organization. | President Julia Novak will be engagement manager for project. Will be City's primary point of contact. Will direct work of project team and ensure final deliverables meet firm's high standards of quality.   | Managed by a National Practice Leader in HR Consulting.  |
| Timeline for project.                            | 10/28-12/28. Will refine with City once award.   | 12 weeks.  |
| Deliverables to be provided.                     | Will receive final report, complete with methodology, analysis, cost benefit information and individual recommendations for each aspect of the Department. City will also receive a roadmap. Implementation plan details steps required for execution of each recommendation in final report.  | Assessment report provided and contain a number of sections/charts including: executive summary, HR action items organized by subject, suggested timeframes for correcting/improving individual items, detailed analysis of current employee handbook, analysis of all HR documents provided, general results from employee file audit including common findings from I-9 audit, Review of FLSA Classifications. Once completed will facilitate a meeting to review "state of HR" and delivery final report. Suggestions for future HR related projects will be provided as appropriate. Focus of meeting help establish action plans for next 6-12 months and identify resources available to assist organization in making corrections and improvements. |
| Contract required?                               | Will use City's standard contract  | No.  |
| Billing procedures.                              | Practice to invoice monthly based on work completed.   | Monthly.   |
| Involved in litigation past 5 years.             | No.  | Not feasible to efficiently provide, or necessary in evaluating our company since this is the nature of insurance brokerage business   |
| Cost Proposal.                                   |  |  |
| Not-to-Exceed Amount                             | \$ 32,500.00   | \$ 15,000.00   |
| Hourly Rates:                                    |  |  |
|  | President \$ 250.00  |  |
|  | Org. Assess Practice Ldr \$ 150.00   |  |
|  | Analyst \$ 75.00   |  |
| Administrative overhead for subconsultants       | No   | No   |

|   |   |  |  |
|---|---|--|--|
| RFP-RH-15-035   |   |  |  |
| Human Resource Consulting Services  |   |  |  |
| <b>Vendor Name</b>  | <b>Expert Human Resources LLC</b>   | <b>McGrath Consulting Group</b>  |  |
| Address   | 2425 S. Linden Road Suite D126<br>Flint, MI 48532   | PO Box 190<br>Wonder Lake, IL 60097  |  |
| Firm Established  | 2009  | 2000   |  |
| Years in Business   | 6   | 15   |  |
| Years company providing HR consulting services.   | Over 6 years. Consulted with companies regarding every human resources body of knowledge, including: strategic mgmt, employment law, HR Compliance, Wage and Hour, Employee and Labor Relations, Workplace Planning and Employment, FLSA, FMLA, Compensation, Benefits, OSHA, Policies and Procedures.  | Subsidiary of McGrath Consulting Group, Inc. specializing in public sector consulting. Principals of company bring over 50 years exp in providing public safety and HR resource consulting. Specializes in HR consulting including dept audits, compensation studies, employee handbooks, performance mgmt and executive recruitment.  |  |
| Clients currently served with services described.   | To over 50 companies in all areas of HR consulting, employment law HR compliance, compensation, workforce planning and employment, benefits, employee and labor relations, OSHA,etc. Has provided HR Audits, job analyses, workplace investigations, employee/mgmt training, executive recruitment, and unemployment mgmt for multiple companies of all industries and sizes.   | In past 15 years, have served over 210 clients in 24 states. Studies have included organizational assessments, audits, consolidation, and station studies in addition to host of HR Consulting services provided.  |  |
| Client References   | Provided  | Provide  |  |
| Employees:  |   |  |  |
| Full-Time   | 1   | 2.5  |  |
| Part-Time   | 4   | 15-20  |  |
| Describe resources and experience capable of bringing to City. Include specialized resources. | Award-winning service based company. Consultants consist of owner/President and 4 consultants highly experienced, master degreed and have combined 100 years exp. To stay current subscribes to multiple high quality HR and employment law sites, regularly attends seminars, receives updates regarding HR updates/compliance and regulatory changes. Will provide at no added cost to City access to online complinace HR library, Email newsletters updates of HR and regulatory updates/changes and complimentary assistance with general HR questions.  | Working with municipal organizations of all types for past 15 years. Consultants assigned to project have worked with McGrath Human Resources on human resource projects and/or have worked for governmental entities; however to ensure diversity of opinons, a few of our consultants have private sector experience to add value to our projects. Thus, bring diverse group of individuals to the study to ensure as we review the HR department, we are evaluating it using best practices in field.   |  |
| Submit Staff Profiles   | Provided  | Provided   |  |
| Work Plan   | Meet with mgmt team discuss goals, strategic plans, culture, processes, issues complaints, etc. Gather information e.g. organizational chart, CBA, employee handbook, safety manuals, policies, processes, job descriptions, compensation plan/charts, benefit info, training manuals, orientation information packets, forms, testing docs, employee complaints, grievances, etc., assess key functions relating to HR service delivery, including general processing and workflow, selection and onboarding practices, total reward features, performance mgmt, and succession planning. Review current practices, policies and procedures, identify opportunities for immediate improvement. Create questionnaire and conduct interviews with HR staff and key leadership to discuss the functions and services of HR, develop benchmarks in key areas to measue effectiveness of HR functions, evaluate current HR resource structure, programs, processes for strategic effectiveness, resource efficiency, best practices utilization in meeting current and future needs of City. Review personnel files and I-9 forms to ensure compliance. | As City is an innovative leader in provision of services to the community, one of its most valuable resources is its employees. Prudent to occassionally conduct an audit of HR function to ensure it is meeting needs of clients; as well as ascertain if it is still effective and efficient. Objects of HR RFP would be: perform comprehensive audit of all functions relating to HR (employment, administration, benefits (limited extent), compensation, perofrmance mgmt, termination), make recommendation on human resource system changes and an implementation plan, develop benchmarks in key area to measure effectiveness of HR function, identify potential cost savings and cost liabilities associated with HR function, recommendations for future direction of HR dept and if appropriate, costs associated with recommendation. To accomplish audit would do information gathering including obtaining, reviewing and discussing major functions of HR dept. List of docuemnts would be requested in advance of site visit. Interviews with all dept heads to discuss functions and services of HR, can also meet with small groups of employees to discuss services of |  |

| Vendor Name                                      | Expert Human Resources LLC   | McGrath Consulting Group   |
|--|--|--|
|  | Identify potential cost savings and liabilities associated with HR function, identify potential cost savings and liabilities associated with HR function, make recommendations for changes, consistent with projects' statement of purpose, work with HR Director and leadership to identify strategic priorities and develop action plan. Develop and draft final report of findings and recommendations; identify and prioritize a 2-5 year project plan with specific methodologies and phased approach to implementation. Present findings and recommendations to HR Director and others. Make revisions if needed, prepare for and assist with implementation of action plan.   | dept, spend time with members of HR dept to gain understanding of positions, responsibilities, ideas for efficiency and future services. Based upon assessment of all this develop draft and final report of findings and recommendations.   |
| Methods of communication with client             | Able to in multiple formats. Provide most convenient mode of communication for each client. Including phone, email, fax, text, direct mail, onsite visits, conference calls, go to meeting, Skype and others as requested/needed.  | Communication is key. First site visit will spend time with HR to understand needs, issues that need to be dealt with, and expectation of outcomes. In addition communication on site, emails and phone calls are common.  |
| How are consultants managed within organization. | Bound by confidentiality agreements, Decision maker, the President, reviews all projects and filters/delegates projects/requests/assignments to HER Consultants. President also regular contact person for clients.  | Dr. McGrath is lead on project. Unless otherwise stated will be primary person to have contact with City. If areas in which consultant is assigned, and agreed with HR director may need communication between consultant and city. All will be approved prior.  |
| Timeline for project.                            | 9-12 weeks   | 5 months   |
| Deliverables to be provided.                     | Comprehensive roadmap to HR for implementation of changes or improvements to its current state in order to deliver services to internal and external customers in a more efficient and effective manner. Road map shall include following deliverables: Detailed project schedule for implementation consultant's recommended changes with critical milestones noted for review and approval during implementation process, report consisting of: regulatory constraints that may hinder HR's ability to implement, recommended technology improvements, compilation of information obtained through interviews and focus groups regarding the assessment of HR's services, estimated calculation of costs associated with each of recommended changes and strategies for implementation. Recommendations will be prioritized, presentation of findings and recommendations to HR director and their designated representatives. | Report that outlines areas of strength and opportunity for future. If additional work is necessary, report will outline scope of work needed and cost to complete the work. Additional work will be provided in a menu format so City can select which items feels should be completed externally and those that would be better served to do internally. Report will also detail prioritization of identified outcomes. |
| Contract required?                               | Yes. Provided.   | Yes. Provided  |
| Billing procedures.                              | Monthly.   | Project divided into 3 payments. Initiation of project, percentage upon submission of draft documents, and balance upon final.   |
| Involved in litigation past 5 years.             | No.  | No.  |
| Cost Proposal.                                   |  |  |
| Not-to-Exceed Amount                             | \$ 31,960.00   | \$ 10,000.00   |
| Hourly Rates:                                    | Sr. Executive Cons. \$ 110.00  |  |
|  | Senior Cons. \$ 100.00   |  |
|  | Senior Cons. \$ 100.00   |  |
|  | Consultant \$ 80.00  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| Administrative overhead for subconsultants       | No   |  |
|  |  |  |

|   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| RFP-RH-15-035   |   |  |
| Human Resource Consulting Services  |   |  |
| <b>Vendor Name</b>  | <b>Matrix Consulting Group</b>  |  |
| Address   | 201 San Antonio Circle #148   |  |
|   | Mountain View, CA 94040   |  |
| Firm Established  | 2003  |  |
| Years in Business   | 13  |  |
| Years company providing HR consulting services.   | Since 2002 continuously. Services have been done as part of dedicated studies of HR operations and also as part of comprehensive organization wide studies, only market and service focus is mgmt, staffing and operations analysis of public sector entities, have provided evaluations of hr services. Has occurred both as standalone studies and as part of organization wide studies where all functions of gov't evaluated. Offices in 4 locations, Illinois, Washington, NY, Texas, Massachusetts.   |  |
| Clients currently served with services described.   | Have served over 700 clients since formation. Approx 50 of studies included direct evaluation of hr services either as a dedicated study of the HR function or as part of organization wide study. Many of other studies of local gov't operational functions include evaluation of HR services as dept operations are often impacted by level of HR support provided to them.  |  |
| Client References   | Provided  |  |
| Employees:  |   |  |
| Full-Time   | 15  |  |
| Part-Time   | 5   |  |
| Describe resources and experience capable of bringing to City. Include specialized resources. | Have outlined extensive experience providing services to public sector clients. Experience is invaluable to providing quality services to future clients. Provided as reference specific studies dedicated to evaluating HR departments includes evaluation of compliance with federal, state and local rules and regulations regarding HR service delivery, HR manuals to ensure compliance with state and federal requirements and ensure all critical topical areas were addressed. Shared services studies and Study of national consulting firm performing hr consulting services to analyze support services including HR that were provided internally within the organization.  |  |
| Submit Staff Profiles   | Provided  |  |
| Work Plan   | Task 1: Develop in-depth understanding of HR structure, programs, and processes. To fully evaluated HR dept need to quickly develop understanding of key issues impacting and shaping hr requirements for RH. To develop will conduct interviews with top mgmt and all staff performing hr services as well as key employee representatives of other departments. Interviews will focus on exploring issues related to: strategic direction of dept, administrative processes and workflow, recruitment, hiring, and on-boarding practices, adequacy and use of hr information systems, performance mgmt and metrics, resource allocation and restraints for HR dept, succession planning. Will also review dept policies and procedure manuals, document service delivery goals and objectives, draft detailed descriptions of roles and responsibilities of each HR employee, data, review city benefits, customer service, and employee relations practices. Once completed will prepare summary descriptive profile presenting understanding of current organization, staffing, service provision approaches, operations and costs of HR resources in RH. |  |

|  |   |              |
|--|---|--------------|
| <b>Vendor Name</b>                               | <b>Matrix Consulting Group</b>  |              |
|  | Task 2: Survey internal customers to assess performance levels and opportunities for improvement. Matrix consulting will distribute online survey to City employees for topics including but not limited to current level of service received from HR, timeliness of services, quality of candidate pool for open positions, effectiveness of training provided, timeliness and quality preparation given during onboarding, etc. Task 3: Compare HR programs, practices and policies to best practice management practices to evaluate services in context of recognized best performance and mgmt practices in HR profession. Task 4: Evaluate department structure, programs, and processes to identify efficiency gains, cost savings opportunities. Task 5: Prepare final report and provide comprehensive implementation roadmap. |              |
| Methods of communication with client             | Communication with client cornerstone of consulting philosophy. VP Alan Pennington will serve as Project Mgr, Lead Analyst and point of contact for engagement. Have frequent client review meetings. In addition to formal, staff will do several information communication methods to communicate with City.  |              |
| How are consultants managed within organization. | Believe strongly in science of craft. Utilize formal project management techniques in studies. Project manager handles all aspects of project.  |              |
| Timeline for project.                            | 14 week schedule proposed.  |              |
| Deliverables to be provided.                     | Profile of existing operations including workload and process diagrams, summary of employee survey results, best practices assessment with identified opportunities for improvement, preliminary results of organizational structure and process evaluation, final report and implementation plan.  |              |
| Contract required?                               | Yes.  |              |
| Billing procedures.                              | Monthly.  |              |
| Involved in litigation past 5 years.             | No.   |              |
| Cost Proposal.                                   |   |              |
| Not-to-Exceed Amount                             |   | \$ 43,000.00 |
| Hourly Rates:                                    |   |              |
|  | Project Mgr/Lead Analyst  | \$ 200.00    |
|  | Project Analysts  | \$ 125.00    |
|  |   |              |
|  |   |              |
| Administrative overhead for subconsultants       |   | No           |
|  |   |              |