

PROPOSALS TABULATION					
RFP-RH-16-044					
On Call Executive Search Services for Finance Director					
NAME	The Novak Consulting Group	Experis US, Inc.	GovHR USA, LLC	Rehmann Robson LLC	Waters & Company
ADDRESS	1776 Mentor Ave Cincinnati, OH 45212	1000 Town Center, Suite 1000 Southfield, MI 48075	630 Dundee Road, Suite 130 Northbrook, IL 60062	1500 W. Big Beaver Troy, MI 48084	9229 Ward Parkway, Suite 104 Kansas City, MO 64114
Year Firm Established	2001	1948	2009	1941	2014, began providing Exec Recruitment in 1998
Years in Business	15	68	7	75	18
Type of Organization	Corporation	Corporation	Corporation	LLC	Corporation
Years providing executive search services. Provide details.	For a decade Public management partners helped a variety of organizations function more effectively. Through the	Was founded in 1948 and has grown significantly. Staffing executives on their Great Lakes team have a range of 5 to	GovHR has completed 340 recruitments since 2009. They have conducted searches for every level of	Has provided comprehensive experience recruiting across all industries and positions, including executive and	Began providing executive search service in 1998 with a focus on cities an counties and specifically for senior
Clients that you currently serve with this type of services:	Since 2009 they have worked with nearly 200 local government organizations. Approximately 50 of those have been for executive searches. Over a dozen of those have hired them for more than one search.	City of Cincinnati, City of Detroit, Washtenaw County, Macomb County, City of Dearborn, Great Lakes Water Authority, Washtenaw County, State of Michigan. More Clients listed for Great Lakes Region and National Clients.	Currently involved in 31 active recruitments. Consultants have completed 184 recruitments since 2014.	Has a specific group that services 200+ government agencies, special districts and not-for-profit entities. Provides a wide range of services, including audit, tax, computer information support, investigation work, financial planning, wealth management and outsourcing services, including financial and human resources.	Company manages an average of 40 concurrent recruitments during the calendar year. They have seven full-time consultants and five full-time support staff to manage the work.
References. Minimum of 5.	Mequon, Wisconsin City Administrator Robert Strzelczyk 262-502-1991	Nicolette Carlone-CEO, Public Lighting Authority of Detroit 313-324-8290 Recruitment for Finance and Accounting, business permanent and contract placement.	Ghida Neukirch, City Manager, City of Highland Park, IL 847-926-1000 Director of Finance Recruitment, Fire Chief Recruitment, Director of Community Development	Kelly Van Wormer-Chief Financial Officer 810-966-7808 Compensation benchmark, classification project for a start-up organization and ongoing HR outsourcing and support.	Greg Sundstrom, City Manager, City of Grand Rapids 616-456-3166 Full service Recruitment of Fire Chief
	Loudoun County, Virginia Finance Director, Assistant County Administrator, Several more positions also Tim Hemstreet 703-777-0200 County Administrator	Nicolette Bateson-CFO Great Lakes Water Auth. 313-999-4149 Recruitment for Accounting, Finance, Business & IT/Audit staffing and project solutions.	Juliana Maller, Village Manager, Honover Park, IL 630-823-5608 Recruitment of Director of Finance, Director of HR, Chief Information Officer.	Maribeth Leonard- Executive Director, LifeWays 517-780-3335 Compensation studies, CFO outsourcing/consulting	Mark Woodard, County Administrator, Pinellas County, Florida 727-464-3485 Human Resources Director Recruitment
	Westerville, OH Finance Director and Deputy Planning and Development Director David Collinsworth, City Manager 614-901-6400	Thomas Kalbfleisch-Manager of Internal Audit Wayne County Airport Authority 734-942-3550 Recruitment for Accounting, Finance, Business & IT/Audit staffing and project solutions.	Barry Burton, City Administrator, Lake County, IL 847-377-2250 Recruitment of Deputy Director IT, Director of Public Works, Deputy Finance Director, Asst. County Administrator.	Bilal Tawaab-Superintendent, Flint Comm. Schools 810-760-1249 Outsourced CFO and business office including support to HR director related to union negotiations, staffing, payroll and benefits mgmt.	Rodney Barnes, Human Resources Director, Manatee County, Florida 941-748-4501 ext. 3813 Senior Level Redevelopment Executive Recruitment
	Dublin, OH Public Services Director Michelle Crandall, Asst. City Manager 614-410-4400	Odis Jones-Former CEO Public Lighting Authority of Detroit 614-749-2220 Recruitment for Accounting, Finance, Business & IT/Audit staffing and project solutions.	David Gysberts, Mayor, Hagerstown, MD 301-766-4175 Recruitment of City Administrator	Chris Benedict-Finance Director MOKA 231-830-9376 CEO compensation and benefit benchmarking	Frank Abbate, Assistant County Manager, Brevard County, FL 321-633-2004 Director of Information Technology Recruitment
	Novi, Michigan Assistant City Manager Clay Pearson, City Manager 281-652-1663	Peter Collinson-Finance Manager Washtenaw County Administration 734-222-6850 Recruitment for Accounting, Finance, Business & IT/Audit staffing and project solutions.	John Jarratt, Chief Administrative Officer, Little Rock, AR 501-688-1410 Recruitment of Chief Executive Officer	Jim MacInnes-President, Crystal Mtn. Resort and Spa 231-378-2000 Compensation and benefit benchmarking, succession planning, recruiting.	Tom Phillips, Mayor, Norwalk, Iowa 515-771-8078 City Manager Recruitment
Employees					
	Full Time 9 Part Time 4	30,000 Full Time Salaried Employees	9 1	750 50	12 0
Describe resources and capabilities:	Their approach to executive search services comprises three key phases. 1. Inquiring, Understanding and Defining 2. Candidate Search and Evaluation 3. Supporting Success. They take a tailored, goal-based approach to each recruitment.	Has been providing talent and solutions to private and public sector clients across North America for over four decades. Offers employers a range of services for the entire employment and business cycle, including permanent, temporary and contract recruitment; employee assessment and selection; training; outplacement; outsourcing and consulting. Recent awards include: World's most Ethical Companies, America's Top Corporations for Women's Business Enterprises, Fortune's World's Most Admired Companies. More awards listed on Vendor Response.	They work exclusively in the public sector, offering customized executive recruitment services, as well as providing other management studies and services for communities. GovHR was established in 2009 as Voorhees Associates, LLC. In January, 2014 Voorhees Associates combined with GovTempsUSA to form GovHR USA. This combination enables them to more effectively serve their clients by utilizing their combined resources. The firm has a total of twenty-two consultants, both generalists and specialists (public safety, finance, parks, etc.)	Provides a complete and structured process for Executive Search Support and advises on selection, hiring and transitioning procedures. An outline of the recruiting method is provided below. Rehmann may provide full scope or partial recruiting services, dependent on the preference of the organization and he needs for each position.	Provides the City with the following benefits: Comprehensive and Structured Process, Transparency, Confidentiality, Candidate Recruitment, Focused use of the City's time, minimize staff disruption, thorough evaluation of candidates. Please see vendor response for the full description of each benefit.
Staff Profiles:	Submitted.	Submitted.	Submitted.	Submitted.	Submitted.

PROPOSALS TABULATION					
RFP-RH-16-044					
On Call Executive Search Services for Finance Director					
NAME	The Novak Consulting Group	Experis US, Inc.	GovHR USA, LLC	Rehmann Robson LLC	Waters & Company
ADDRESS	1776 Mentor Ave	1000 Town Center, Suite 1000	630 Dundee Road, Suite 130	1500 W. Big Beaver	9229 Ward Parkway, Suite 104
	Cincinnati, OH 45212	Southfield, MI 48075	Northbrook, IL 60062	Troy, MI 48084	Kansas City, MO 64114
Methodology	<p>Task 1- Develop Candidate profile</p> <p>Task 2- Conduct Aggressive Recruitment</p> <p>Task 3- Support Candidate Selection</p> <p>The selection of the top candidate is for the Mayor, and The Novak Consulting Group can help the City make a well-informed choice by framing what they have learned about the candidates. They can also assist in negotiating the employment offer. Additionally they will contact the successful candidate during the first year on the job to discuss their progress toward implementation of the goals that were established for this position at the beginning of the process.</p>	<p>Phase 1-Planning, Upon Award of Contract.</p> <p>Phase 2-Delivery of On Call Executive Search Services- Duration of Contract</p> <p>Upon initiation of a search, a specific team of recruiters will be engaged on the search who will have the most expertise in that area, depending on the type of role. They will have a kick off meeting to determine the needs of the role and outline the qualities of what an "exact-match candidate" will possess. The next step will be to reach out to a variety of individuals. They will also post the job on several job board sites. Interviews will be done by phone and in person by Experis to properly vet candidates. Only qualified and fully vetted individuals by our Recruiters and Directors will be sent over to you.</p>	<p>Phase 1-Consultants conducts interviews with client. Developments recruitment schedule; job announcement and recruitment brochure.</p> <p>Phase 2-Consultant places job announcement on websites; develops targeted database of potential candidates and conducts candidate outreach.</p> <p>Phase 3-Consultant evaluates candidate credentials; conducts due diligence on candidates; interviews potential finalists candidates and finalizes recommendation to client.</p> <p>Phase 4-Consultant provides recruitment report to client; meets with Client to review recruitment report; selects candidates for interview; finalizes interview process with Client; notifies candidates and coordinates interview schedule.</p> <p>Phase 5-Consultant provides interview books with questions and evaluation sheet; develops interview questions and other interview exercises; facilitates interview process; and facilitates discussion of candidates with client.</p> <p>Phase 6-Consultants assists with contract negotiation for selected candidate; assists with drafting press release; and provides telephone follow-up with candidate and client for six months following appointment.</p>	<p>In general they follow a specific methodology to recruit qualified individuals. The first step is gathering the information related to the position. This may include creation of a job description or modifying an existing one. They talk with the position leadership and identify key responsibilities and ideal candidate attributes. They post, search, screen, document, confer, and communicate with clients and with leadership involved with recruiting the open position.</p>	<p>Task 1-Recruitment brochure development and advertising.</p> <p>Task 2-Execution of Recruitment strategy and identification of quality candidates.</p> <p>Task 3-Screening of applicants and recommendation of semi-finalists.</p> <p>Task 4-Conducting background checks, reference checks and academic verifications.</p> <p>Task 5-Final interview process.</p>
Methods of communication with clients:	Maintains regular contact with their clients throughout each engagement and beyond. In addition to formal project update meetings, they routinely communicate with our clients-in person, via phone or by email-to address questions or issues that arise during the course of the recruitment.	Will work with the City to determine best method of communication that will work best to ensure business objectives are achieved. This will involve the development of a communication plan, conducting kick-off meetings, status meetings and closing meetings with the presentation of deliverables.	Consultants are always available to provide information and answer questions, and details of the process such as placement of advertising and applications received are discussed in regular updates via either telephone or email.	Their methods of communication are customized to the needs of their clients. They are committed to completing work on time and answering questions quickly and accurately. Recent customer satisfaction survey revealed that overall, 98 percent of their clients were satisfied with their responsiveness.	Waters & Company will request that the City appoint a project contact person from City staff who will provide requested information, arrange meetings and serve as the point of contact for progress reporting.
Placement success rate and timeliness of placement. Performance warranty?	They have a 100 percent placement rate. The duration of their performance warranty is 18 months. Should the selected candidate leave the position within 18 months of being hired, they will conduct a new search for no professional fee. The City will be billed only direct expenses.	Experis has a 1% falloff ratio on searches, meaning less than 1% of the time, their candidate was not a fit for the client within the first 90 days of employment and they place hundreds of professional candidates per year in this region. They offer a free replacement of a candidate on a direct hire search within the first 90 days if necessary.	Should employee leave the City at the Request of the City or the employee's own determination within the first 24 months of appointment, GOVHR will, if desired, conduct another search if requested within six months after the employee's departure, for the cost of expenses and announcement only. GovHR has a 99% retention rate since it's inception in 2009.	Proud to uphold a 100 percent placement retention rate within the last 24 months. If a new placement leaves the client organization within 6 months of his/her hire date, Rehmann will replace the role at either a minimal or no additional charge, depending on circumstances of departure.	Triple guarantee is defined as: 1) Commitment to remain with recruitment assignment until City has made appointment for the fees and tasks quoted in this quotation. 2) Executive recruitment is guaranteed for 24 months against termination or resignation for any reason. The replacement recruitment will be repeated with no additional professional fee, but only for project related expenses. 3) Waters & Company will not directly solicit any candidates selected under this contract for any other position while the candidate is employed with organization.
Timeline:	A sample timeline is included as Attachment A. They would refine the schedule with the City during the initial meeting.	Timeline is a guide only. Will be specific to the City if chosen. Weeks depend on low to mid level positions and mid to senior levels: Initial Search kick off- Week 1 or week 1&2 Presentation of Candidates - Week 2 or week 2&3 First Round of interviews- Week 2 or 3 Second Round of interviews-Week 2 or 4 Third Round of interviews-Week 2 and 5 References/Background check/Presentation of offer/Resignation onboarding- Week 2-3 & week 6 State Date - Week 4 or week 8	Weeks 1-2 Deliverable - Recruitment Brochure Weeks 3-8 Deliverable - Placement of professional announcements; candidate identification, screening, interview and evaluation by consultant. Week 9 Deliverable - Consultant recommendation to City of qualified candidates (recruitment report). Week 10 Deliverable - Interview reports including suggested questions and evaluation sheets. Week 11-12 Deliverable - Interviews of selected finalist candidates; City selection of final candidate; negotiation, offer, acceptance and appointment.	Timelines may vary by position. They will complete job descriptions, network, post the position and then review resumes as they are received. Screens, references and interviews follow. Recruiting steps and the length of time they will take is found in the vendor response.	Oct. 10 to Nov. 23 - Profile Development, advertising and candidate outreach. Nov. 23 to Dec. 7- Applicant screening and assessment and recommendation of semifinalists. Dec. 8 to Dec. 23-Comprehensive background check and reference checks completed for finalists. Week of Jan. 2- On-site interviews with finalists. Week of Jan. 9- Employment offer made / accepted

PROPOSALS TABULATION		
RFP-RH-16-044		
On Call Executive Search Services for Finance Director		
NAME	LINKED, LLC	Colin Baenziger & Associates
ADDRESS	6633 18 Mile Rd. Suite 3C	2055 South Atlantic Ave., Suite 504
	Sterling Heights, MI 48314	Daytona Beach Shores, FL 32118
Year Firm Established	2012	1997
Years in Business	4	Sole Proprietorship
Type of Organization	Single Member LLC	
Years providing executive search services. Provide details.	They have staffed both large and small companies. They have staffed for a client that has used their contract-to-hire	For the past 18 years they have conducted searches and other related work for clients in thirty states. Overall staff
Clients that you currently serve with this type of services:	Has a regular client that uses their independent staff payroll service option that allows a company the opportunity to consolidate budgets and lower insurance liability on staff. They have clients that call when they have a staffing need and candidates on and off contracts based on client demands.	Some current clients: City of Mount Pleasant, MI City of Bellevue, WA City of Fayetteville, NC City of Winchester, VA
References. Minimum of 5.	John Cummings- Launch Executive at CPK Interior Products 1-226-821-1751 Client since 2013. Various automotive positions staffed for them.	Nachie Marquez, Asst. City Manager, Chandler, AZ 480-782-2210 Recruitment for Director of Public Works
	Dino Nedelkovski-President, Motor City Freight Systems, Inc. 586-646-2424 Staffed truck drivers and dispatchers	Graham Gillette, Trustee, City of Des Moines, IA 515-238-1225 Recruitment Chief Executive Officer and General Manager, Des Moines Water Works
	Shauna Smith-Subcontractor/Labor Buyer, The Paslin Company 586-758-0200 ext. 1086 Staffed contract to hire positions such as control engineers and field engineers.	Shawn Kessel, City Administrator 701-456-7739 Recruitment of Deputy City Administrator
	Doron Friedman, Co-CEO of SpotOn 312-277-7060 Staffed for IT support for mobile app developers	Rob Mayes, Farmington, NM, City Manager 505-320-9228 Recruitment of Police Chief
	Brian DeLeon, HR Director, Vectorform 1-800-475-6279 Supported their staff for contract and direct hire IT positions.	Mayor Sherman Lea, City of Roanoke, VA, 540-330-6015 Recruitment of City Attorney
Employees		
	Full Time 5	
	Part Time 3	
Describe resources and capabilities:	They track candidates with their in house system called CATS software. They store all employees they've made contact with since 2012 on there. They use multiple websites to post position and search LinkedIn to connect with past and future candidates.	They list their qualifications and experience as Completion of projects within budget, completion of projects on schedule, Diversity.
Staff Profiles:	Listed on vendor response.	Submitted.

PROPOSALS TABULATION							
RFP-RH-16-044							
On Call Executive Search Services for Finance Director							
NAME	LINKED, LLC			Colin Baenziger & Associates			
ADDRESS	6633 18 Mile Rd. Suite 3C			2055 South Atlantic Ave., Suite 504			
	Sterling Heights, MI 48314			Daytona Beach Shores, FL 32118			
Methodology	They believe that all their clients are unique and no one method fits all. The recruiters know based on the position and job requirements the best search options.			Phase 1-Information gathering and needs assessment. Phase 1-Recruitment Phase 3-Screening and Finalist Selection Phase 4-Coordinate the Candidate Assessment Process Phase 5-Negotiation and Continuing Assistance			
Methods of communication with clients:	An initial in person meeting with their clients is what works best for them. This gives the opportunity to get to know their client and their structure. They like to keep their clients updated regularly on the progress they are making.			Not Provided in response. Did not fill out our vendor response forms.			
Placement success rate and timeliness of placement. Performance warranty?	Only two of their candidates did not stay with their clients. All others were hired in as permanent employees. Linked guarantees to replace a new employee if the employee is terminated for any reason, within the first 45 days of the start date of employment. This is a one-time replacement at no charge to the client.			Not Provided in response. Did not fill out our vendor response forms.			
Timeline:	Open position will be created in CATS and posted to various job boards upon client approval. Staff will be assigned positions. Turn around time depends on the technical aspects of the position. In the past they have had candidates that have been interested in positions within 2 days after a job order was placed.			Not Provided in response. Did not fill out our vendor response forms.			

